

Cogita

MULTIDISCIPLINARY RESEARCH JOURNAL

Vol. VIII, no. 3/September, 2016

Bucharest, 2015
ISSN 2068-6706

**Cogito Journal is published under the aegis of
"Dimitrie Cantemir" Christian University**

Address: 176 Splaiul Unirii, Bucharest
Phone: 021.330.79.00, 021.330.79.11,
021.330.79.14
Fax: 021.330.87.74
E-mail: cogito.ucdc@yahoo.com

Cogito Journal is included in IDB
EBSCO, PROQUEST, CEEOL,
INDEX COPERNICUS,
HEINONLINE, CNCS recognized

Cogita

MULTIDISCIPLINARY RESEARCH JOURNAL

Vol. VIII, no. 3/September, 2016



Every author is responsible for the originality of the article and that the text was not published previously.

CONTENTS

PHILOSOPHY

ARISTOTLE – KANT CANON	7
Mihai D. Vasile	
NOTES ON SYNTHESIS	12
Dragoş Popescu	

POLITICAL AND ECONOMIC SCIENCES

NEW TRENDS CONCERNING THE RIGHT OF RESIDENCE OF FAMILIARS OF EU CITIZENS.....	21
Valeria Di Comite	
MANAGEMENT’S PLACE AND ROLE IN POLITICAL PR.....	37
Aurelia Peru-Balan	
MOBILIZING THE RURAL POOR IN NIGERIA THROUGH MICROFINANCE	54
Onyekeni, Alexander Ugbome	
ETHIC AND DECISIONAL TRANSPARENCY IN THE ROMANIAN PUBLIC ADMNISTRATION.....	75
Gabriela Pohoată	

FOREIGN LANGUAGES AND LITERATURES

PARTICULARITIES OF INDO-EUROPEAN LANGUAGES RESULTED FROM THE ANALYSIS OF THE WORD-PROBE ‘FATHER’.....	83
Adrian Lesenciuc	

ROMANIAN PHILOSOPHERS

**CONSTANTIN STERE AND HIS ORIGINAL PERSPECTIVE ON
THE MORDERNIZATION OF ROMANIA..... 92**

Grigore Georgiu

ARISTOTLE – KANT CANON*

Mihai D. Vasile**

mdvasile@yahoo.com

Abstract: *There is much talk about “Plato-Kant canon”, but it is no less legitimate discourse about the “canon of Aristotle-Kant”. This communication aims to support the thesis about “Aristotle-Kant canon” with arguments from Aristotle’s work influences history on European metaphysics.*

Keywords: *soul’s theory in Aristotle, Hegelian hermeneutics on Aristotle, the theory of soul in St. Augustine, hypostatic union, intellectus archetypus in Imm. Kant.*

It is famous that G. W. F. Hegel held that Aristotle has given the perfect definition to metaphysics, because only metaphysics is the only free science among sciences, where it produces “the thinking, which is the thinking of thinking - νόησις νοήσεως νόησις – due to the fact that νοῦς *thinks itself, so that νοῦς and νοητόν are the same thing, and there is only a thought of the thing thought of. Reason which thinks itself, is the absolute end or the Good, for it only exists for its own sake*”¹. Thus G. W. F. Hegel is interpreting – and thus he enters into eternity - Aristotle’s phrase: “ἡ νοήσις νοήσεως νόησις, *intellectio, intellectionis intellectio*”². Only God – Hegel says, commenting on Aristotle’s *Metaphysics* - possesses philosophy as total science, who, among all sciences is the most excellent³. Aristotle thus comes with his thinking to the absolute, thinking God as an individual being, “the most excellent of all; but thinking, in its pure essence, is a thinking of that which is absolutely the most excellent; the thought is for itself absolute end”⁴. G. W. F. Hegel summarizes Aristotle’s characterization of the

* The current issue was the subject of my communication at the **World Congress in Philosophy. Philosophy of Aristotle**, with title: *Aristotle: Thought and Language* – a.n.

** **Scientific researcher, Institute of Philosophy, Bucharest.**

¹ G. W. F. Hegel, *Lectures on the History of Philosophy*, in three volumes, vol. II, translated from the German by E. S. Haldane and Frances H. Simson, M. A., London, Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner&CO., Ltd., 1894, p. 151.

² Aristotle, *Metaphysica*, XI (IA), IX, 1074 b 10–15, în: *Aristotelis Opera omnia*. Graece et Latine. Cum indice nominum et rerum absolutissimo. Volumen I–IV. Parisiis: Editore Ambrosio Firmin Didot, Institutii Franciae Typographo, 1848–1857; volumen secundum, MDCCCL, p. 609: „Αὐτὸν ἄρα νοεῖ, εἴπερ ἐστὶ τὸ κρᾶτιστον, καὶ ἔστιν ἡ νοήσις νοήσεως νοήσις. *Se ipsam ergo intelligit, si est quidem quod optimum est: et est intellectio, intellectionis intellectio*”.

³ G. W. F. Hegel, *Lectures on the History of Philosophy*, in three volumes, vol. II, translated from the German by E. S. Haldane and Frances H. Simson, M. A., London, Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner&CO., Ltd., 1894, p. 136.

⁴ *Ibidem*, p. 147.

divine into a lapidary definition: God is what-is-in-itself-and-for-itself, in the way He is pure activity, *actus purus*⁵.

G. W. F. Hegel interprets the active intellect (νοῦς ποιητικός) and the passive intellect (νοῦς παθητικός), in God, in the sense that Νοῦς, as passive, is nothing but what is in itself, “Thought, as the object of thought, is nothing else than the absolute Idea regarded as in itself, the Father; yet this First and unmoved, as distinguished from activity, is, as absolute, simply activity, and is first through this activity set forth as true”⁶. “This νοῦς is all in itself, but it is Truth only by activity, which moves in itself, which has circular motion, which is to be posited as the true Being... Since the spherical is thus both mover and moved, there is a centre-point which causes movement but remains unmoved, and which is itself at the same time eternal and substance and energy”⁷. Hence, it ensues - in the opinion of G. W. F. Hegel - the perfect definition of God as circle of reason that turns on its own: “This great definition given by Aristotle of absolute Being as the circle of reason which returns into itself, is of the same tenor as modern definitions; the unmoved which causes movement is the Idea which remains self-identical, which, while it moves, remains in relation to itself”⁸.

G. W. F. Hegel is agree that thinking as speculation (ἡ θεωρία) of God “Seems to be of all things the most divine”, but it is to see under what conditions is it so, as thinking into action (τὸ νοεῖν), which concerns with the object-content of thinking (τὸ νοούμενον), which, in God, are identical (τὸ νοεῖν καὶ ἡ νόησις): “Thought is therefore this, to think itself, because it is the most excellent; and it is the thinking, which is the thinking of thinking”⁹.

Aristotelian theory of categories was used by the Church Fathers¹⁰, in the explanatory idea of divine correlation, in order to express relative relations (Πρὸς σι), mutual among the Persons of Trinity, included in the concept of *perichoresis* (περιχώρησις). It is recognized that the Aristotelian definition of the correlation¹¹ was used by St. Athanasius the Great to demonstrate equality at all levels of Trinitarian Persons and at the same time, their own status of Persons different from each other.

St. Augustine - using the distinctions of Aristotle in his treatise, *De anima*¹² - gives significant content to the expressions “animal body - σῶμα τοῦ ζωοῦ, *corpus animale*” and “spiritual body - σῶμα πνευματικός, *corpus spirituale*”, and explains

⁵ *Ibidem*, p. 143.

⁶ *Ibidem*, p. 149.

⁷ *Ibidem*, p. 145.

⁸ *Ibidem*, p. 146.

⁹ G. W. F. Hegel, *Lectures on the History of Philosophy*, in three volumes, vol. II, translated from the German by E. S. Haldane and Frances H. Simson, M. A., London, Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner&CO., Ltd., 1894, pp. 150-151.

¹⁰ Cf. Lucian Dîncă, *Le Christ et la Trinité chez Athanase d' Alexandrie*, Paris, Cerf, 2012, pp. 123-124.

¹¹ Aristotelis *Kategoriae*, V [VII], 6 a, 23-25, in: Aristotelis *Opera omnia*. Graece et Latine. Cum indice nominum et rerum absolutissimo. Volumen I-IV. Parisiis: Editore Ambrosio Firmin Didot, Institutii Franciae Typographo, 1848-1857; volumen primum, MDCCCLVIII, p. 9.

¹² Aristotelis *De anima*, II (B), I-XII, 412-424, in: Aristotelis *Opera omnia*. Graece et Latine. Cum indice nominum et rerum absolutissimo. Volumen I-IV. Parisiis: Editore Ambrosio Firmin Didot, Institutii Franciae Typographo, 1848-1857; volumen tertium, MDCCCLIV, pp. 444-461.

the transition from the first death to the second creation, namely what is meant by the words “to die in Adam” and “to be resurrected by Christ”. Thus, “bodies of those who have a living soul and not yet a living spirit-maker, are called *animal bodies*”, while “bodies of those who receive a living spirit-maker, while retaining the substance of the flesh, but without her wickedness, receiving the gift of God, changes their shape, without changing their nature, becoming thus able to live in heaven”, actually becoming *spiritual bodies*¹³.

The distinction between νοῦς ποιητικός and νοῦς παθητικός in God, developed by Aristotle in his *De anima*, was used by the Church Fathers, to build Christian dogma of the hypostatic union of the two natures - human and divine - in Jesus Christ. Aristotle's wording is as follows: „and this intellect - νοῦς ποιητικός - is separated (χωριστός), unaffected (ἀπατής) and unmixed (ἀμιγής), being by nature act”¹⁴. Aristotelian influence is evident on formulating dogmatic text of the hypostatic union, by the fourth ecumenical council adopted at Chalcedon in 451¹⁵.

Also, the doctrine of unchangeable and inexhaustible nature of the fifth element, *Ether*, who has no involvement in any way with the other four elements, although all five elements participating in the unity of being, as the doctrine of union of νοῦς ποιητικός with the νοῦς παθητικός in God, were the source of inspiration for dogmatic Christian theology of the first four ecumenical councils in the development of the dogma and the doctrine of hypostatic union of two natures - divine and human - in the historical person of Jesus Christ¹⁶.

Aristotle called “intellect”, the factor by which the soul thinks and concepts¹⁷. Sir David Ross develops Aristotle's assertion to the effect that: “Aristotle there assigns to reason - *intellectus*, ... - a *godlike immortality*”¹⁸. Sir David Ross states that: “The phrase νοῦς ποιητικός has often been supposed to mean *divine reason - intellect*, ... exists after its severance from the νοῦς παθητικός at the death of the body (II. 14-15)... that Aristotle thought of this element of the human soul as being *akin* to the divine reason”¹⁹.

¹³ Cf. Ion Popescu, *About death and sending it in humanity*. Book XIII of *De civitate Dei* and *About immortality of the soul* (“De immortalitate animi”). Works of St. Augustine. Translations. Thesis, Bucharest, Printing House „Speranța”, (*Despre moarte și transmiterea ei în omenire*. Cartea a XIII-a din *De civitate Dei* și *Despre nemurirea sufletului* („De immortalitate animi”). Opere ale Sfântului Augustin. Traduceri. Teză, București, Tipografia „Speranța”), 1907, p. 43.

¹⁴ Mihai D. Vasile, *Paradigms of Eternity*, 2nd ed., (*Paradigmele etrnității*, ed. a doua), Pitești, Tiparg, 2013, p. 33.

¹⁵ *Apud* H. Denzinger et Cl. Bannwart, *Enchiridion Symbolorum*, 32 Aufl., hrsg. von A. Schönmetzer, Freiburg im Breisgau, Bâle, 1963, Grece et Latine, p. 65–67.

¹⁶ Cf. E. De Strycker, *La notion aristotélicienne de séparation dans son application aux Idées de Platon*, în: *Autour d' Aristote. Recueil d'Études de philosophie ancienne et médiévale offert à Monseigneur A. Mansion*, Louvain, Publications Universitaires de Louvain 2, Place Cardinal Mercier, 1955, p. 131.

¹⁷ Aristotle, *De Anima*, G, 4, 429 a 23, Edited with Introduction and Commentary by Sir David Ross, Oxford, At the Clarendon Press, 1961.

¹⁸ Sir David Ross, *Introduction*, in Aristotle, *De anima*, Edited with Introduction and Commentary by Sir David Ross, Oxford, At the Clarendon Press, 1961, p. 42.

¹⁹ *Ibidem*, p. 45.

The novelty, which brings to debate this paper, is the structural identity between Aristotelian duality νοῦς ποιητικός and νοῦς παθητικός in God, and Kantian duality *intellectus archetypus* and *intellectus ectypus*, that Immanuel Kant states in *Critique of Pure Reason (Kritik der reinen Vernunft)*, in order to introduce the third idea of pure reason, which contains only a relative supposition of a being, unique and self-sufficient as the cause of all cosmological series, namely the rational concept of God (*intellectus archetypus*). As against *intellectus archetypus* – God – the human intellect is nothing else than a mere copy (*intellectus ectypus*)²⁰.

Kant's interpretation of Aristotelian duality still contains many elements that make it different and distinct from the Aristotelian doctrine about νοῦς ποιητικός and νοῦς παθητικός.

Immanuel Kant distinguishes - thanks to his core dichotomy, namely: *noumen -phaenomen* – the existence in natural theology of the two beings, *ens realissimus* and defective copies (*ectypa*), equipped with two types of intellect, the divine intellect (*intellectus archetypus*) and the human intellect (*intellectus ectypus*), strikingly similar to the active intellect and passive intellect of Aristotelian doctrine about human and divine knowledge, both in terms of its function and purpose²¹.

Moreover, Immanuel Kant developed - after the classic model of Aristotle²², as he himself confesses, with the same intent but with a very different result – a table of categories (*Tafel der Kategorien*), a total of twelve, classifying them²³.

Theoretical acquisitions obtained by Immanuel Kant are due to a special faculty of the human mind, namely the *intellect* (identified with the classic Greek term and ὁ νοῦς), whose ordering work is performed using its own instruments - *categories* and *concepts*²⁴ - over chaos (diversity) of phenomena. Thus the intellect thinks and generates world (ὁ κόσμος) in the form of the well structured

²⁰ Immanuel Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, Translated by J. M. D. Meiklejohn, London&Toronto, J. M. Dent&Sons LTD, New York: E.-P. Dutton&Co. Inc., 1934, *Transcendental Dialectic*, Book I, Chap. III., *The Ideal of Pure Reason*, Sect. I., *Of the Ideal in General*, p. 335.

²¹ *Ibidem*, pp. 338-339.

²² Aristotle, *Organon, Categoriai*, IV [VI]-VI [VIII], in: *Aristotelis Opera omnia*. Graece et Latine. Cum indice nominum et rerum absolutissimo. Volumen I-IV. Parisiis: Editore Ambrosio Firmin Didot, Instituti Franciae Typographo, 1848-1857; volumen primum, MDCCCXLVIII, pp. 6-17; cf. G. W. F. Hegel, *Lectures on the History of Philosophy*, in three volumes, vol II., translated from the German by E. S. Haldane and Frances H. Simson, M. A., London, Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner&CO., Ltd., 1894, p. 215.

²³ Immanuel Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, Translated by J. M. D. Meiklejohn, London&Toronto, J. M. Dent&Sons LTD, New York: E.-P. Dutton&Co. Inc., 1934, *Transcendental Doctrine of Elements, Part Second-Transcendental Logic, First Division, Analytic of Conceptions*, Chap. I, Sect. III. *Of the Pure Conceptions of the Understanding, or Categories*. §. 6, p. 79; Cf. Germ. ed. in: *Kritik der reinen Vernunft*, neu Herausgegeben von Theodor Valentiner mit Sachregister, elfte Auflage, Leipzig, Verlag von Felix Meiner, 1919, I. *Transscendentale Elementarlehre*. Zweiter Theil: *Die transscendentale Logik*. Erste Abtheilung: *Die Transscendentale Analytik*. Erstes Buch: *Die Analytik der Begriffe*. I. Hauptstück. III. Abschnitt. §. 10. *Von den reinen Verstandesbegriffen oder Kategorien*, p. 180.

²⁴ Immanuel Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, Translated by J. M. D. Meiklejohn, London&Toronto, J. M. Dent&Sons LTD, New York: E.-P. Dutton&Co. Inc., 1934, *Transcendental Dialectic*, Book I, Chap. III., *The Ideal of Pure Reason*, Sect. I., *Of the Ideal in General*, p. 334.

universe. Consequently, Immanuel Kant exceeds Aristotle, because in Aristotle, the human δ νοῦς is only thinking about the world, while in Kant, the human δ νοῦς is thinking and thus creates the world (δ κόσμος). The legislator work of the human intellect (*der Verstand* - δ νοῦς) similar to divine intellect (*intellectus archetypus*) is embodied in *principles* (*die Grundsätze* - αἱ ἀρχαί), *categories* (*die Kategorien* - αἱ κατηγορίαι) and *concepts* (*die Begriffe* - οἱ λόγοι).

The intimate link between the Aristotle's view and the Kantian doctrine becomes obvious if we mind that Immanuel Kant substantiated to the named identity through the divine intellect (*intellectus archetypus*), while Aristotle built it up through the idea of *active intellectus* (νοῦς ποιητικός).

The difference in the epistemological value among the judgments means an ontological difference in Being, namely the difference between *noumen* and *phaenomen*. The passage from knowledge to Being is obvious if we reword that the world involves nothing more than the *phaenomen* which is not a thing in itself but in the subjective human intellect particularly because it knows that the experience objects are mere phenomena, and must admit the existence of the thing in itself, *i.e. noumen*²⁵. Thus, the objects cannot be known as things in themselves, but they can be thought *as if they were*. If contrariwise, it could be stated *ad absurdum* that *phaenomena* (appearances) exist without something be in existence. The human intellect (*intellectus ectypus* - νοῦς παθητικός), by the mere fact to refer to the *phaenomena*, does presuppose in the same time and admit the thing in itself („Das Ding an Sich” – *intellectus archetypus*, νοῦς νοητικός). The ontological proof for taking into consideration the object in two distinct ways, namely as *phaenomen* in a case, and as *noumen* in another, belongs to the perfection of metaphysics as universal science that can be told about²⁶.

The Kantian answer, his famous „als-ob”, inaugurates an ontological discourse about the conditions of the thing in itself, that presumes an order in itself and an *archetypal intellect* for whom the nature order and the human intellect are nothing else than *ectypa i.e. mere copies*.

²⁵ There is a problem to discuss if it is about *noumenon* or *noumena*, *i.e. ein Ding an sich* or *zahlreiche Dinge an sich*; cf. Rudolf Eisler, *Kant Lexikon*, New York, Zurich, Hildesheim, Georg Olms Verlag, 1984, *Ding an sich*, pp. 93-97.

²⁶ „He considered nothing done, so long as anything remained to be done”, v. Immanuel Kant, *The Critique of Pure Reason*, *ibid.*, *Preface to the Second Edition*, p. 9.

NOTES ON SYNTHESIS

Dragoş Popescu*

dragos.gp@gmail.com

Abstract: *The article presents an explanatory model for the Hegelian notion of synthesis, based on the triadic categorial model from Wissenschaft der Logik. This model can be compared with the Kantian model, and also with the post Hegelian interpretation of the triad thesis-antithesis-synthesis.*

Keywords: *synthesis, category, categorial system, Science of Logic, transcendental idealism.*

I.

The idea of synthesis comes from philosophy. From here, it has spread into the area of scientific knowledge as well as into the domain of arts, where it is widely used without any problems. To give three random examples, we currently talked about synthesis in chemistry, history and history of literature. All sciences and arts seem to have today a definition for synthesis.

In philosophy, after a period of intensive use (and often uncritical use), the idea of synthesis began to be seen as profoundly unreliable, as an unnatural type of explanation which, instead to respect the facts, constrained the facts to comply it. We can easily find many examples proving the abuse of synthesis, especially in the philosophical writings of the last century, which pertain to the Hegelian legacy. As Hegel decisively contributed to the reputation of the synthesis. We can ask ourselves: *how Hegelian* are those writings?, because there is a serious suspicion that they have little in common with genuine Hegelian thinking. But the answer to this question belongs to the history of philosophy, which has excessively used in the recent past. Our purpose is to 'stay' into the area of philosophy itself, not into the history of philosophy.

We start by proposing a model of synthesis, considered as a notion, i.e. pertaining to the science of logic. The starting point is natural, because the philosophical reputation of synthesis starts from this philosophical discipline.

Let A and B be two notions.

The notes (intensional components) of A are symbolized by the row: a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n .

Also, notes of B are: b_1, b_2, \dots, b_n .

Let suppose that the sum of the notes of the notion A and the notion B is equal to the notes of the notion C. In this case, the notion C is named the synthesis of A and B.

* Scientific Researcher, PhD., Institute of Philosophy and Psychology „Constantin Rădulescu-Motru” of the Romanian Academy.

However, traditionally, the synthesis was not seen as a simple sum: $C = A + B$. The properties of the synthetic product (C) are not achieved by adding the properties of its components (in this case, the notes of the notions A and B). Kant gives a good example, in his *Critique of Pure Reason*: in the case of the Multiplicity (M) and Unity (U), the synthesis is the Totality (T), and M is seen as U, not as M *plus* another unity. Instead of T seen as an addition of M and U, i.e.:

$$T = M + U,$$

we have to do with the most simple addition, the addition of one:

$$T = M + 1.$$

In fact, the Totality was the Unity featured by multiples, the unification of the Multiplicity (the multiples reduced to the elements of a whole). More exactly, we can note this synthesis:

$$T(U) = M,$$

although, in this case we see Totality as Unity in the Multiplicity (unity of the multiples, not their unification), we can rather note as:

$$T(M) = U.$$

By reanalyzing our model for A and B synthesis, in the context of the possibility of a different interpretation of the synthetic rapport in the case of Totality as a Kantian category, we can introduce a restriction. It has the purpose to avoid this divergent interpretation. *In synthesis, in contrast to the sum, the rows of notes of A and B are each in a predetermined order. The synthesis itself (C) also represents a new order of rows, as a resultant of the reunion of separates orders.* In the case of a random reunion of the two rows, the C row notes would be in a new row of the rows of A and B:

$$C = a_1, a_2, \dots a_n, b_1, b_2, \dots b_n, \tag{1}$$

or:

$$C = b_1, b_2, \dots b_n, a_1, a_2, \dots a_n, \tag{2}$$

or, would be mixing the components of A and B:

$$C = a_1, b_1, b_2, b_3, a_2, b_n, \dots a_n, \tag{3}$$

or any other random combination.

But, considering the restriction we have introduced, the first observation is: in order to speak of a synthesis, the classic-traditional theory of the notion requires some additions.

The second observation is about the process of the synthesis itself, which is an irreversible process. Let analyze the two remarks:

Note 1. The classic-traditional theory of the notion does not have the explicit requirement for the notes of a notion to compose a complete and an organized list. Such list is presumed to exist, but only in theory. In practice, in its classic-traditional sense, the notion is obtained by defining it, and the classical rule is to identify *genus proximum et differentia specifica*. We do not have any notion holding *all* its notes and it is doubtful that *we could have* such a notion.

On the other hand, the Totality, the Unity and the Multiplicity, in Kant's list, are not *common notions*, but *categories*. In such a situation, they do not have *genus proximum*; however, the Totality is larger than the Unity and the Multiplicity, considered separately. And more, «larger» is taken here not only in a quantitative sense, but as a new sense, which simultaneously includes both the senses of the Unity and the Multiplicity. It is an understanding that does not match the Unity and the Multiplicity as separated entities.

Note 2. As established, the synthetic notion is an authentic notion, with all its properties. It is indestructible, so it cannot be dissolved into the components that build it. Separately, the notions who build the synthetic notion remain genuine notions. The Multiplicity and the Unity are not suppressed by Totality. So, the synthesis is a process of increasing the number of notions, not one decreasing one.

Maintaining the restriction, the synthesis between A and B has a precise configuration, from which we can obtain the rule of joining A and B. E.g.:

$$C = a_1, b_1; a_2, b_2; \dots a_n, b_n, \tag{4}$$

or:

$$C = a_1, b_2; a_2, b_1; \dots a_n, b_{n-1}, \tag{5}$$

or:

$$C = a_1, a_2, b_1, b_2; \dots a_{n-1}, a_n, b_{n-1}, b_n \tag{6}$$

and so on.

Each of the above configurations is an individual synthesis. The synthesis results from the rule of uniting in C, the notion's notes of A and B. There are many possible combinations of notes, but few of them satisfy the logical condition to be recognized as notions. Formally speaking, or *de jure*, each combination can be considered a synthesis, because we can indicate its rule of constitution. Formally again, the growing number of notions (see **Note 2**) may transform into an uncontrolled proliferation, even more when the event of synthesis is, *de facto*, a rare event.

The possibility of an arbitrary construction of notes lists with help of a rule of constitution of A and B in C gives an explanation to many of the «synthesis» in the history of philosophy. Many of them did not survive a serious analysis. If the

notes list of a concept is incomplete, the enunciation of a rule establishing a possible synthesis will be more likely to be exposed to refutation. In any case, the proposed model gives us the opportunity to make the following observation:

Note 3. In the case of a notion being in the process of synthesis, it is necessary to precisely state all the notes that compose it. Otherwise, the rule establishing a synthetic product is not complete and, in fact, the synthesis is not carried out.

The recombination of A and B's notes in C leads us to note something else:

Note 4: The new structure which lists the components of A and B gives them new functions, different from the old ones. Thus, the function of a_n in A is different from its function in C, and the function of b_n in B is different from the function of b_n in C.

In fact, if in A and B's case, a_n , respectively b_n fulfilled the role of members of the rows a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n , respectively b_1, b_2, \dots, b_n , the situation in C is quite different.

In the case (4), the element $[a_n, b_n]$ represents a new unity in the row; in case (5) the element representing unity is $[a_n, b_{n-1}]$, and in case (6) we have as an element $[a_{n-1}, a_n, b_{n-1}, b_n]$, more complex than in previous cases. The synthesis produces a redefinition of the elementary components of the notions entering into synthesis. From C's perspective, the notes of A and of B are not elements any more. But, from a pure numerical perspective, the sum of notes of A and B is equal to the sum of notes (not elements) of C.

II.

As above mentioned, Kant's categories of Quality did not have anything in common with common notions. In the classical perspective, categories are not simple notions, but predicates. Predicates are determinations of notions. Indeed, they have no note. Only after the predication process, the notions obtain their notes. From our model's perspective, Multiplicity and Unity are not categories in full sense, but the Totality (when it is a predicate about Unity and, respectively, about Multiplicity). The observation is valid for the rest of categories (Quality, Relation, and Modality). A category is, primarily, a synthetic product, if used to determinate a common notion with it.

Kant avoids difficulties occasioned by this finding, postulating a pure *a priori* synthesis. This type of synthesis carries out the preliminary operation of constitution of categories, and it is placed on the imagination domain, with the purpose to avoid a possible *idem per idem* definition, too. As a consequence, the prime synthesis is an imagination product, not a thinking product. The categories are here tools of our faculty of knowledge. The synthesis may occur in the case of entities of different origin: intelligible or sensible. With the exception of the categories themselves (seen as pure concepts), all concepts are artefacts of thought and sensibility (even the fundamental notions of mathematics and

physics, since space and time are the ideal forms of sensibility). But ideas are not concepts in the true sense, precisely because they do not have any sensitive component.

For Kant, the transcendental domain (fundamentals for mathematics and physics) becomes vital in knowledge, taking the place of traditional transcendence, for which the synthesis relies solely on the thinking, without any reference to sensitivity. The ideas have, according to the Kantian doctrine, only a regulative function, which means that the syntheses carried out at this level are only indicative for knowledge without being, in a properly sense, knowledge.

Our model of synthesis is not concordant with the Kantian one. We only took into account the notions from the logic's perspective, and we have not considered the imagination or the sensibility. In this context, the main reproach that might be done from Kantian transcendental idealism's perspective, is that there is no indication of a synthesis operator. What organize the rows' reconfiguration above mentioned or, in other words, how does the rule of reconfiguration appear? If we answer 'thinking does the operations', then all synthetic product is strictly ideal and we do not deal here with knowledge, but only with a combinatorial method, which tells us nothing about reality.

The objection is correct in Kantian terms. But let us examine the problem from a different perspective. Let's accept that the synthetic product is strictly ideal. In this case, the sequence of syntheses gradually builds up a system. If the used notions are considered to be categories, then the result is a categorial system, more specifically one without an extra-ideal correspondent. Nothing prohibits the hypothesis that there may be a correlation between it and the real. Yet we do not discuss this hypothesis, but we will reconstruct this categorial system. Later on, we shall return to this problem. Of course, our conventional notation (A, B, C, a_n , b_n and so on) matches the categories and categorial determinations, whose traditional metaphysical equivalents will not be reproduced here.

III.

The categorial system that we will re-build here it is, of course, the Hegelian one, taken from the well-known *Wissenschaft der Logik*. It represents an alternative to the Kantian transcendental idealism. It is a triadic system, therefore operates with three fundamental categories. But, also, Hegel uses two lists of three categories each: the list of Being and the list of Essence. The relations between the two lists generate the notions of the Objective Logic, as follows:

THE BEING (A)	THE ESSENCE (B)
The Quality (A_1)	The Essence as reflection in itself (B_1)
The Quantity (A_2)	The Phaenomenon (B_2)
The Measure (A_3)	The Reality (B_3)

The syntheses develop between the above-mentioned categorial lists. As we are not interested, in this point, of the general-philosophical understanding of the system, but only of their building procedure, we will designate the categories of the Being's list with A_1, A_2, A_3 and those of the Essence's with B_1, B_2, B_3 . The three determinations of the six categories are:

for A_1 : a_1, a_2, a_3 ;
 for A_2 : a_{11}, a_{12}, a_{13} ;
 for A_3 : a_{21}, a_{22}, a_{23} ;

and for B_1 : b_1, b_2, b_3 ;
 for B_2 : b_{11}, b_{12}, b_{13} ;
 for B_3 : b_{21}, b_{22}, b_{23} ,

and the combinations for $A_1 - B_1$: $[a_1 b_1]; [a_2, b_2]; [a_3, b_3]$;
 for $A_2 - B_2$: $[a_{11} b_{11}]; [a_{12}, b_{12}]; [a_{13}, b_{13}]$;
 for $A_3 - B_3$: $[a_{21} b_{21}]; [a_{22}, b_{22}]; [a_{23}, b_{23}]$.

The third list results (syntheses) from the association of elements from the previous two lists. For Hegel, the Essence is the Truth of the Being – this is the formula of the association of elements from the first and second lists.

According to this formula, the determinations of Being's categories are *put* as (i.e. considered as *being*), and those of Essence *determinate* them (i.e. considered as *true*).

In fact, the above association of categories is partially a succession of syntheses. It is merely an enumeration of combination of determinations, without a clear specification of the relations between the elements. Nevertheless, the relations between the elements become clear only while indicating which category determines others and which one is determined by others. The progressive determination is followed by Hegel in the Subjective Logic, and its phases are named the Concept, the Judgement, and the Syllogism.

The Concept

The results of the development of the Concept are, in order, the Particularity, the Individuality and the Universality, depending on the determination of some elements (of the Being) by the others (of the Essence). We note the determinant category (together with its elements) with bold letters:

$A_1 - \mathbf{B}_1: [a_1, \mathbf{b}_1]; [a_2, \mathbf{b}_2]; [a_3, \mathbf{b}_3]$ = the constitution process of the *Particularity*;

$A_2 - \mathbf{B}_2: [a_{11} \mathbf{b}_{11}]; [a_{12}, \mathbf{b}_{12}]; [a_{13}, \mathbf{b}_{13}]$ = the constitution process of the *Individuality*;

$A_3 - \mathbf{B}_3: [a_{21} \mathbf{b}_{21}]; [a_{22}, \mathbf{b}_{22}]; [a_{23}, \mathbf{b}_{23}]$ = the constitution process of the *Universality*.

The Judgement

There are nine types of judgement. Every one of them represents a supplemental determination of the elements. The predicates of the judgements

are the determinants from the previous process, of the Concept. We note the progression in determination with bold letters:

$A_1 - \mathbf{B}_1: [\mathbf{a}_1, \mathbf{b}_1]; [a_2, \mathbf{b}_2]; [a_3, \mathbf{b}_3]$	=	the positive judgement;
$A_1 - \mathbf{B}_1: [\mathbf{a}_1, \mathbf{b}_1]; [\mathbf{a}_2, \mathbf{b}_2]; [a_3, \mathbf{b}_3]$	=	the negative judgement;
$A_1 - \mathbf{B}_1: [\mathbf{a}_1, \mathbf{b}_1]; [\mathbf{a}_2, \mathbf{b}_2]; [\mathbf{a}_3, \mathbf{b}_3]$	=	the infinite judgement;
$A_2 - \mathbf{B}_2: [\mathbf{a}_{11}, \mathbf{b}_{11}]; [a_{12}, \mathbf{b}_{12}]; [a_{13}, \mathbf{b}_{13}]$	=	the singular judgement;
$A_2 - \mathbf{B}_2: [\mathbf{a}_{11}, \mathbf{b}_{11}]; [\mathbf{a}_{12}, \mathbf{b}_{12}]; [a_{13}, \mathbf{b}_{13}]$	=	the particular judgement;
$A_2 - \mathbf{B}_2: [\mathbf{a}_{11}, \mathbf{b}_{11}]; [\mathbf{a}_{12}, \mathbf{b}_{12}]; [\mathbf{a}_{13}, \mathbf{b}_{13}]$	=	the universal judgement;
$A_3 - \mathbf{B}_3: [\mathbf{a}_{21}, \mathbf{b}_{21}]; [a_{22}, \mathbf{b}_{22}]; [a_{23}, \mathbf{b}_{23}]$	=	the categorical judgement;
$A_3 - \mathbf{B}_3: [\mathbf{a}_{21}, \mathbf{b}_{21}]; [\mathbf{a}_{22}, \mathbf{b}_{22}]; [a_{23}, \mathbf{b}_{23}]$	=	the hypothetical judgement;
$A_3 - \mathbf{B}_3: [\mathbf{a}_{21}, \mathbf{b}_{21}]; [a_{22}, \mathbf{b}_{22}]; [\mathbf{a}_{23}, \mathbf{b}_{23}]$	=	the disjunctive judgement.

At the end of the process of judgement, all the constitutive elements of the categories are progressively determined. The infinite judgements ($A_1 - \mathbf{B}_1$), singular ($A_2 - \mathbf{B}_2$) and disjunctive ($A_3 - \mathbf{B}_3$) have both components completely determined, in the sense that they received, as predicates, all the determinations already determined within the Concept.

These three judgements put an end, every one of them, to the process of determination of the categorial elements in the Hegelian system. However, the general process does not end, but continues the syllogism.

The Syllogism

A new event appears with the syllogism of the Subjective Logic. $[A_1 - \mathbf{B}_1]$, $[A_2 - \mathbf{B}_2]$, $[A_3 - \mathbf{B}_3]$ reproduce, at their turn, the process of the Concept. Only at this moment, the categories have a full systematic function. Their reciprocal determination expresses the integral constitution of a world, that Hegel names the Objectivity. There are categorial perspectives on Objectivity (equivalent, according to Hegel, to the three syllogistic figures): the Mechanism, the Chemism, and the Teleology. We use different types of bold letters for the determinant elements of the process (used by Hegel as *medius terminus*), because all the elements of the process have been determined. We are at this moment in a different setting, in which the categories of the Subjective Logic are completely determined, and they function as new elements of a new process of synthesis:

The Mechanism: $[A_1 - \mathbf{B}_1], [A_2 - \mathbf{B}_2], [A_3 - \mathbf{B}_3]$

The Chemism: $[A_1 - \mathbf{B}_1], [A_2 - \mathbf{B}_2], [A_3 - \mathbf{B}_3]$

The Teleology: $[A_1 - \mathbf{B}_1], [A_2 - \mathbf{B}_2], [A_3 - \mathbf{B}_3]$.

The complete development above exposed shows that $[A_1 - \mathbf{B}_1]$, $[A_2 - \mathbf{B}_2]$ and $[A_3 - \mathbf{B}_3]$ are distinct categorial structures, and that, seen as wholes, may play the role of determinants and determined, because they are not identical

structures (the only situation in which to determine and to be determined are equivalent, and the process of synthesis becomes redundant, a simple repetition of the identical).

IV.

The Hegelian system is traditionally interpreted as the product of the succession: thesis-antithesis-synthesis. This model is, of course, a simplification of the above exposed process. Moreover, besides simplification, it contains an error: the categories which enter in the synthesis process belong to different lists of categories (Being and Essence), and not to the same list, as previously considered (The Quality, The Quantity, The Measure and the Essence as reflection in itself, The Phaenomenon, The Reality).

We do not discuss here the error of interpretation, but we ask the question: how can we identify thesis and antithesis in our model?

At the categorial level, we cannot talk about thesis and antithesis between the categories, be it on the same list or on two lists. The Quality and the Quantity, the Essence as reflection in itself and the Phenomenon are not sentences, and they cannot contradict one to another. On the other hand, even if we see contradiction in a larger sense, we still observe that the structure of the Quality is different from the structure of the Quantity (although they both have three elements) as a result of the different list of determinations. Formally, the Quantity and the Quality are not in contradiction. But, the Quality and the Essence as reflection in itself have different lists of components and, moreover, the Essence as reflection in itself is asserted as the Truth of the Quality. Or, the contradiction is exactly an opposition relation in which, if a member is asserted to be true, than the other has to be false.

We note the contradiction as follows:

$A_1 \text{ est } A_1 - B_1$, and respectively, $B_1 \text{ est } A_1 - B_1$,
 $A_2 \text{ est } A_2 - B_2$, and respectively, $B_2 \text{ est } A_2 - B_2$,
 $A_3 \text{ est } A_3 - B_3$, and respectively, $B_3 \text{ est } A_3 - B_3$,

and:

$A_1 - B_1 \text{ est } A_1 - B_1$ and respectively, $A_1 - B_1 \text{ est } A_1 - B_1$,
 $A_2 - B_2 \text{ est } A_2 - B_2$ and respectively, $A_2 - B_2 \text{ est } A_2 - B_2$,
 etc.

Note 5. In our model, the contradiction is expressed as sentences about categorial structures, and not as categorial structures. To obtain contradiction, it is necessary to stop the process and to assert one moment of it. The assertion of the moment is contradicted in an instant, by the next moment if we assert it too. So, contradiction appears between different sentences about the status of the system in its different moments. The contradiction is not given by the structure of the system, yet by its interpretation.

It would be interesting to apply this observation to the Kantian antinomies, but, unfortunately, there is little space here to develop this application.

V.

As shown, our system has no extra-ideal correspondence. Between the processes above described and something exterior to the system there are no presupposed relations. Nevertheless, we can ask ourselves: what does the system of categories (Concept-Judgement-Syllogism) stand for/represent?

In the first case, the B components determine the A components. The last ones are, according to their status, the subject.

In the second case, the determined components of the subject stay, successively, as determinants for the subject itself, and in the third case the subject determines the subject integrally.

If we admit that the model expresses the process of thinking, then every case represents one of the possible modalities of the relation of thinking to itself:

1. as being determined by something exterior to itself (the Object), i.e. purely receptive;
2. as being self-determined as an Object, and finally:
3. as determining the Object.

It is not necessary to postulate a pure *a priori* synthesis to do the other synthesis. On the other hand, it is still necessary to have a complete list of categories and categorial determinations.

REFERENCES

Hegel, G.W.F., (1999), *Hauptwerke in sechs Bänden*, Band 3, *Wissenschaft der Logik*, Erster Band, *Die objektive Logik*, Erstes Buch, *Die Lehre vom Sein (1832)*, Zweites Buch, *Die Lehre vom Wesen (1813)*, Felix Meiner Verlag, Hamburg.

Kant, Imm., (1998), *Kritik der reinen Vernunft*, Felix Meiner Verlag, Hamburg.

Popescu, D., (2014), *The Speculative Hegelian Logic*, The Romanian Academy Publishing House, Bucharest.

Popescu, D., (2014), *Intercategorical Relations in The Logical Science of Hegel*, in: *Problems of logic*, coordinator acad. Al. Surdu, D. Popescu, Șt.-D. Georgescu, vol. XVII, The Romanian Academy Publishing House, Bucharest.

Popescu, D., (2015), *The Subject in the Classical and Speculative Logic in Problems of Logic*, coordinators acad. Al. Surdu, D. Popescu, Șt.-D. Georgescu, vol. XVIII, The Romanian Academy Publishing House, Bucharest.

NEW TRENDS CONCERNING THE RIGHT OF RESIDENCE OF FAMILIARS OF EU CITIZENS

Valeria Di Comitè*

valeria.dicomite@uniba.it

Abstract: *The right of family members of EU citizens to live with them in the host Member State has always been considered essential for an effective freedom of movement of citizens. This paper examines this right guaranteed by the secondary law, taking into account case law interpreting the relevant provisions of Directive 2004/38 and Regulation 2011/492. In this paper we focus on the specific additional protections afforded both by EU legislation and by the Court of Justice to family members—especially children—in order, in certain circumstances, to make their rights "autonomous" from those of the mobile EU citizen so they may continue to reside in the host Member State.*

Keywords: *EU Law – Article 21 TFEU - EU citizenship – Freedom of movement of EU citizens – Familiars of EU citizen - Family Unity - Right of residence in EU Member States.*

Introduction

Pursuant to Article 21 of the TFEU (Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union), every citizen has the right to move about in and reside in any EU Member State¹. However, nothing in the founding Treaties provides for the right of family members of EU citizens to live together with the latter; nonetheless, this right has always been considered a corollary of the freedom of movement of nationals of the Member States². In fact, Council Regulation

* Associate Professor of EU Law (professore associato di Diritto dell'Unione Europea), Department of Political Science, Università degli Studi di Bari Aldo Moro. The author thanks prof. Karinne Knutsen for the linguistic review.

¹ On EU citizenship see: M. C. Baruffi, I. Quadranti, (a cura di), *Libera circolazione e diritti dei cittadini europei*, Napoli, Edizioni scientifiche italiane, 2012; M. Condnanzi, A. Lang, B. Nascimbene, *Cittadinanza dell'Unione e libera circolazione delle persone*, Milano, Giuffrè, II ed, 2006; P. Gargiulo (con la collaborazione di L. Montanari), *Le forme della cittadinanza. Tra cittadinanza europea e cittadinanza nazionale*, Edizioni Ediesse, Roma, 2012; D. J. LIÑÁN NOGUERAS, *Ciudadanía de la Unión Europea*, in G. C. RODRÍGUEZ IGLESIAS, D. J. LIÑÁN NOGUERAS (directores), *El Derecho comunitario y su aplicación judicial*, Madrid, 1993, pp. 271-295; C. Morviducci, *I diritti dei cittadini europei*, II ed., Giappichelli, Torino, 2014; B. Nascimbene, F. Rossi dal Pozzo, *Diritti di cittadinanza e libera circolazione nell'Unione europea*, Padova, Cedam, 2012; A. TIZZANO, *Alle origini della cittadinanza europea*, in L. PANELLA, E. SPATAFORA (a curadi), *Studi in onore di Claudio Zanghì*, Giappichelli, Torino, pp. 857 ss., 2011; E. Triggiani, *La cittadinanza europea per la "utopia" sovranazionale*, in *Studi sull'integrazione europea*, pp. 435 ss., 2006; E. Triggiani (a cura di), *Le nuove frontiere della cittadinanza europea*, Bari, Cacucci, 2011; U. VILLANI, *La cittadinanza dell'Unione europea*, in *Studi in ricordo di Antonio Filippo Panzera*, vol. II, Bari, Cacucci, pp. 1001 ss, 1995.

² See: A. Adinolfi, *La libertà di circolazione delle persone e la politica dell'immigrazione*, in G. STROZZI (a cura di), *Diritto dell'Unione europea. Parte speciale*, Torino, Giappichelli, IV ed., p. 64

1612/1968³ already foresaw the right of migrant workers to be accompanied or joined by their family members. The same right was also recognized for family members of self-employed persons in 1974⁴.

The relevance given by the secondary law to the right of residence of family members is based on more reasons: the right to be accompanied or joined by one's family is actually essential for the free movement of EU citizens that would otherwise be jeopardized⁵. The right to family unity is also an expression of the fundamental right to family life recognized today in Article 7 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU, as well as in Article 8 of the ECHR (European Convention on Human Rights)⁶.

Currently, the citizens' right to be accompanied or joined by their family members is established by Directive 2004/38⁷. This right applies regardless of the nationality of the family member, thus it also applies to nationals of third countries⁸. It is therefore clear that the right of family members with third-country citizenship to reside in the host Member State is not an autonomous

ss., 2015; G. Caggiano (a cura di), *I percorsi giuridici per l'integrazione. Migranti e titolari di protezione internazionale tra diritto dell'Unione e ordinamento italiano*, Torino, Giappichelli, 2014; M. di Filippo, *La circolazione dello straniero nel diritto dell'Unione europea: una geometria variabile dei diritti e delle garanzie*, in A. M. Calamia, M. di Filippo, M. Gestri (a cura di), *Immigrazione, diritto e diritti: profili internazionalistici ed europei*, Padova, Cedam, 2012; S. Marinai, *L'unità familiare e il ricongiungimento*, *ivi*, pp. 493 ss. 2012; C. Morviducci, *op. cit.*, p. 134; R. Palladino, *Il ricongiungimento familiare nell'ordinamento europeo, tra integrazione del mercato e tutela dei diritti fondamentali*, Bari, Cacucci, p. 45 ss., 2012; A. Sciacovelli, *La disciplina dell'ingresso e del soggiorno dei cittadini dell'Unione europea e dei loro familiari*, in G. Carella and Others, *L'immigrazione e la mobilità delle persone nel diritto dell'Unione europea*, Milano, Monduzzi, p. 1 ss, 2012.

³ Council Regulation (EEC) No 1612/68 of 15 October 1968 on freedom of movement for workers within the Community (OJ L 257, 19.10.1968, p. 2), repealed by the Regulation (EU) No 492/2011 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 April 2011 on freedom of movement for workers within the Union (OJ L141, 27.05.2011, p. 1). See also Directive 2014/54/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council, of 16 April 2014 on measures facilitating the exercise of rights conferred on workers (OJ L 128, 30.4.2014, p. 8).

⁴ Council Directive 73/148/EEC of 21 May 1973 on the abolition of restrictions on movement and residence within the Community for nationals of Member States with regard to establishment and the provision of services (OJ L 172, 28.6.1973, p. 14).

⁵ The Court of Justice underlines: "Even before the adoption of Directive 2004/38, the Community legislature recognised the importance of ensuring the protection of the family life of nationals of the Member States in order to eliminate obstacles to the exercise of the fundamental freedoms guaranteed by the EC Treaty", Judgment *Metock*, 25 July 2008, C-127/08, EU: C: 2008: 449, para. 56.

⁶ F. Rossi dal Pozzo, *Citizenship Rights and Freedom of Movement in the European Union*, Alphen Aan den Rijn, The Netherlands, Wolter Kluwer, p. 123, 2013.

⁷ Directive 2004/38/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council, of 29 April 2004, on the right of citizens of the Union and their family members to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States, amending Regulation (EEC) No 1612/68 and repealing Directives 64/221/EEC, 68/360/EEC, 72/194/EEC, 73/148/EEC, 75/34/EEC, 75/35/EEC, 90/364/EEC, 90/365/EEC and 93/96/EEC (OJ L 158, 30.4.2004, p. 77).

⁸ Recital 5, Directive 2004/38: "The right of all Union citizens to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States should, if it is to be exercised under objective conditions of freedom and dignity, be also granted to their family members, irrespective of nationality".

right, since it concerns the “rights derived from the exercise of freedom of movement by a Union citizen”⁹.

Article 3(1) of Directive 2004/38 (entitled ‘Beneficiaries’), provides: “This Directive shall apply to all Union citizens who move to or reside in a Member State other than that of which they are a national, and to their family members as defined in point 2 of Article 2 who accompany or join them”. Consequently, only European citizens exercising their right to free movement (so-called “mobile EU citizens”) can enjoy the rights set out in the Directive, which includes the right to be followed by their family¹⁰.

This Directive does not, however, apply to “resident citizens”, for which the rules on family reunification are established by national law. Consequently, reverse discrimination is possible if the national legislation is less favourable than the EU legislation¹¹. The Court of Justice has, nevertheless, recognized exceptional situations in which the EU citizen is dependent on the foreign family member, as established in the case of *Ruiz Zambrano* and in subsequent case law¹².

The right of family members to reside in the host State was thus born as a right “derived” from the principal right of EU citizens to move into a Member State other than that of which they are a national, even if, as we shall see, it is destined to become, under certain conditions, an “autonomous right” of residence.

In this work, with the aim of clarifying the rights of family members, we will first examine the provisions of Directive 2004/38 concerning the right of residence of EU citizens. Next, we will examine the right of family members to accompany and to join the mobile citizen, attempting to determine if, and to what extent, the “right of residence” of family members can be retained exclusively on a “personal basis” in light of the Directive and the recent case law.

1. The right of EU citizens to reside in the host Member State under Directive 2004/38

In the 1990s with the Treaty of Maastricht, which created the citizenship of the European Union, the right to free movement was recognised as a basic right for all EU citizens in the Primary Law whether they are economically active or not. Directive 2004/38 established the conditions for exercising that right. In particular, the right to free circulation and residence for EU citizens is not subject

⁹ Judgments *O. & B.*, 12 March 2014, C-456/12, EU:C:2014:135, para. 36; *McCarthy e a.*, 18 December 2014, C-202/13, EU:C:2014:2450, para. 34.

¹⁰ Di Filippo underscores that it concerns a right to follow (*diritto di seguito*) rather than family reunification because a citizen can immediately relocate with the family unit or later be joined by the family unit. The situation is different for citizens of third States who enjoy only the right to “family reunification”. M. di Filippo, *op. cit.*, p. 12.

¹¹ Judgment *McCarthy*, 5 May 2011, C-434/09, EU:C:2011:277.

¹² Judgment *Ruiz Zambrano*, 8 March 2011, C-34/09, EU:C:2011:124. On this issue, see P. MENGOZZI, 2011, *La sentenza Zambrano: prodromi e conseguenze di una pronuncia inattesa*, in *Studi sull'integrazione europea*, p. 417 ss., www.studisullintegrazioneeuropea.eu. See also V. di Comite V., *L'uguaglianza tra cittadini europei? Una nuova sfida per un problema annoso*, in TRIGGIANI E. (a cura di), *Le nuove frontiere della cittadinanza europea*, Bari, 2011, pp. 85, 2011; V. di Comite, *Il desiderio di “vivere insieme” e il mancato diritto al ricongiungimento familiare per i cittadini europei “statici” alla luce del caso Dereci*, in *Studi sull'integrazione europea*, p. 463 ss., 2012.

to any conditions or any formalities, other than the requirement to hold a valid identity card or passport when the residence in the host Member State is less than three months (Article 6). To exercise the right of residency for a period greater than three months, a series of conditions was established as indicated in Article 7.

The extension of the right of residence to all European citizens, including economically inactive citizens and students, has as a counterweight the need to prevent the right of residence of the EU citizen from becoming a burden on the social assistance system of the host Member State¹³. For this reason, Article 7 of Directive 2004/38 establishes the conditions placed on the right of residence. In particular, it is required that economically inactive citizens have "sufficient resources for themselves and their family members", as well as "comprehensive sickness insurance coverage in the host Member State".

Conditions are less stringent under the burden of proof, with regard to Union citizens who are "enrolled at a private or public establishment, accredited or financed by the host Member State [...], for the principal purpose of following a course of study, including vocational training"; in this case, pursuant to Article 7(1)(c) it is sufficient that the citizens, in addition to having sickness insurance, "assure the relevant national authority, by means of a declaration or by such equivalent means as they may choose, that they have sufficient resources for themselves and their family members".

The above conditions do not apply to economically active EU citizens, according to Article 7(1)(a). For workers Regulation 492/2011¹⁴ applies, which establishes the principle of equal treatment with nationals, even with regard to social benefits, from the beginning of their stay. This difference from other mobile citizens is justified because they contribute to the social security system of the host State¹⁵. A very favourable provision which concerns even citizens in search of work in a host Member State is that they may remain more than three months if they are making serious attempts at finding a job¹⁶.

EU Law does not specify what the "sufficient resources" are, so it is the responsibility of Member States to set the criteria for their determination. However, according to Article 8(4) of Directive 2004/38, Member States may not require an amount "higher than the threshold below which nationals of the host Member State become eligible for social assistance, or, where this criterion is not applicable, higher than the minimum social security pension". Moreover, as

¹³ See Recital 10 of Directive 2004/38.

¹⁴ See Articles 7-9 of the Regulation (EU) No 492/2011.

¹⁵ "Workers – employed or self-employed – and their family members are covered by the host country's social security system under the same conditions as nationals because they contribute, as national workers do, through contributions and taxes to the public funds from which the benefits are financed", see Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European economic and social Committee and the Committee of the Regions, "Free movement of EU citizens and their families: Five actions to make a difference", COM(2013) 837 final, 25.11.2013, p. 6.

¹⁶ See Recital 9, and Article 14(4)(b).

affirmed by the Court of Justice, the origin of these resources is not identified, and can therefore also be furnished by a spouse of third-country citizenship¹⁷.

With regard to all of these cases, the right of residence is recognized in Article 7(1)(d) as also applying to “family members accompanying or joining a Union citizen” who satisfy the conditions referred to in points (a), (b) or (c).

Once the right of residence is obtained on the basis of the conditions established by Article 7, and after spending five years in the host Member State, the European citizen and their family members acquire a right of permanent residence. According to Article 16 of Directive 2004/38 that right is not subject to any conditions.

In 2013, the Commission highlighted the fact that: “In most Member States, mobile EU citizens are net contributors to the host country’s welfare system – they pay more in tax and social security contributions than they receive in benefits. Mobile EU citizens also tend to be net contributors to the costs of public services they use in the host Member State. They are therefore unlikely to represent a burden on the welfare systems of host Member States”¹⁸.

2. The notion of “family members”

As consistently reaffirmed in recent case law, the right of non-EU family members to accompany or join mobile EU citizens is not an autonomous right but rather it pertains to the “rights derived from the exercise of freedom of movement by a Union citizen”¹⁹.

The Directive of 2004, in indicating which family members have the right to follow an EU citizen, has adopted a broad approach based on case law and the evolution of social customs, to avoid hindering the exercise of free movement of citizens for reasons relating to family unity²⁰.

¹⁷ “[...] the expression ‘have’ sufficient resources in that provision must be interpreted as meaning that it suffices that such resources are available to the Union citizen, and that that provision lays down no requirement whatsoever as to their origin, since they could be provided *inter alia* by the third-country national. [...] an interpretation of the condition concerning the sufficiency of resources as meaning that the person concerned must have such resources himself, without being able to use for that purpose the resources of an accompanying family member, would add to that condition, as formulated in Directive 2004/38, a requirement as to the origin of the resources which, not being necessary for the attainment of the objective pursued, namely the protection of the public finances of the Member States[...].” Judgment *Singh*, 16 July 2015, C-218/14, EU:C:2015:476, paragraphs 74-76. See also Judgments *Zhu and Chen*, 19 October 2004, C-200/02, EU:C:2004:639, para 33; *Alokpa*, 10 October 2013, C-86/12, EU:C:2013:645, para 27.

¹⁸ COM(2013)837 final, p. 4.

¹⁹ “Article 21(1) TFEU and Directive 2004/38 do not confer any autonomous right upon third-country nationals [...]. Any rights conferred upon third-country nationals by provisions of EU law on Union citizenship are rights derived from the exercise of freedom of movement by a Union citizen [...]”, *O. & B.*, cit., para 36. See also Judgments *Ida*, 8 November 2012, C-40/11, EU:C:2012:691, paras. 66 -67; *Ymeraga*, 8 May 2013, C-87/12, EU:C:2013:291, para. 34; *Alokpa*, cit., para. 22.

²⁰ See Explanatory Memorandum of the Proposal for a European Parliament and Council Directive on the right of citizens of the Union and their family members to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States, COM(2001)257 final, 29 June 2001, para. 2.4.

On the right of family and EU Law see S. M. Carbone, C. Tuo, *Gli strumenti di diritto dell’Unione europea in materia di famiglia e il Trattato di Lisbona*, in *Studi sull’integrazione europea*, p. 301 ss., 2010, www.studisullintegrazioneeuropea.eu; S. M. CARBONE, I. QUEIROLO,

According to Article 2(2), a “Family Member” is considered to be: the spouse; the partner, but only under the condition that the union with the citizen has been registered in accordance with the legislation of a Member State, and only if the legislation of the host State treats registered partnerships as equivalent to marriage, and in accordance with the conditions laid down in its relevant legislation²¹; any direct descendants who are under the age of 21 or are dependants and those of the spouse or partner; and, dependent direct relatives in the ascending line and those of the spouse or partner

With regard to the notion of “spouse”, Directive 2004/38 makes no reference to the issues of polygamous and forced marriages, which are regulated in Directive 2003/86²², “on the right to family reunification” which covers nationals of third countries. Some guidance on the subject is offered in the Communication of 2009, which states that Member States are not obliged to recognize polygamous marriages, but that they must take into account the best interests of children resulting from such marriages. Also, they must differentiate between forced marriages that cannot legitimize reunification and arranged marriages in which both spouses freely consent to the marriage²³.

Particular attention is given to the problem of marriages of convenience which fall under the concept of “abuse of rights or fraud”. According to Article 35 of Directive 2004/38, the identification of a marriage of convenience may involve the loss of the rights conferred by that Directive. The data examined by the Commission shows that the phenomenon of marriages of convenience has dimensions that vary greatly from State to State and also involves organized crime and human trafficking. To address this delicate issue, in 2014 the Commission, with the assistance of Member States, produced a handbook which offers guidance to national authorities on suitable measures to take to ascertain the existence of marriages of convenience and to take appropriate and proportionate steps in accordance with EU Law²⁴.

Throughout the legislative process, the European Parliament’s position with respect to the notion of family members was more open, in relation to both the

Unione europea e diritto di famiglia: la progressiva “invasione” degli spazi riservati alla sovranità statale, in S. M. Carbone, I. Queirolo (a cura di), *Diritto di famiglia e Unione europea*, Torino, Giappichelli, p. 1 ss, 2008.

²¹ In tema v. M. Condinanzi, C. Amalfitano, *La libera circolazione della ‘coppia’ nel diritto comunitario*, in *Il Diritto dell’Unione europea*, pp. 399 ss, 2008.

²² Council Directive 2003/86/EC, of 22 September 2003, on the right to family reunification (OJ L 251, 3.10.2003, p. 12).

²³ Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council, on guidance for better transposition and application of Directive 2004/38/EC on the right of citizens of the Union and their family members to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States, COM(2009) 313 final, 2.7.2009, para. 2.1.1.

²⁴ Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council “Helping national authorities fight abuses of the right to free movement: Handbook on addressing the issue of alleged marriages of convenience between EU citizens and non-EU nationals in the context of EU law on free movement of EU citizens”, COM(2014) 604 final, 26.9.2014.

The Handbook will provide “more clarity on the legal framework” in which national authorities “can operate when examining suspected cases and deciding on whether to withdraw or deny free movement rights on grounds of marriage of convenience”. See COM(2013)837, para. 5.

recognition of same-sex marriages and same-sex civil unions. The concept of "partner" as indicated in Article 2(2) of Directive 2004/38 takes a more "cautious approach"²⁵. A balance was found between, on the one hand, the competence of States with regard to family law, and on the other hand, the evolution of social customs. Although the position of the European Parliament was not accepted, Article 2(2)(b) was drawn up in a way that allows for family unity even in the case of civil unions (including those between persons of the same sex) in accordance with the national law of the host Member State. As a result, a greater openness in this regard in the national law will automatically entail an extension of the beneficiaries of the "right to follow" provided for by Directive 2004/38. The situation of the partner is also considered, albeit from a different perspective, in Article 3(2).

Regarding the situation of children and ascendants, the Commission made it clear that included within the scope of the application of Article 2(2) are adoptive children or parents and minors placed in the custody of a permanent legal guardian²⁶.

The Directive also takes account of the situation of "other family members" who do not fall within the definitions in Article 2(2). According to Article 3(2), the Member States must facilitate the entry and residence of other family members who are in a situation of dependence on the EU citizen, or who for "serious health grounds strictly require the personal care of the family member by the Union citizen", as well as the partner with whom the Union citizen has a durable, duly attested relationship.

What is signified by "dependent" upon the EU citizen has been examined in several judgments. The Court of Justice has held that the "status of 'dependent' family member is the result of a factual situation characterised by the fact that legal, financial, emotional or material support for that family member is provided by the sponsor or by his/her spouse/partner". Consequently, 'dependency' may differ according to the situation and the particular family member concerned²⁷.

Although for "other family members" the competence to grant the right of residence belongs to the Member State, EU Law seeks to protect the position of these subjects. The family members indicated in Article 3(2) do not enjoy the right – established in Directive 2004/38 – to accompany or join the EU citizen; however, they have a privileged status compared to other foreigners. In fact, the Member States are required to ensure that national legislation allows them to obtain a decision on the application for entry and residence that is based on a thorough examination of their personal circumstances²⁸. As the Commission emphasized, "[...] In order to maintain the unity of the family in a broad sense, the national legislation must provide for a careful examination of the relevant

²⁵ C. Morviducci, *op.cit.*, p. 137.

²⁶ COM(2009)313, para. 2.1.2

²⁷ See COM(2009)313, para.2.1.4 and judgments: *Lebon*, 18 June 1987, 316/85, EU:C:1987:302, paras. 21-22; *Zhu and Chen*, cit., para. 43; *Jia*, 9 January 2007, C-1/05, EU:C:2007:1, paras. 36-37; *Rahman*, 5 september 2011, C-83/11, EU:C:2011:519, paras. 18-45; *O. & S.*, 6 December 2012, C-356/11 and C-357/11, para 56, EU:C:2012:776.

²⁸ Judgment *Rahamm*, cit., para. 26.

personal circumstances of the applicants concerned, taking into consideration their relationship with the EU citizen or any other circumstances, such as their financial or physical dependence, as stipulated in Recital 6. Any negative decision is subject to all the material and procedural safeguards of the Directive. It must be fully justified in writing and open to appeal"²⁹.

3. The right of residence of family members of EU citizens

Article 3(1) and Article 7(1)(d) of Directive 2004/38 guarantee the right to reside in a host Member State to members of the nuclear family—as indicated in Article 2(2)—of any EU mobile citizen that meets the conditions established in Article 7.

The right to follow their European family member arises immediately and it is not necessary that the non-EU family member has already resided lawfully in another Member State. This aspect was clarified in the leading case *Metock*³⁰. In this case, the Court of Justice issued a reversal, stating that the non-EU family member may already be illegally in the Member State, without the possibility of removal by the national authorities (except for reasons of public policy, public security or public health, applied in compliance with Articles 27-33 of Directive 2004/38)³¹. In particular, with regard to the right of residence of the spouse, we must emphasize that it is not necessary that the marriage predate the exercise of free movement by the EU citizen, which is why marriage to an irregular migrant would solve the problem of right to residence. This irregularity may allow the national authorities to impose penalties other than removal³².

This interpretation has been criticized, as it has resulted in the erosion of the competence of the Member States on the subject of immigration. However, the Court has underscored the reasoning behind this new broad interpretation: "It is common ground that the Community derives from Articles 18(2) EC, 40 EC, 44 EC and 52 EC - on the basis of Which Directive 2004/38 inter alia was adopted - competence to enact the necessary measures to bring about freedom of movement for Union citizens [...] if Union citizens were not allowed to lead a normal family life in the host Member State, the exercise of the freedoms they are guaranteed by the Treaty would be seriously obstructed. Consequently, within the competence conferred on it by those articles [...] of the Treaty, the Community legislature can regulate the conditions of entry and residence of the family members of a Union citizen in the territory of the Member States, where the fact that it is impossible for the Union citizen to be accompanied or joined by his

²⁹ COM(2009)313, para. 2.1.4.

³⁰ Judgment *Metock*. See G. Morgese, *Libertà di ingresso e soggiorno per il coniuge extracomunitario del cittadino dell'Unione*, in *Sud in Europa*, dicembre 2008, www.sudineuropa.net.

³¹ On the removal of irregular foreigners see Cellamare, *Il rimpatrio e l'allontanamento dei cittadini di Stati terzi in condizione irregolare*, in G. Carella and others, *op. cit.*, p. 227 ss.

³² "[...] even if the personal conduct of the person concerned does not justify the adoption of measures of public policy or public security within the meaning of Article 27 of Directive 2004/38, the Member State remain entitled to impose other penalties on him which do not interfere with freedom of movement and residence, such as a fine, provided that they are proportionate", Judgment *Metock*, para. 97.

family in the host Member State would be such as to interfere with his freedom of movement by discouraging him from exercising his rights of entry into and residence in that Member State"³³.

The right to reunification also clearly applies to a foreign family member who is outside the European Union. According to Article 5 of Directive 2004/38, the Member State must allow non-EU family members to enter its territory without creating difficulties. To enter the territory, a valid passport is sufficient. A visa is only required for foreign nationals from States listed in Regulation of Council Regulation (EC) No 539/2001 of 15 March 2001. If the foreigner has already obtained a residence card they should be exempted from the requirement to obtain an entry visa³⁴.

In accordance with Article 10 of Directive 2004/38, the host Member State must issue a document entitled "Residence card of a family member of a Union citizen" to foreign family members no later than six months from the date of the application. The residence card shall be valid for five years from the date of issue, or for the envisaged period of residence of the Union citizen, if this period is less than five years (Article 11). The right of residence of the foreign family member is, in fact, clearly linked to that of the EU citizen, not only in relation to compliance with the conditions, but also with respect to its duration; however, as we will see, the family member in some cases may continue to reside autonomously in the host Member State.

4. The right of family members to continue to reside in the host Member State

Although the right of family members to reside in the host Member State is a right derived from the right of movement of EU citizens, in certain situations the family members continue to enjoy the right to reside there independently.

The situations that the EU Law has decided to protect concern in particular the children of EU citizens. The other family members are also protected in case of death, and in some cases following the departure of the European citizen. Finally, the right to continue to reside is granted to the spouse/foreign partner even in the case of dissolution of the marriage or registered partnership.

Regarding the right to continue to reside, it is necessary, however, to differentiate the situation of the children of workers, to which Article 10 of Regulation 492/2011 is applicable, from other situations related to family members (including children) of the other mobile citizens governed by Directive 2004/38.

It must be noted that Article 10 of Regulation 492/2011 replaces Article 12 of Regulation 1612/68; therefore, it should be interpreted in light of prior relevant case law. Article 10 establishes that: "The children of a national of a Member State *who is or has been employed* in the territory of another Member State shall

³³ The Court has also stated that: "The refusal of the host Member State to grant rights of entry and residence to the family members of a Union citizen such as to discourage that citizen from moving to or residing in that Member State, even if his family members are not already lawfully resident in the territory of another Member State", Judgment *Metock*, paras. 61-64.

³⁴ See Recital, p. 8.

be admitted to that State's general educational, apprenticeship and vocational training courses under the same conditions as the nationals of that State, *if such children are residing in its territory*. Member States shall encourage all efforts to enable such children to attend these courses under the best possible conditions".

The objective of this rule is to enable the children of workers to be fully integrated into the State of residence and, therefore, to study (at any level and degree of study) and to obtain proper professional training under equal conditions with nationals of the host Member State.

The holders of the right to study are children who reside in the host Member State, thus it is a personal right. It follows, logically, that this right continues to subsist independently of the lack of continuity of residence of the EU worker parent. This aspect has already been highlighted by case law in the judgment in *Baumbast*³⁵ and was clarified after the entry into force of Directive 2004/38 in the cases of *Ibrahim*³⁶ and *Teixeira*³⁷.

In the recent judgment in *NA* of 30 June 2016, the Court reaffirmed that the right of access to education "depends on the child concerned first being settled in the host Member State, and consequently children who have settled in that Member State in their capacity as family members of a migrant worker, as well as the children of a migrant worker who have resided since birth in the Member State in which their father or mother is or was employed, may rely on that right in that Member State"³⁸.

Furthermore, in the opinion of the Court of Justice: "the right derived by children from Article 12 of Regulation No 1612/68 *is not dependent on the right of residence of their parents* in the host Member State, since that provision requires only that the child has lived with his parents or one of them in a Member State while at least one of the child's parents resided there as a worker"³⁹. In this way, the Court held that children could continue their studies initiated when the parent worker (or former worker) resided in the host Member State.

On the basis of previous case law in the judgment of 30 June 2016, the Court has taken a step forward in deciding that, according to Article 12 of Regulation 1612/68 (which has since been replaced by Article 10 of Regulation 492/2011), the children who reside in the host Member State may *begin to study* in that State even if their parent—the holder of the right of residence—has left that State. According to the Court: "Article 12 [...] does not require, before a child can qualify for the right laid down by that provision, that the parent, the former migrant worker, should still reside in the host Member State on the date when the child *begins* to attend school or university, nor that the parent should continue to be present within that Member State throughout the period of attendance at school or university"⁴⁰.

The Court has therefore ruled that: "Consequently, in circumstances such as

³⁵ Judgment *Baumbast*, 17 September 2002 C-413/99, EU:C:2002:493.

³⁶ Judgment *Ibrahim*, 23 February 2010, C-310/08, EU:C:2010:80.

³⁷ Judgment *Teixeira*, 23 February 2010, C-480/08, EU:C:2010:83.

³⁸ Judgment *NA*, 30 June 2016, C-115/15, EU:C:2016:487, para. 54.

³⁹ Judgments *Ibrahim*, para. 40; *NA*, para. 57.

⁴⁰ Judgment *NA*, para. 59.

those in the main proceedings, a child of a former migrant worker, who has resided since birth in the host Member State, qualifies for the right, first, *to commence or to continue* his or her education in that Member State, under Article 12 of Regulation No 1612/68 and, second, as a consequence, a right of residence based on that same provision. Whether the parent, the former migrant worker, does or does not reside in that Member State on the date when that child began to attend school, is of no relevance on that point"⁴¹.

In this particular case, the right of residence of the two children also allowed the mother, a non-EU national divorced from the EU worker who had left the host Member State, to continue to reside in the host Member State to provide the necessary care to the children who were students and minors (as well as both being EU citizens)⁴². The Court has, in fact, specified that: "[...] where the children enjoy, under Article 12 of Regulation No 1612/68, the right to continue their education in the host Member State although the parent who is their carer is at risk of losing her right of residence, if that parent were denied the possibility of remaining in the host Member State during the period of her children's education, that might deprive those children of a right which is granted to them by the EU legislature"⁴³.

The case of *NA* of 2016, stands, therefore, in continuity with the leading cases *Baumbast*, *Teixeira* and *Ibrahim*, but recognizes another possibility since the children also have the right to *begin* studies after the EU worker parent's departure from the host Member State.

It is necessary to remember, however, that in cases that fall within the scope of Article 10 of Regulation 492/2011 (previously Article 12 of Regulation 1612/68), the residence of the children is not subject to the conditions of having sufficient economic resources and health insurance. Indeed, under the principle of equal treatment, the children of employees (and, where appropriate, the custodial parent) can access forms of social assistance established for nationals of the host Member State.

The rights of family members to continue to reside in the Member State independently of the EU citizen are also expressly provided for in Directive 2004/38. The objective of the Directive, to provide stability for people who now reside in the host Member State, is evidenced in Recital 15 of Directive 2004/38 which refers to the fundamental rights to "family life" and the "human dignity" of the family members of EU citizens⁴⁴.

Directive 2004/38 recognizes the right of family members to maintain residence on a personal basis in three different hypothetical cases covered by Articles 12 and 13.

⁴¹ Judgment *NA*, para. 63.

⁴² "Finally, according to the Court's case-law, the right of access to education implies that the child of a migrant worker or former migrant worker has an independent right of residence, when the child wishes to continue his or her education in the host Member State, and that the parent who is the child's primary carer has a corresponding right of residence", Judgment *NA*, para. 64. See also judgment *Hadj Ahmed*, 13 June 2013, C-45/12, EU:C:2013:390, para. 46.

⁴³ Judgment *NA*, para. 65. See also judgment *Baumbast*, para. 71.

⁴⁴ See Recital, p. 15.

Under Article 12 family members retain the right of residence in case of death, and in some situations in the event of departure of the European citizen. The rules are, however, different depending on the nationality of the family member. Under Article 12(1) the death or departure of the mobile citizen shall not entail loss of the right of residence of family members who are EU citizens. This applies both in the case of permanent residence (in this case without having to satisfy any condition) and in situations governed by Article 7(1). In cases of residence longer than three months, however, it is necessary to continue to comply with the provisions of Article 7, namely, having sufficient economic resources and health insurance.

With regard to non-EU nationals, Article 12(2) refers only to the death of the EU citizen. It follows that the departure of the EU citizen does not allow non-EU familiars to continue to reside in the Member State.

In the case of death of the EU citizen, however, conditions are imposed. First, it is necessary that the family members "have been residing in the host Member State as family members for at least one year before the Union citizen's death." Secondly, if they still do not have the right of permanent residence, Article 12(2) states verbatim that: "the right of residence of the persons concerned shall remain subject to the requirement that they are able to show that they are workers or self-employed persons or that they have sufficient resources for themselves and their family members not to become a burden on the social assistance system of the host Member State during their period of residence and have comprehensive sickness insurance cover in the host Member State, or that they are members of the family, already constituted in the host Member State, of a person satisfying these requirements".

The regulation clarifies that: "Such family members shall retain their right of residence exclusively on a personal basis".

A situation of greater advantage exists concerning the children of European citizens – their nationality has no relevance if the children *reside and study* in the host Member State. Article 12(3) of the Directive, analogous to the Regulation on freedom of movement for workers, provides that: "The Union citizen's departure from the host Member State or his/her death shall not entail loss of the right of residence of his/her children or of the parent who has actual custody of the children, irrespective of nationality, if the children reside in the host Member State and are enrolled at an educational establishment, for the purpose of studying there, until the completion of their studies".

The big news of Directive 2004/38 concerns the right of a spouse or partner to continue to reside in the host Member State in case of separation, divorce or annulment of the registered partnership.

In this case as well, the rules are different depending on the nationality of the spouse/partner. Article 13 provides: "divorce, annulment of the Union citizen's marriage or termination of his/her registered partnership, as Referred to in point 2(b) of Article 2 shall not affect the right of residence of his/her family *members who are nationals of a Member State*". This right, however, is subject to fulfilment of the conditions of Article 7(1) of Directive 2004/38. It is clear that European citizens could independently obtain the right of residence if they meet

the requirements of Article 7, regardless of the previous marriage relationship.

With regard to foreign spouses or partners, Article 13(2) specifically establishes the situations in which "divorce, annulment of marriage or termination of the registered partnership referred to in point 2(b) of Article 2 shall not entail loss of the right of residence of a Union citizen's family members *who are not nationals of a Member State*".

The continuity of the right of residence is conditional upon the fact that "the marriage or registered partnership has lasted at least three years, including one year in the host Member State prior to initiation of the divorce or annulment proceedings or termination of the registered partnership". The continuity of the right of residence is established even if "the spouse or partner has custody of the Union citizen's children"; or if he or she has the "right of access to a minor child, provided that the court has ruled that such access must be in the host Member State, and for as long as is required".

Lastly, the right to continue to reside may result if it "is warranted by particularly difficult circumstances, such as having been a victim of domestic violence while the marriage or registered partnership was subsisting".

In the opinion of the Court of Justice, Article 13 applies only if the divorce proceedings are started *before the departure* of the spouse who is the holder of the right of residence. This aspect was clarified in the case of *Singh* on 16 July 2015 and was reaffirmed in the case of *NA* on 30 June 2016, in which the Court also considered the fact that his wife had been a victim of violence.

In the case of *Singh*, the Court ruled that Article 13 applies only in a case in which the EU citizen spouse continues to reside in the host Member State, at least until the initiation of proceedings for marriage dissolution, since the "derivative" right of residence of a third country national, on the basis of Article 7(2) of Directive 2004/38, ceases to apply in the moment the EU citizen departs, which is why it cannot be maintained according to Article 13(2)⁴⁵. The Court underlines that: "[...] The departure of the spouse who is a Union citizen has already brought about the loss of the right of residence of the spouse who is a third-country national and stays behind in the host Member State. The *later petition for divorce cannot have the effect of reviving that right*, since Article 13 of Directive 2004/38 mentions only the 'retention' of an existing right of residence"⁴⁶.

In the case of *NA*, the Court also analyzes the issue of domestic violence to determine whether in this case the departure of the spouse before the divorce proceedings may help to maintain the right of residence under Article 13(2). The Court reaffirms that according to Article 12, non-EU family members do not retain their right of residence in the case of departure of the spouse, and that there is no exception to this rule in the event that the spouse is a victim of domestic violence⁴⁷. The Court considers the objective of Article 13(2), pointing out that it is a novelty, since before Directive 2004/38 the right of residence to foreign spouses was not guaranteed in the event of dissolution of marriage.

⁴⁵ Judgment *Singh*, para. 62.

⁴⁶ Judgment *Singh*, para. 67 and the Opinion of Advocate General Kokott, point 27.

⁴⁷ Judgment *NA*, paras. 43-44.

An examination of the Commission report accompanying the proposal of the Directive⁴⁸ reveals that the function of Article 13(2) is "to offer certain legal safeguards to third-country nationals whose right of residence was dependent on a family relationship by marriage and who could therefore be open to blackmail accompanied by threats of divorce, and that safeguards were necessary only in the event of final divorce, since, in the event of *de facto* separation, the right of residence of a spouse who is a third-country national is not at all affected." The Court therefore held that "Article 13(2)(c) of Directive 2004/38 must be interpreted as meaning that a third-country national who is divorced from a Union citizen, at whose hands she has been the victim of domestic violence during the marriage, cannot rely on the retention of her right of residence in the host Member State, on the basis of that provision, where the commencement of divorce proceedings post-dates the departure of the Union citizen spouse from that Member State"⁴⁹. However, it should be noted that in the case of *NA*, which confirmed the restrictive interpretation of the *Singh* judgment, the claimant had obtained the right of residence as a foster mother of the student children based on Article 12 of Regulation 1612/1968.

5. Conclusions

The free movement of people has been the principal means of promoting European integration, and family reunification was certainly essential to that objective. The notion of family unity has surely offered a dimension of human dignity to the movement of people for economic reasons.

Over the course of time, the right of citizens to be followed by their family members has changed in connotation. Family members do not only enjoy a derivative right to accompany the principal holder of the right of circulation; they also acquire autonomous rights and, in some cases, their position can justify an extension of the rights even to their caregivers. This gradual increase in the value of the family should be, without doubt, the thrust of a Court of Justice that is sensitive to the protection of the fundamental rights of people, and in particular minors. Not surprisingly, in the application of EU Law, both Primary and Secondary, the Court has undertaken a balancing of all interests involved, taking into account the importance of the right of citizens to move and reside within the Union.

The consolidated position of the Court has also permeated the EU legislation that currently deals with the right of family members of EU citizens to maintain the right of residence already acquired, establishing that in case of dissolution of the marriage, divorce, or annulment of the registered union, the spouse or partner continues to be able to stay in the host Member State in their own right. In this way, spouses acquire greater personal dignity, with the certainty that the right to reside in the State in which they are living will continue, regardless of family ties with the initial holder of the right, in the case of the dissolution of the marriage.

The right to maintain residence is provided extensively for mobile EU citizens' children who are studying or being trained professionally in the host Member State. These regulations and the generous judicial interpretation in

⁴⁸ Explanatory Memorandum, COM(2001)257 final, cit.

⁴⁹ Judgment *NA*, paras. 46-51.

recognizing the right of caregivers of children/students to continue living in the host Member State enrich the heritage of the rights of the family members of EU citizens, especially when it comes to non-EU family members who would otherwise be forced to leave the host Member State. Recent case law has once again highlighted how it is in the best interests of the children of mobile citizens to offer them and the parents who care for them a guarantee of stability, which is an essential element for proper formation and for continuing to fully express the core values of the EU.

REFERENCES

Adinolfi, A., (2015), *La libertà di circolazione delle persone e la politica dell'immigrazione*, in STROZZI, G., (a cura di), *Diritto dell'Unione europea. Parte speciale*, Torino, Giappichelli, IV ed., p. 64 ss.

Baruffi, M.C., Quadranti, I., (a cura di), (2012), *Libera circolazione e diritti dei cittadini europei*, Napoli, Edizioni scientifiche italiane.

Cellamare, G., (2012), *Il rimpatrio e l'allontanamento dei cittadini di Stati terzi in condizione irregolare*, in G. Carella, G. Cellamare, L. Garofalo, P. Gargiulo, G. Pizzolante, A. Sciacovelli, R. di Chio, (2012), *L'immigrazione e la mobilità delle persone nel diritto dell'Unione europea*, Milano, Monduzzi, p. 227 ss.

Caggiano, G. (a cura di), (2014), *I percorsi giuridici per l'integrazione. Migranti e titolari di protezione internazionale tra diritto dell'Unione e ordinamento italiano*, Torino, Giappichelli.

Carbone, S. M., Tuo, C., (2010), *Gli strumenti di diritto dell'Unione europea in materia di famiglia e il Trattato di Lisbona*, in *Studi sull'integrazione europea*, p. 301 ss., www.studisullintegrazioneeuropea.eu

Carbone, S. M., QUEIROLO, I., (2008), *Unione europea e diritto di famiglia: la progressiva "invasione" degli spazi riservati alla sovranità statale*, in Carbone, S. M., QUEIROLO, I., (a cura di), *Diritto di famiglia e Unione europea*, Torino, Giappichelli, p. 1ss..

Condnanzi, M., Lang, A., Nascimbene, B., (2006), *Cittadinanza dell'Unione e libera circolazione delle persone*, Milano, Giuffrè, II ed.

Condnanzi, M., Amalfitano, C., (2008), *La libera circolazione della 'coppia' nel diritto comunitario*, in *Il Diritto dell'Unione europea*, pp. 399 ss.

DI Comite V., (2011), *L'uguaglianza tra cittadini europei? Una nuova sfida per un problema annoso*, in TRIGGIANI E. (a cura di), *Le nuove frontiere della cittadinanza europea*, Bari, 2011, pp. 85.

DI Comite V., (2012), *Il desiderio di "vivereinsieme" e il mancato diritto al ricongiungimento familiare per i cittadini europei "statici" alla luce del caso Dereci*, in *Studi sull'integrazione europea*, p. 463 ss.,

www.studisullintegrazioneeuropea.eu

DI Filippo, M., (2012), *La circolazione dello straniero nel diritto dell'Unione europea: una geometria variabile dei diritti e delle garanzie*, in Calamia, A. M., DI Filippo, M., Gestri, M., a cura di, *Immigrazione, diritto e diritti: profili internazionalistici ed europei*, Padova, Cedam.

Gargiulo, P. (con la collaborazione di L. Montanari), (2012), *Le forme della cittadinanza. Tra cittadinanza europea e cittadinanza nazionale*, Edizioni Ediesse, Roma.

Nogueras, D. J.Liñàn, *Ciudadanía dela Unión europea*, in G. C. Rodríguez Iglesias, D. Nogueras, D. J.Liñàn, (directores), *El Derecho comunitario y suaplicación judicial*, Madrid, 1993, pp. 271-295.

Marinai, S., (2012), *L'unità familiare e il ricongiungimento*, in Calamia, A. M., DI Filippo, M., Gestri, M., *op.cit.*, pp. 493 ss.

Mengozi, P., (2011), *La sentenza Zambrano: prodromi e conseguenze di una pronuncia inattesa*, in *Studi sull'integrazione europea*, p.417 ss., www.studisullintegrazioneeuropea.eu

Morgese, G., *Libertà di ingresso e soggiorno per il coniuge extracomunitario del cittadino dell'Unione*, in *Sud in Europa*, dicembre 2008, www.sudineuropa.net.

Morviducci, C., (2014), *I diritti dei cittadini europei*, II ed., Giappichelli, Torino.

Nascimbene, B., Rossi dal Pozzo, F., (2012), *Diritti di cittadinanza e libera circolazione nell'Unione europea*, Padova, Cedam.

Palladino, R., (2012), *Il ricongiungimento familiare nell'ordinamento europeo, tra integrazione del mercato e tutela dei diritti fondamentali*, Bari, Cacucci.

Rossi dal Pozzo, F., (2013), *Citizenship Rights and Freedom of Movement in the European Union*, Alphen Aanden Rijn, The Netherlands, Wolter Kluwer.

Sciacovelli, A., *La disciplina dell'ingresso e del soggiorno dei cittadini dell'Unione europea e dei loro familiari*, in Carella G. and others, *op.cit.*, p. 1 ss.

Tizzano, A., (2011), *Alle origini della cittadinanza europea*, in Panella, L., Spatafora, E. (a cura di), *Studi in onore di Claudio Zanghì*, Giappichelli, Torino, pp. 857 ss.

Triggiani, E., (2006), *La cittadinanza europea per la "utopia" sovranazionale*, in *Studi sull'integrazione europea*, pp. 435 ss.

Triggiani, E., (a cura di), (2011), *Le nuove frontiere della cittadinanza europea*, Bari, Cacucci.

Villani, U., (1995), *La cittadinanza dell'Unione europea*, in *Studi in ricordo di Antonio Filippo Panzera*, vol. II, Bari, Cacucci, pp. 1001 ss.

MANAGEMENT'S PLACE AND ROLE IN POLITICAL PR

Aurelia Peru-Balan*

peruaurelia@gmail.com

Abstract: *In this article, we will refer to the role of the political PR in the political management field. Taking into account the actuality and usability of the political PR we believe that this can be treated as a new direction in the political science field. The PR is representing a communicational system in which the political actor, his image and the public opinion about him are interacting and form perceptions about politics and determine electoral behavior.*

Keywords: *Public relations, election campaigns, political management, Republic of Moldova.*

Introduction

PR or Public Relations are representing a key part of the political field – constituting the art and science of assuring harmony through mutual understanding, grounded on truth and fully information. Recent approaches demonstrate that PR has enough resources for creating political and media shows, ritualizing political communication forms /methods. The political PR needs to be treated like the consubstantiality of a three well-known concepts in the political communication science:

The political actor – the political image – the public opinion.

According to the specialized papers, the term “management” is coming from the Italian and French languages. In Romanian, this term has a specific untranslatable structure, but naturalized in time, by equivalence, as “organization and leading”.

In 1941, James Burnham is publishing a book named “The Managerial Revolution”, presenting “the manager” being a person endowed with specific abilities, being able to organize revolutionary and expansible an enterprise.¹

According to English dictionary, the management comprises the necessity of design, planning, administration, control and leading an activity with a very specific well-determined purpose and maximum efficiency. Thereby, the political management is considered to be a skill of which, the political organization can be lead profitable. In addition, the managerial process is based on general requirements of applied sciences, on an unremitting process of development of connected sciences, on the rigorous observation of activity's organization and conduction, on a systemic analysis of successes and failures. Political

***Dr. of Political Science, Leading Researcher, Institute of Legal and Political Research of ASM.**

¹ James Burnham, *The Managerial Revolution: What is Happening in the World*, New York: John Day Co., 1941, p.71

management is emphasizing the pragmatic political side, consisting of leader proficiency in applying efficient his knowledge's, taking in the consideration the realities of his political organization.

The American author W. H. Newman says that management is a state of mind, a way to look and to address the problems, a specific manner to conduct dynamic to a well-defined purpose, finally – to the maxim result in any activity. This state of mind is reflecting in a particular manner of looking at the managerial phenomenon, addressing to the managerial crises by searching and accepting the progress. Political management is an organization process responsible for leading, (no matter its place in the political organization) that contributes to the increasing of efficiency and competitiveness, by storage, processing, and transmission of information in an optimal time, using theoretical and practical skills².

Alexandru Puiu is offering the following definition for the management: “The management is the science of leading and innovating in all fields of activity”. According to Jean Gerbier “management means the organization, the art of leading, of administration, therefore leadership. Leslie Rue: The management involves the guidance or orientation of a group of people to the organizational purposes or goals³.

In the context of public relation management, Sandra Oliver is making some findings available for the political field also, by considering that the successful PR has to be transparent, without being vulnerable to the influence and proving a dynamic bilateral process which is designed to the understanding of the facts by the both sides, no matter if they will not have an agreement concerning the politics or the ideology.⁴

PR management process, according to Gregory Anne, is built on four main steps:

- Awareness (analysis of the current situation)
- Formulation (right strategy selection process)
- Implementation (putting the strategy into action)

A key management element is the planning. The following ten levels of the planning are known: analyze, goals, public, messages, strategy, tactics, temporary planning, resources, evaluation, and review⁵. [5, p.62].

Thereby, in the messages creation process, the flowing steps need to be respected:

1. First step: taking existing articulated perceptions (both: positive and negative)
2. Second step: defining the changes that can be done in those perceptions (they need to be identified clearly).

² W. Newman, *Administrative Action*, Prentice Hall Englewood Hills, New York, 1964.

³ Puiu Alexandru, *Management - Analysis and comparative studies*, Bucharest, Independenta Economica, 2007, p.17.

⁴ S. Oliver, *Public Relations Strategy*, Iasi, Polirom, 2009, p.183.

⁵ A. Gregory, *The Planning and Managing PR Campaigns*, Iași, Polirom, 2009, p.62.

3. Third step: identifying persuasion's elements (innovation, modernization)
4. Fourth's step: assuring that the messages are credible and can be transmitted by public relations instruments⁶.

The theory and the typology of the political management.

What are in the end the differences between political management and another type of management?

For understanding that we propose a comparison with the economic management made by Sergiu Tamas:

Economic Management	Political Management
1a. Looks at the society as a potential market, that can be extended by the business sector	2a. Is approaching the society like a complex of social processes, in which the market is just a constitutive element
1b. Taking into account the society members as consumers.	2b. The members of the society are considered citizens, from which politics has political obligations.
1c. It is concerned about the short and medium term results.	2c. Short and medium term objectives are subordinated to long-term goals.
1d. Has as a performance criterion – the profit	2d. Is targeting more performance criterions: economic, politic, military, diplomatic.

The source: Sergiu Tamas an American party consists⁷.

The political management is distinguished by its amplitude. At a country level, according to Ion Boboc, the political Management is, in fact, a subdivision of the science and art of governing, which helps provide a better administration by the side of government or a governmental organization. At the level of the political organization, political management is applied with particular tools and technics suitable for the diagnostic and prognostic type analyses, which increase the efficiency of the political organizations.

As a shape of manifestation, in the scientific works, political management concept is used at the political parties' level, those who, in a democratic country, are taking the power given by majority voters for being a part of governance⁸.

Political management is not related just to the power gained by a political Party in elections, for a specific period of time (government party), but also to the opposition parties activities who strategically intends to (re)gain the power. In addition, political management refers to the internal power of a political party

⁶ S. Tamas, *Political Management, politics elaboration and the government*, Bucharest, Expert, 2002, p.16.

⁷ Ibidem, p.44.

⁸ I. Boboc, *Organizational and managerial behavior. Psychosocial and Political Foundations*, Vol. II, 2003, p.14

and its use by the own leaders for the stuff leading. Max Weber is describing the political parties as `the political enterprises on a market election".⁹

The term „party management” appears in the scientific area with the work of James Bryce. Thereby, in the chapter named „The Machine” (party machine), the author says: The organization of an American party consists of two distinct, but intimately connected, sets of bodies, the one permanent, and the other temporary. The function of the one is to manage party business, of the other to nominate party candidates. Obvious, the author takes a terminology that exists in the era, the practice of political management work being carried out in an empirical way.¹⁰

Laurence e Lynn is arguing that the management in politics represents the science and art. In one hand, is presented the capacity of the political leaders in order to react in an efficient way in a growing competition on the political market (managerial science as a hard part involved in politics). On the other hand is exposed the ability of negotiations in the crises, of political conflict or in the process of a political coalition constitution (managerial art as the soft part involved in politics). In addition, of these two facets, Laurence E. Lynn is presenting the actor, the politician, the administrator for the political and public organizations, considering political management also a profession¹¹.

According to Kolesnikov and Semenov's research, the political management consists of a series of directions: image management (image making, electoral management, the management of conflicts and political crises, the establishment of political alliances, lobby skills, organizing political campaigns and political advice). The state is the main subject of political management. Also, the subjects can be political parties, political elites, and the political leaders. Kolesnikov and Semenov are giving an important role in the political management system for the Public Relation (PR).¹² They are presenting in their paper the opportunities of applying PR skills in the political management. However, with this research we intend to detach the PR from this system, positioning it as a new self-dependent direction in the political science, useful and applicable in contemporary political processes.

Political management is identifying reasonable solutions for various difficult or contradictory situations in the field. Currently, we can distinguish the following types of political management:

1. The image making or the construction of the political leader image, attractive for the great mass of the population
2. Electoral skills as a system of organization of the electoral campaigns
3. Political branding - positioning a set of symbols and images in the collective consciousness capable of unifying the supporters.
4. Skills of the establishment of the political alliances
5. Lobby skills¹³

⁹ ax Weber, *Economy and society*, Paris, Plon, 1971.

¹⁰ ryce J., *The American Commonwealth*, London & New York: MacMillan and Co., 1895, p.4.

¹¹ Lynn, E. Jr., Laurence, *Public Management as Art, Science, and Profession*, Chatham, New Jersey: Chatham House Publishers, Inc., 1996.

¹² Kolesnikov, *Political Management*, SPb: Sankt Petersburg, 2013.

¹³ Pushkarev, *Political Management*, SPb: Sankt Petersburg.

The political management is representing a practical activity, aimed to get some political objectives. The management of the political PR has the following goals:

- Consolidating the credibility and the authority of the political actor
- Enlarging the number of the political actor's sympathizers
- Influencing the electoral citizen's options
- Making and promoting an attractive image for the political actor
- Creating the blocs and political alliances
- Influencing the political opponents, wherewith the subject of political management is in conflict.¹⁴

Historical aspects of the national political PR roots

In searching national PR roots, we were inspired by Russian scientist Vladimir Medinskii research, which is considering the ancient chronicles as the first models of PR.

Thereby, researcher Vladimir Medinskii is writing that the PR expression has appeared in the Russian linguistic circuit a few decades ago, but the art of managing communication appeared in the period of domination of Vladimir Monomah and has evolved till the Iosif Stalin's epoch.¹⁵

Vladimir Monomah was the subject of the Russian heroic epos ballads, being known by the name Vladimir Krasno Solnâško. The mother of this big Russian knyaz (knyaz: a historical Slavic title used both as a royal and noble title, usually translated into English either as Prince) was the true Princess of the Byzantine Empire, the daughter of the byzantine King Constantin Monomah¹⁶. At the end of the fifteenth century, Monomah has become the most requested character of Russian history. The John III, who liked to realize chronicles for political purposes, asked the historians to link Multnomah's name by the kingdoms of the Russian Tsar, received allegedly by Prince Vladimir as a gift from the Byzantium Emperor. This way is made not the Russian history, but the history of PR in Russia. From this is rooted the conception about Moscow – the third capital of the Roman Empire, which serves more than five centuries.

An attribute of Vladimir's power, which has become a strong PR-istic symbol, is the hat of the great Prince Vladimir Monomahul, dated since XIII-XIV centuries. This fur hat with flaps down over the ears was worn from XV till XVII century by Russian tsars at the coronation ceremony. Thanks to its weight, royal hat have spawned a popular proverb evoking the difficulty to govern the country: "It is hard to wear Monomah's hat."

The byzantine origins of the Romanian Voivods (warlords) are presented in one of the last big works of the Romanian scientist Nicolae Iorga – "Byzantium after Byzantium". In Iorga's approach, Byzantium is defining lapidary some of the most dramatics centuries of the universal history. He points equally to the on the

¹⁴ Gregory, *Planning and Managing PR Campaigns*, Iasi, Polirom, 2009, p.13.

¹⁵ Medinsky, *Wretched and genius PR from Rurik till Ivan the Terrible*, Sankt Petersburg, 2008, p.129.

¹⁶ Ibidem.

background of the large part of Europe summarizing all the best things that Old World has offered.

In Byzantium after Byzantium is interfering excellent two directions of general and national history, illustrated by scientist and also those two beliefs - the universal vocation of Southeast Europe and the Romanians' role in the accomplishment of this vocation, avowed by the thinker. We are discovering in his work: clerics, a man of learning, merchants, proconsuls, but the most important are the voivods.

Thus, the illustrious scientist writes that from the autonomies the most strong and efficient, long before the Christian communities from the mainland or islands, from the Athos or oriental patriarchates, are Moldavia and Romanian Country. Iorga is the person who gives us the definition of the Moldavia's Phanariots: "Nicolae Mavrocordat is a Phanariot. That means mainly one thing: that the source of power is baked in the old byzantine capital".¹⁷

Starting with the historic method and researching criteria used by Medinski, we can affirm that the chronicles written in and about Moldavia can be considered as the origins for the actual autochthonic political PR, samples of preservation of country and ruler image.

On this line, a precursory work for the modern PR is representing The Chronicles of the land of Moldavia by Grigore Ureche who is describing the legendary foundation of the Moldavian feudal state (1359) and the lives of the rulers, from the Dragoș-Vodă until Aron-Vodă.

The author is presenting the portrait of the Moldavian ruler Ștefan cel Mare, who with his actions was an intuitive genius of the PR, in a modern approach.

"Was this Ștefan Voda a man not big in stature, angry and rather shedding innocent blood; In the war things was skilled and where was needed he was involving himself."

The pages of Ureche's Chronicles have generated precursory messages for the modern political PR of the country and its rulers. The legend about Moldavia's apparition in The Chronicles of the land of Moldavia says: Walking through the mountains with the animals the Shepherds from Ardeal discovered a beast called aurochs. And after a long chase, they arrived at a plain of water. The dog who chased the beast has cracked. The dog's name was Molda and some named the river Moldavia, in the name of the dog.¹⁸ The Chronicles of the land of Moldavia contains testimonials about the reign of Alexandru-Vodă cel Bătrân, about his sons Ilies-Voda and Ștefan-Voda, about the reign of Ștefan-Voda cel Bun, the son of Bogdan, about the throne from Suceava and Putna: In the tenth year of his reign, in 1466, July, 10 he started to build Putna Monastery the glory of God and the Virgin Most Pure Virgin Mary.¹⁹

Another source of modern political PR is the work of Miron Costin „The Chronicles of the land of Moldavia”, succeeding Grigore Ureche's narrative. The

¹⁷ N., Iorga, *Byzantium after Byzantium*, 1988, (<http://ro.scribd.com/doc/3350463/>), p. 253.

¹⁸ Gr., Ureche, *The Chronicles of the land of Moldavia*, Chisinau, Literatura Artistica Publisher, 1988, p. 12.

¹⁹ M., Costin, *The Chronicles of the land of Moldavia*, on www.romaniainsociety.mareleboian.com/book/cronici/Costin%20M, p.69.

Moldavia's Chronicle by Miron Costin begins with 1595 till 1661. The author was born in 1633, therefore the last part of the chronicle can represent genuine memories. The chronicle begins with the crowning of the Ieremia Movilă (1595).

The second chapter is about Mihai Viteazul Voivode, his fights with Turkey, the conquest of Ardeal, Moldavia, fights with Poland. The chronicle ends with the reign of Stephen, son of Vasile Lupu (1559-1661).

Miron Costin's research contains details not just about wars and reigns changes, but also about the fights between boyars, characters, intrigues and reforms.

No historian can't miss the chronicle of Miron Costin for study Moldavia's history from the beginning and the middle of XVII century.

Regarding the next era of 1661, the year of ending of Miron's Chronicle has appeared a set of narrative chronicles and sources: The Chronicle of the land of Moldavia from Istrate Dabija coronation until the second reign of Antiochus Cantemir.

Dimitrie Cantemir's Description of Moldavia also hides roots of political PR: country and rulers image. Description of Moldavia is a composition of three separate compartments: I. Geographical part; II. About State ruling (About the way of ruling in Moldavia land; about the choice of rulers in Moldavia land;²⁰ About the acknowledgment of the reigning and its removal from the throne; About de reigning's funerals; About the law in Moldavia land); III. About the church rules.²¹

However, we can't slight Bistrita' Chronicle, as a primary source of documentation for the Moldavian chronicle war-lordss. The Chronicle Since when began, with the will of God, Moldavia land or The Chronicle from Bistrita. This chronicle, find, published and translated by Ioan Bogdan in the book "Inedited Chronicles related to the History of Romanians" is providing information's about events occurred between 1359 and 1507. It is supposed that the text belongs to a monk from the Bistrita Monastery, founded by Alexander the Great. The Chronicle consists of four parts. The first part is presenting the years of ruling of Moldavia's land voivodes from the Dragos til the Alexander the great. Part II is referring to the Alexander the Great's ruling and is ending with the Coronation of Stefan cel Mare (Stephen the Great). The IIIrd part – the most important and extended – includes the reign of the Stephen the Great, bringing praise to the ruler and contain details about voivod's court. Part IV begins with Bogdan, the son, and successor of Stephen the Great - and ends abruptly 1507 in the middle of a sentence

The image of the Voivods and of Moldavia land is presented also in The Moldavian-Polish Chronicle (1359-1457)²² and the part about Moldavian is

²⁰ The reign is given to Moldovan rulers by the Ottoman Porte or High Porte. Right that this reign is so unstable... In the way that works to the Moldavians, the Osman's has demonstrated clear the adage that is saying about them they aren't going at the rabbit's hunter with the greyhound, but with the carload. From Dragos, the founder of Moldavia, till Stephen the Great, the reigns were inherited, even under Turkish domination. After the end of Dragosh dynasty and till the period of Movila dynasty, the Turks weren't involved in the choosing of the Rulers.

²¹ D. Cantemir, *Description of Moldavia*, on

<http://www.lecturirecenzate.ro/2012/02/descrierea-moldovei-cantemir-1/>

²² <http://documents.tips/documents/cronica-lui-stefan-cel-mare.html>.

extended till 1552. This is kept in three manuscript form XVI, XVII and XVIII centuries. The thread of events starts in 1352 (the date of the establishment of Moldavia land) and ends with the 1564 year. These historical works come to support the existing of the deep roots of the political PR phenomenon.

The evolution of the political PR

There are many definitions for the Public Relations (PR) concept. The pioneers of the institutionalization of the public relations are considered Edward L. Bernays, Sam Black, Leon Baxter and Ivy Ledbetter Lee. The classical definition of the PR was proposed by Sam Black in his book. What is the PR? The PR, is mentioning the author, is the art and science of achieving harmony with the environment through mutual understanding based on truth and full information. Some researchers find this definition too idealistic, starting from the hypothesis that there is not always a "mutual understanding". This is why Edward L. Bernays, which is considerate a legendary figure in the public relation activities, is moving a bit the accents, considering that the PR is representing all the efforts directed to changing the society's beliefs and attitudes, and also the activities connected the harmonization of the interests of an organization with whose of the audience, of the society and vice versa.²³

Ivy Ledbetter Lee is considering that the fundamental purpose of PR consists in awake to the people the belief in the noble and honest purposes of the corporation, to show the model of searching trusting relationships with the public, the society. This purpose can be reached using true, exact and benevolent information, launched by a social institution which is operating with this kind of information and which is using in this truthful and beyond reproach facts.²⁴ Precisely these principles were the basis of well-known "Declaration of principles", which will substantially influence the further evolution of the public relations.

The definition proposed by Rex Harlow shows the proportion between management and PR: The public Relations are the managerial distinct function, which helps to establish and maintain some mutual limits of communication, to the reciprocal acceptance and to the cooperation of the organization with its audience. They involve the management of the problems helping the managers to be informed about the public opinion and to respond to the public opinion request. They define and emphasize the manager's duties in order to serve the public interest. They serve as a warning system, which helps the managers to anticipate environmental trends. They are using as the main instruments the research and the communication, based on the moral principles.²⁵

Heinz Flieger's definition is emphasizing the potential of communication of the PR: The Public Relations are understood as being functional actions, which contribute to the maintaining and developing of the pluralistic systems prospects. Public Relation comprises informational, communicational and interactive

²³ Ed. Bernays, *Crystallizing Public Opinion*, Bucharest: comunicare.ro, 2003.

²⁴ L. E. Lynn, *Public Management as Art, Science, and Profession*, Chatham, New Jersey: Chatham House Publishers, Inc., 1996, p.32.

²⁵ Rex Harlow, "Public Relations at the Crossroads", *Public Relations Quarterly*, Vol. 8 nr. 4, pp. 551-556.

possibilities, capable of assuring a transparent and opening climate, both in interior and outside of the institution.²⁶

The end of the '60 and the beginning of '70 years demonstrates an informational explosion in the PR' field. Global information phase begins.

In our opinion, the end of the '70 and the beginning of '80 years stands out through the strengthening imagological aspect of the political PR, during the electoral campaigns. At the beginning of the years '90, R. Denton and G. Woodward treat the Public Relations in politics as an informational management.

In the author's opinion, the information is a resource of power which skillfully used, can have a major role in the public opinion management. Information means power and the control of the information represent the first path of the propaganda. The information can be distributed freely in a democratic government, but also can be suppressed, censored, sorted or manufactured, according to the particular interests of the government and state bodies.²⁷

Therefore, the phenomenon of information management implies the appeal to the explicit and hidden methods of information's manipulation by the persons with the leading positions. Certainly, the political parties from the opposition can use this form of public relations, but it is the utmost important for the ruling party, which taking advantage of government resources information management can use them for influence significant the public opinion.

McNair Brian calls for the approach of the political PR as a media management. Media Management aims to maximize the access of the politician to free media exposure. This means, first, the organizing of the events (mediates) tempting for media that maintain at the high-level public attention toward the party. This activity, on the one hand, is maintaining the visibility of the party, and on the other – presents the problems and the solutions proposed by the party in a particular field. On this line, media management can be defined as problem management. The term "media management" refers to the wide variety of practices used by the political actors in order to control, manipulate or influence media institutions through methods that correspond to their political aims. For the politicians that means offering to the media organizations all that they are searching in terms of news or shows, while exerting some influence on how this thing is publicized and presented to the public.²⁸

Thus, media management may be associated with activities related to the organization of "pseudo-events", in which category are included the press conferences also. The press conferences are organised for raising the level of media exposure. They offer the opportunity to the politicians to set the agenda of the media and to influence this way public debate both during election campaigns and in between elections. For example, in the US beginning with years '60, when John Kennedy's adviser, Pierre Salinger held first press conferences live on TV, it became a tradition for the presidential institutions.

²⁶ F. Rus, *Public Relations. Tools and Techniques*, Cluj, 2011, p.9

²⁷ R. Denton, Woodward G. *Political Communication in America. Praeger*, New York, 1990, p.42.

²⁸ R., McNair, *An Introduction to Political Communication*, Iasi, Polirom, 2007, p.180

In the Great Britain, for example, during the electoral campaigns, itch party begins his day by organising a press conference, exposing that way the topic for the debate for on that day.²⁹

A relevant study contains the J. Gerstle's monograph on the political communication "La communication politique", which reflects the frequency of press conferences of several American presidents and of the French head of the state Ch. De Gaulle.³⁰

Table 1. The comparison of the frequency of the press conferences between several American presidents and the French President Ch. de Gaulle

President	The number of the press conferences	Number of month	Monthly periodicity
Eisenhower	190	96	1,97
Kennedy	63	34	1,85
Johnson	135	62	2,17
Nixon	39	67	0,58
De Gaulle	18	130	0,13

Source: J. Chlaby

Crystallizing Public Opinion is the first book to focus United States for example on the essence of the public relations and has become a reference work in the field.

Published in 1923, Bernays' book has the possibility to draw the action aria of public relations, to explain the ascendant dynamic which is based on the need of public relations and its value, to determine the proportion between various audiences – key element in shaping public opinion – and the organization from the public space, to define the set of the specific techniques proper for the public relations activity.

But, the most important land for PR activity is the public opinion, according to Bernays. The author is analyzing the interaction of the public opinion with the forces that contribute to its forming: the public and the press. Public opinion is the result of individual opinions – sometimes consensual, sometimes conflictual – of the people who constitute the society or any social group. Bernays is referring to the Lipmann's study dedicated to public opinion, to demonstrate which public opinion making methods are being used in PR.

Walter Lippmann quotes three ways to obtain cohesion of the particular and local interests that is creating national and social unity. The PR adviser is using just the last one. The first method described is about „the financing and subventions”. The 2nd is “governing by terror and subjection”. The third method is „the governance based on an informational system, analysis and responsibility,

²⁹ Ibidem.

³⁰ J., Gerstle, *Political Communication*, Paris, Armand Colin, 2003, p.68.

developed to the point that „knowledge of circumstances and reasons of State” is general.³¹

The secret of the great statesmen’s is that they know how to calculate these principles. “The method of educating by informing”, on which, The United States, for example, have rallied mostly have stood out by creating, during the war of some institutions like The Committee on Public Information, also known as the CPI or the Creel Committee.

Public Relation adviser have presented to the public, in media outlets chosen by him, the necessary information for understanding the national goals and ideals linked to war. George Creel and his organization covered large groups representing all parts of the nation, by all methods of modern communication. But even in the United States, never renounced to the other two ways of gaining cohesion.

J.E. Grunig and T. Hunt scientific approaches were contributed to the conceptualization and identifying of distinct PR phenomenon. At the end of 90’s past century, in the “Managing Public Relations” (1984) book, Grunig and Hunt were presenting for the first time for models of public relations which reflects, in fact, the history of PR: press agent model, public information model, two-way asymmetric model, two-way symmetric model.

Press agent model have appeared in 1850 and is corresponding with the period when the public relation practitioners were mostly concerned with gaining the reputation for their organization or client. The main objective of this activity was to control the public and obtain more advertisement. The model of public information has begun in the beginning of XX century when the PR practitioners have taken information activities on organization’s life. Distributed messages are correct and based on the organization realities. The first two models presented till now are based on a unidirectional communication (from the organization to the public) and didn’t imply researches and strategic planning activities.

The two-way asymmetric model appears in 1920 and is present even in our days, especially in the business field. In this model of public relation practice intervenes scientific researchers and using of sociological, psychological, and linguistic data, in order to convince the public of the correctness and efficiency of the organization activities.

Communication is asymmetric because its duty is just influencing the public, without seeking the transformation of the institution.

Two-way symmetric model is launched between 1960 and 1970. In this case, the purpose of the PR practitioners is to obtain a mutual understanding between two partners. The specialists rely on public research and are using modern models from the theory of communication for planning and evaluation of the PR programs.³²

The institutionalization of PR in the Republic of Moldova

In the Republic of Moldova, PR institution was strengthened with the Presidential institution. Media coverage and public image of the first President, Mircea Snegur (1991-1996), were managed by advisers (spokespersons) Dumitru

³¹ Walter Lippmann, *Public Opinion*, Bucharest: Comunicare.ro, 2009, p.36

³² J. Grunig, T. Hunt, *Managing Public Relations*, CL Hardcover, 1984, pp.45-46.

Tira and Vasile Grozavu. Direct meetings with the head of the state with media representative were rare. Often at the media meetings were participating presidential advisers. Spokespersons of the second President, Petru Lucinschi (1997-2001) have been Anatol Barber and, beginning with 2002, journalist Anatol Golea. Certain during his activity in the President's office, weekly, were organised the briefing of the spokesman. The Press Conferences held by the President at the end of the year and the usual cup of champagne in this context has become a tradition. Also, the press conferences held on the occasion of certain events, circumstances with socio-political resonance.

President Vladimir Voronin (2001-2009) also held regular press conferences. Spokesperson of the 3rd president was Natalia Veshanu. In contradiction to his predecessor, she was less present in the media, preferring to give the priority to the President. If overlook interim presidents, the Fourth president after the declaration of sovereignty, Nicolae Timofti, till now is the most temperate President in the relation with the media. Usually, the communication with the media was realized by his communication adviser, the journalist Vlad Turcanu. President Timofti confirmed personally that he is less present in the media because he is „the men of concrete activities”.

President Nicolae Timofti deals with a different style of public relations. The head of state expresses his options through the messages and public statements released on special occasions. Thus, being known as a President with an anti-Soviet and anti-totalitarian speech, commemorating the 26th anniversary of the Declaration of Sovereignty of the Republic of Moldova in his statement was mentioned: „Since then, in the Republic of Moldova grown-up generations for which the URSS acronym is no longer associated with a superpower, but a simple phrase from history textbook that sits confirmation for a false ideology and totalitarian regime. It is the period when our country is trying to determine sovereign internal and external politics, its partners of development.

On the occasion of the Constitution Day, President Nicolae Timofti didn't missed the opportunity to plead for the maintaining the European course of the Republic of Moldova. „Our country made a great path on 27 of June 2014, by signing the Association Agreement with the European Union. What I want, with my sincere feelings of accomplishment, for me personally, for you - those present here today, and for all our citizens is that in the original text of our Constitution, to appear, as soon as possible, an element of novelty. A chapter with a distinctive title on European Integration preceded by the deep institutional and civic consciousness reforms.”

Presidential communication had a key role in term of the institutionalizing and developing political PR in the Republic of Moldova. Presidential communication is part of the political communication and is considered as possessing the highest level of symbolism. In his speech on the occasion of Europe Day, the head of state has transmitted a trenchant political message on the elimination of the political factor in de activity of the state institution of law,

about increasing the level of the culture and political consciousness, about a rational vote in presidential election, in autumn, 2016.³³

Camelia Benciu in her's work *Political Communication* is mentioning that the presidential communication designs all the practices and communication skills through which the Presidential institution and/or the President is disseminating the information of public and national interest. Presidential communication is, according to the author, one of the most ritualized forms of political communication. This conclusion is linked to the way of the perception of the information from the President side. President's interventions or conversations are unique moments, which become events or signs that on the political scene something of high importance is happening. Camelia Benciu considers that the President is "representing the nation, evoking or celebrating collective memory"³⁴

When President is addressing the nation, a nation with a specific history, he makes it in his quality of citizen, political leader and symbolic leader. As a symbolic leader, the President is addressing the collective nation, embodying collective values, characters, and aspirations. As a political leader, the President communicates in the name of a state. And, in his quality of citizen, he is addressing in the name of the public opinion.³⁵

Mouchon is formulating three models of communication, which are taking into account the interaction between President and mass media and the role of the public from the perspective of communication with the President. The authoritarian or dyadic model is the model in which the President is presented as an authority answering to the questions of a famous journalist on the essential points that are interested in the people.

In the Agora model, the questions the source of questions is a well-selected public, but that can't have a dialog. The role of the journalist is to select the persons who will address the questions, without speaking about the existent of a spokesperson of a public opinion.

The interactive model is for Mouchon, a model of presidential communication which is completed separated from the show logic. Opposed to the Agora model, the interactive model allows a dialogue between the public and President. In the Republic of Moldova, the heads of state preferred didactic model and, from time to time, Agora model, during the press conferences with well-selected journalists.

³³ Europe means democracy built on pillars of a participatory political culture. In this respect, we are set to awaken the civic conscience, raise the level of political culture. On 30 October, we are to elect the president of the republic by direct and universal vote. The participatory culture, in the spirit of European traditions, means, however, giving a conscious, rational, well thought out vote, but not one bought with "electoral alms." Whether we will move towards a European future or will choose the end of the conservation of the scourge of corruption and state institutions checked by the political factor depends on us. To do the change up to the end, our duty is to edify an authentic rule of law state, based on European principles and values, in which the dictatorship of law in the citizens' interest should dominate, not in one of the political parties or groups of interests. (<http://www.presedinte.md/eng/presa/presedintele-nicolae-timofti-a-participat-la-inaugurarea-oraselului-european-2016>)

³⁴ Carmelia Benciu, *Political Communication*, Iași, Polirom, 2006, p.24.

³⁵ Ibidem.

Joe Marconi brings into question another aspect of misunderstanding the term of public relations; the confusion with public information (publicity), “in the way that public relations professionals are press agents or produce public information materials and their only reason to be is to generate media attention.” The relationship with media is an important part of public relations, but the coverage of this new field is much higher. Under the umbrella of this phrase can be found: community relations, relations with customers and employees, issues management and crisis management plus a variety of specific activities: writing and editing of messages and speeches, counseling, research, the establishment of contact with various audiences.³⁶

"The humanization" technique in the political PR resources:

In the following, we will try to identify, elements of political PR, designed by image advisers of the image advisers of the first vice-president of the Democratic Party, Vlad Plahotniuc. Reference period is May-August 2016. We made a selection of the most impact events on public opinion. The image of the controversial businessman somehow is reminding about the US billionaire Rockefeller image and the first PR exercises, managed by journalist Ive Lee. Although in one case is invoked social context and in another – political one, I'm considering that PR advisers efforts can be compared.

In our analyses, we will proceed from the observation that V. Plahotniuc is the person who avoids appearing directly in the front of the press, even if he is the coordinator of the governance coalition Council.

Instead, his posts on the Facebook page are maintaining media coverage for his person, providing material for creating news for the national press. His PR advisers have chosen two techniques of placement in the public attention: the event and public declaration (rarely, press interviews). On 2 of August was posted V. Plahotniuc' statement with the topic: The modernization begins with us. In this text, the democrat is criticizing the actual system of parties from the Republic of Moldova, declaring that the system “is outdated and no longer meets the expectations of the population” and “the political class needs a deep change”. Identifying the problem he is proposing the solution: The politicians must descend again into society and those who lied have to get what they deserves”... “During several months we will speak with the people from our country and will analyze their desires and will find out ways to its materialization”, “we will search political instruments in developing of the new, modern political parties”³⁷

The sponsored post has 3,4 thousand likes and 298 shares.

On 22 of July, in a post on his page, we find out that V.Plahotniuc visited Mother and Child Institute to see how does it work - the campaign "A new life", initiated by the Foundation “Edelweiss” - Vlad Plahotniuc's Foundation. According to the project, during one year, at every birth, is offered a box containing essentials for newborns.³⁸

³⁶ Joe , Marconi, *Public Relations: the complete guide*, Iasi, Polirom, 2009, p.22.

³⁷ <http://plahotniuc.md/ro/blog/modernizarea-incepe-cu-noi/>(This sponsored post has over 3400 likes and 298 shares).

³⁸ <https://www.facebook.com/plahotniuc/?fref=ts>.

On May, 25, under the aegis of businessman Plahotniuc, in Chisinau took place the Economic Forum "Moldova in the new regional context", organized by "The Business Association of Moldova". The special guest of the event was the ex-president of the European Commission, Jose-Manuel Barroso. "We held an open and constructive dialogue with the representatives of the business sector. I propose to analyze together and find the best ways of cooperation with the state authorities, to improve the activity conditions for developing the local business. I believe that today's meeting will be favorable for a better development of Moldovan business from now".³⁹ On May, 3rd appear the first posts on working visit of Vlad Plahotniuc in the USA. During his visit, the democrat had a meeting at the State Department with Victoria Nuland, The Assistant Secretary of State for European and Eurasian Affairs. "We discussed the reforms held in the Republic of Moldova and about political commitment of the governing coalition to make all that is necessary for assuring the stability and the modernization of the country and"⁴⁰

The post had 623 likes.

Conclusions

PR becomes an essential part of political processes and transformations. Opposite to the commercial or institutional PR, the political PR is more performing and the stakes are higher. It is strengthening the trust.

The political PR can be treated today as a news direction in the political science field, taking a distinct place compared to the others tangential areas, like the political management and marketing. Communicational dimension – the elaboration of the messages and organizing the events represents the biggest asset of political PR.

The study in the field of the management of the political PR, including specimens of domestic political PR, gives us the possibility to identify the roots of this communicational model in the ancient chronicles. The Chronicles written by Miron Costin and Grigore Ureche, thanks to the texts that preserve the country image and the image of Moldovan voivods, are the source of instituting the first models of public relations in the political sphere.

In the Republic of Moldova, the institution of the political PR has strengthened with the establishment of the presidential institution. Media visibility, the public image of the presidents of the state, their messages to the people were projected by the spokespersons of Presidents, which has not yet used the PR notion.

As a result of the realised researchers, we are proposing the next definition for the political PR, adapted to the new realities: The political PR is a strategy of the communicational management and represents a complex and specific formula of organization mass communication process by influencing the public opinion - by using events and statements which aims:

a) The creation of a credible image for the political subject

³⁹ <https://www.facebook.com/plahotniuc/transfert imagine>

⁴⁰ <http://www.pdm.md/.../vlad-plahotniuc-avut-o-intrevedere-la-d...>

b) Positive perception of the message released by the political subject with mobilizing impact in specific socio-political contexts.

The political PR represents the interference and convergence of three subsystems: leader – image – public opinion, in which the political leader establishes the other two elements of the PR system. This conceptual triad conveys, in our opinion, the essence of the PR phenomenon.

REFERENCES

- Becciu, Camelia, (2006), *Political Communication*, Iași, Polirom.
- Bernays, Ed., (2003), *Crystallizing Public Opinion*, Bucharest: comunicare.ro.
- Boboc, I., (2003), *Organizational and managerial behaviour. Psychosocial and Political Foundations*, 2nd Vol.
- Burnham, James, (1941), *The Managerial Revolution: What is Happening in the World*, New York: John Day Co.
- Cantemir, D, *Description of Moldavia*, on <http://www.lecturirecenzate.ro/2012/02/descrierea-moldovei-cantemir-1/>
- Costin, M., *The Chronicles of the land of Moldavia*, on www.romaniasociety.mareleboian.com/book/cronici/Costin%20M
- Denton, R., (1941), *Woodward G. Political Communication in America*, Praeger, New York.
- Gerstle, J., (2003), *Political Communication*, Paris, Armand Colin.
- Gregory, A., (2009), *The Planning and Managing PR Campaigns*, Iași, Polirom.
- Grunig, J., Hunt, T., (1984), *Managing Public Relations*, CL Hardcover.
- Harlow, Rex, „Public Relations at the Crossroads”, *Public Relations Quarterly*, Vol. 8 nr. 4, pp.
- Pricopie, R., (2005), *Public Relations. Evolution and Perspectives*, Bucharest, Tritonic, 2005,
- Iorga, N., *Byzantium after Byzantium*, on <http://ro.scribd.com/doc/3350463/>.
- James, Bryce, (1895), *The American Commonwealth*, London & New York: MacMillan and Co.
- Laurence, E. Lynn, Jr., (1996), *Public Management as Art, Science, and Profession*, Chatham, New Jersey: Chatham House Publishers, Inc.
- Lippmann, Walter, (2009), *Public Opinion*, Bucharest: Comunicare.ro.
- Lynn, L. E., (1996), *Public Management as Art, Science, and Profession*, Chatham, New Jersey: Chatham House Publishers, Inc..
- Marconi, Joe, (2009), *Public Relations: the complete guide*, Iasi, Polirom.
- McNair, Br., (2007), *An Introduction to Political Communication*, Iasi, Polirom.
- Newman, W., (1964), *Administrative Action*, Prentice Hall Englewood Hills, New York.
- Oliver, S., (2009), *Public Relations Strategy*, Iasi, Polirom.

Puiu, Alexandru, (2007), *Management - Analysis and comparative studies*, Bucharest, Independenta Economica, p.17.

Rex, F. Harlow, „Building a Public Relations Definitions”, *Public Relations Review*, 2, no. 4.

Rus, F., (2011), *Public Relations. Tools and Techniques*, Cluj.

Tamas, S., (2002), *Political Management, elaboration of the politics and the government*, Bucharest, Expert.

Ureche, Gr., (1988), *The Chronicles of the land of Moldavia*, Chisinau, Literatura Artistica Publisher.

Weber, Max, (1971), *Economy and society*, Paris, Plon.

Kolesnikov, V., (2003), *Political Management*, SPb: Sankt Petersburg.

Medinsky V., (2008), *Wretched and genius PR from Rurik till Ivan the Terrible*, Sankt Petersburg.

Pushkarev, G., *Political Management*, SPb: Sankt Petersburg.

Web sources:

<http://plahotniuc.md/ro/blog/modernizarea-incepe-cu-noi/>;

<https://www.facebook.com/plahotniuc/?fref=ts> ;

<https://www.facebook.com/plahotniuc/> ;

<http://www.pdm.md/.../vlad-plahotniuc-avut-o-intrevedere-la-d...> ;

<http://documents.tips/documents/cronica-lui-stefan-cel-mare.html>.

MOBILIZING THE RURAL POOR IN NIGERIA THROUGH MICROFINANCE

Onyekeni, Alexander Ugbome*

alexonyekeni@gmail.com

Ihediwa, Nkemjika Chimee**

chimee2002ng@yahoo.com

Abstract: *It has been estimated that 80% of Nigerians live in the rural areas while 75% of the producers in most African countries, Nigeria inclusive, operate in the informal sector of the economy and that this sector is the sub-dominant sector for the majority of the population. What is not often said is that 15% out of the 20% estimated urban inhabitants are rural Nigerians who reside in the urban centres, but belong to the rural areas. Therefore, it sounds logical to state that Nigeria is a rural nation and that whatever should constitute real development is the development of the rural areas. In order to enhance the flow of financial services to this active sector, the Nigerian rural poor, Government has, in the past initiated a series of publicly-financed micro/rural credit programmes and policies targeted at the poor. The growing awareness of the importance of microfinance in the mobilization of the rural poor for economic growth and development as well as poverty reduction has effectively put this issue of microfinance on the politico-economic agenda of most developing countries. Microfinance is strategic to one of the hallmarks of the National Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy (NEEDS) which is the empowerment of the poor and the private sector, through the provision of needed financial services, to enable them engage or expand their present scope of economic activities, productive capacities or possibility frontiers and generate employment. This paper is divided into five main parts. Following from the introduction, the second part deals with the theories and models related to rural poverty and poverty alleviation while section three x-rays poverty in Nigeria. Section four deals with the concept of microfinance and its place in mobilizing the rural poor while the final part is a conclusion of the paper.*

Keywords: *Mobilizing, rural, poor, Nigeria, microfinance.*

INTRODUCTION

Nigeria is the most populous country in Africa, the eight in the world with over 166 million people, up from 140 million by 2006 census. She is richly

* An Independent Economist, Delta state Nigeria.

** Department of History & International Studies, University of Nigeria, Nsukka.

endowed with abundant human and natural resources but is still trapped in the poverty net. This situation is so disturbing and it presents a paradox considering the vast human and physical resources that the country is endowed with. It is even more disturbing that despite the huge human and material resources that have been devoted to poverty reduction by successive governments, no noticeable success has been achieved in this direction. According to a Nigerian Demographic and Health survey (2012, 2013)¹, Nigeria is a rich country with poor people as poverty in Nigeria has been a problem for more than 50% of the population in the past 10 years, with surges over 60%.

The major challenge facing many sub-Saharan African countries today is that of increasing levels of rural poverty. Poverty is largely situated in rural areas where the poorest people live. For this reason, efforts to reduce poverty have largely targeted rural areas. The rural areas of a region or country lie outside the densely-built up environments of towns, cities and sub-urban villages and their inhabitants are engaged primarily in agriculture as well as the most basic of rudimentary form of secondary and tertiary activities. It is largely a location in an economy which deals in agriculture and rural enterprises and it is a critical factor in nation-building.

The rural dwellers are unlike the righteous of the Bible; they are always forgotten by governments in Nigeria except politicians who go to them during general elections to solicit for their votes or criminal collaborations to win elections by all means and at all costs including their lives. The conditions of our rural places are so despicable that it becomes an act of statesmanship to live and work in the rural areas. In Nigeria's rural shanties mainly, and sometimes, some city or urban slumps, children are hungry, their bodies stunted and deformed by malnutrition. They cannot read or write; they are needlessly ill. They have to drink dirty water. Those living in Nigeria's mushrooming shanty towns such as Ajegunle, Oshodi, Ketu, Lagos Island, Agege – (all in Lagos), Ibadan, Kano, Onitsha, Benin, North-Bank (Makurdi), Okpai, Aboh (both in Ndokwa-East Local Government Area of Delta State), etc, live by stinking rubbish tips and heaps and breathe polluted air. Ours is an affluent society, yet many people remain so poor that they have difficulty in buying the basic necessities of life, such as food, clothing and shelter. In the midst of plenty, some live in dire need. Wonnacott (1983: 784).²

In the past, every successive government has approached the problem of rural poverty in ways they thought the problem could be handled. Government has, in the past initiated a series of micro/rural credit programmes and policies targeted at the poor. However, despite all attempts, there is still a high profile of poverty. This failure of orthodox rural development models to make any meaningful impact on the socio-economic conditions of the rural poor was mainly because some of the approaches were not designed and implemented on a

¹ Nigeria Demographic and Health Survey in <http://www.poverty.org/images/health-poverty-nigeria-map.gif>

² Wonnacott and Wonnacott, (1983), *Economics*, London, McGraw-Hill International Book Company, Second Edition, Pages 15, 784, 785, 838 in discussing Government Policies to Reduce Inequality to solve the problem of Poverty.

platform that guaranteed adequate and proper flow of financial services to Nigerian rural areas and consequently mobilize the rural poor. According to a VANGUARD report (2015),³ about 110 million Nigerians were still living below poverty line despite the policies of past governments to improve their welfare. It was, however, stated that the policies were wrongly formulated and as a result did not have direct impact on the people.

In Nigeria, rural poverty has become widespread, looking more like an eclipse on the enclave of Africa, and is one of the most notable features of the development experience during the past fifty years. This phenomenon has posed a serious challenge to the Nigerian government over the years with attendant consequences of deprivation of basic necessities of life. Although, there is poverty everywhere, it is essentially a rural issue; experts have therefore considered access to microfinance (micro-credit services) crucial to help local farmers invest in agriculture and small and micro enterprises, be it for crops, agricultural machineries, transport vehicles, etc.

The purpose of this paper amongst others are to: (i) Explore the meaning and various forms of poverty as well as the microfinance concept (ii) Establish some of the causes of poverty in relation to the rural areas and to expose the severity of the problem and; (iii) Show how some of these causes highlighted in the analysis could be solved using the concept of microfinance. The paper is structured along five main sub-heads. Following the introduction, section two covered theories and models related to rural poverty and poverty alleviation in Nigeria, section three reviewed poverty in Nigeria. In section four, we discussed the concept of microfinance while section five concludes the paper.

THEORIES AND MODELS RELATED TO RURAL POVERTY AND POVERTY ALLEVIATION

It is generally agreed that the rural sector has invariably lagged most in the rate of development and constituted a drag on national development as a whole. Despite the high number of development projects undertaken by national and international agencies within Nigeria, the living condition of the rural areas still remains deplorable as attested by many scholars studying the problem of the rural areas (Gbadamosi, 2001 in Saheed, 2010)⁴. Any discussion about poverty, and poverty alleviation, needs to begin with agreement on the definitions, or discourse, being used. This is very crucial to establishing criteria of success or failure of any poverty-eradication strategy. Yet, definitions of poverty vary widely and are often used interchangeably. This is in agreement with the views of Aiyedogbon and Ohwofasa (2012)⁵. According to them, poverty is not an easy concept to define. As a result, a range of definitions exist, influenced by different

³ The Vanguard Newspaper, (2015), "Over 100m Nigerians living below poverty line", quoting the address of the Vice President of Nigeria, Yemi Osinbajo, speaking at a courtesy visit by members of the Alumni Association of the National Institute for Policy and Strategic Studies (NIPSS), at the State House, Abuja on Wednesday, August 20.

⁴ Saheed, A.B., (2010), "Poverty Situation in Nigeria: An Overview of Rural Development Institutions" in *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences*, Volume 7, Issue 5, pages 351-366.

⁵ Aiyedogbon, J. and Ohwofasa, B., (2012), "Poverty and youth Unemployment in Nigeria, 1987-2011" in *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, Volume 3, No. 20 Special Issue.

disciplinary approaches and ideologies. The dominant Western definition since World War II has defined poverty in monetary terms, using levels of income or consumption to measure poverty and defining the poor by a headcount of those who fall below a given income/consumption level or poverty line' (Grusky and Kanbur, 2006 in Aiyedogbon and Ohwofasa, 2012)⁶. By this definition, people are considered poor if and only if they do not have sufficient income to enjoy a certain level of well-being. In the operational sense, a person is considered poor if his income or consumption is below a predetermined poverty line.

Most commonly, poverty is defined as a "state of being in which we are unable to meet our needs" (Watt, 2000:15)⁷. However, the concept of 'needs' itself is defined very differently across different cultures and generations, as technology and changing values alter perceptions of the pre-requisites of an acceptable standard of living. This indicates that the concept of 'needs' includes the notion of what is conventionally regarded as necessary to lead one's life as an integrated member of a particular society. Thus, in his *The Wealth of the Nations*, the eighteenth century Scottish economist, Adam Smith, recognized the importance of this point when he defined the ability to appear in public "without shame" as a major criterion of individual human welfare (Smith, 1776 in Khalid, 2010)⁸.

Although, the poor, as the Bible suggested long ago, are very much with us; the economic definition of poverty is inadequate income. Samuelson (1984: 75). Put differently, poverty is a lack of command over basic needs of consumption, meaning a state of insufficient food, clothing and shelter. However, in the views of Wonnacott (1983: 784)⁹, this does not mean that poverty is strictly an economic condition. It is a state of mind, a condition in which the individual feels helpless, unable to cope and even spending his life dwelling on his past failures. Therefore, poverty is a subject for sociologists and political scientists as well as economists. According to him, people are unable to cope because they are poor and that they are also poor because they are unable to cope. Poverty means that opportunities and choices most basic to human development are denied. The above presents one of the difficulties in studying poverty which is the chicken-egg problem. Thus, poverty can be viewed as an economic mess.

Citing the works of Professor Paul Collier, a Director of Research at the World Bank, Ibru (2000: 28)¹⁰, argued that if one is to compare the economy in the 1950s to that of the present day, average living standard is now lower and inequalities higher than they were in the 1950s'. Both suggest that poverty has

⁶ Grusky, D and Kanbur, R., (2006), "Introduction" *The Coceptual Foundations of Poverty and Inequality Measurement*, in Aiyedogbon and Ohwofasa (2012), which were studies on poverty and youth unemployment and poverty and inequality respectively.

⁷ Watt, P., (2000), *Social Investment and Economic Growth: Strategy to Eradicate Poverty*, Oxford, Oxfam G.B, page 15.

⁸ Adams Smith in his famous "The Wealth of Nations" as cited by Dr Sulaimon Khalid of the Department of Sociology, Usmanu Danfodiyo University, Sokoto, Nigeria, in his paper titled "The Politics of Poverty Eradication in Nigeria" presented at the Annual Conference of Nigeria Economic Society, December 2012.

⁹ Wonnacott, P. and Wonnacott, R., (1983), *cited works.*, page 784.

¹⁰ Ibru, C.A., (2000), "Poverty Alleviation from the grassroots: Problems, Prospects and Modalities", in *The Nigerian Banker, Journal of the Chartered Institute of Bankers of Nigeria*, July-December Edition, page 28,

increased in the country with a lower per capita income of USD361 compared to USD1,200.00 set by the World Bank for medium income countries. She therefore suggested the creation of a middle class to bridge the gap between the rich and poor.

Economic crises have frequently been accompanied by increasing income inequality as well as decreasing growth rate culminating into chronic poverty. The strong link between inequality and poverty appear to have been demonstrated by various scholars. It is therefore not surprising when Kolodko (1999: 34)¹¹ averred that “income inequality can be a political issue that provokes tensions and conflicts and creates an economic obstacle to durable growth”. According to him, centrally planned systems distribute income more evenly than do the market and transition economies. Both scholars hinged their arguments on the fact that the extent of poverty depends on the average level of national income and the degree of inequality in its distribution; they were, however, both silent on how much should be taken from the rich. Theoretically, an increase in GDP, *ceteris paribus*, is expected to lead to a decline in the poverty rate. But this has not been the case in Nigeria as there has not been any evidence of a decline in the level of poverty despite increases in Government expenditures over the years. What this means is that gross domestic product in Nigeria in the years under reference are either misplaced or misappropriated by the privileged few such that needed poverty alleviation programmes are either avoided or inefficiently executed. It also means that the economic growth process in the country itself is not productive and has not created equal opportunity or access for all. Even government programmes aimed at mobilizing the rural poor ended up benefiting only the rich. Further comments would mean that government has not been accountable to the people as its expenditure programmes did not have any root in the conditions of the people. This has led to a growing massive poor in Nigeria.

The above view is consistent with that of Todaro and Smith (2011: 128)¹². In their **Public-choice theory**, also known as the **new political economy approach**, they argued that governments can do (virtually) nothing right. This is because public-choice theory assumes that politicians, bureaucrats, citizens and states act solely from a self-interested perspective, using their power and authority of government for their own selfish ends. Citizens use political influence to obtain special benefit (called “rents”) from government policies (such as import licenses or rationed foreign exchange) that restrict access to important resources. Politicians use government resources to consolidate and maintain positions of power and authority. **Bureaucrats and public officials use their position to extract bribe from rent-seeking citizens and to operate protected businesses on the side.** Private properties are also confiscated from individuals using state power. The net result is not only a misallocation of resources but a general reduction in individual freedoms- and well being.

¹¹ Kodloko, G., (1999), “Incomes Policy, Equity Issues, and Poverty Reduction in Transition Economies”, IMF Finance and Development Journal, September Edition, page 34.

¹² Todaro, M and Smith, S., (2011), Economic Development, London, Addison Wesley, page 128.

We live in a world where several milestones have been achieved in research- new medicines and medical techniques have eradicated many of the diseases and ailments which plagued the rich world, yet in Nigeria and in Africa, some four million children under the age of five die each year, two-thirds of them from illnesses which cost very little to treat: malaria is the biggest killer of African children, and half those deaths could be avoided if their parents had access to diagnosis and drugs that cost not much more than ₦=300.00 (three hundred naira only) a dose; scientists can map the human genome and have developed the technology even to clone a human being, yet we allow more than 250,000 women to die each year from complications in pregnancy or childbirth. As women die, children also die at birth. According to UNICEF (2015)¹³, Nigeria loses about 2,300 under-five year olds and 145 women of child bearing age. This makes the country the second largest contributor to the under-five and maternal mortality rate in the world. Mortality rate measured in 2015 as published by the World Bank (2016)¹⁴ was estimated at 69.0%.

We live in a world where the internet in the blink of an eye can transfer more information than any human brain could hold, but each day, in Nigeria, some millions of children are not able to go to school. While we live in a country where few rich top government functionaries spend as much as the entire income of all the people of a state subsidizing the unnecessary production of unwanted foods, bogus non-self liquidating projects, fruitless security and frivolous trips overseas- to the tune of billions of Naira, hunger is a key factor in more deaths than the entire continent's infectious diseases put together. In Africa and in Nigeria in particular, there are pockets of top government functionaries who spend a sizeable portion of district council's budget feeding dogs, snakes and other forms of reptiles as well as engaging in frivolous overseas trips when hundreds of thousands of children are dying of hunger and diseases within their neighbourhood. We are faced by one of the most devastating diseases ever seen (HIV/AIDS), has developed the anti-retroviral drugs to control its advances, yet in Nigeria, where about 3 million people are infected, those drugs are not made generally available. That means a significant number of people will die of AIDS each year.

Although analyses of recent trends show that the country is making progress in cutting down infant and under-five mortality rates, the pace still remains too slow to achieve the Millennium Development Goals of reducing child mortality by a third by 2015. Preventable or treatable infectious diseases such as malaria, pneumonia, diarrhoea, measles and HIV/AIDS account for more than 70 per cent of the estimated one million under-five deaths in Nigeria (UNICEF, 2015)¹⁵.

¹³ UNICEF 2013 Maternal and Child health survey on Africa reported in 2015 in www.unicef.org/nigeria/children_1926.html.

¹⁴ World Bank Report (2016) on mortality rate in Nigeria measured in 2015. The rate was 72.0% in 2014 according to the report.

¹⁵ UNICEF, (2015) report on infant and maternal deaths.

FORMS OF RURAL POVERTY

There is poverty everywhere across the globe. Despite Nigeria's plentiful agricultural resources and oil wealth, poverty is widespread in the country and has increased since the late 1990s. Some 70 per cent of Nigerians live on less than US\$1.25 a day. Poverty is especially severe in rural areas, where up to 80 per cent of the population lives below the poverty line, and social services and infrastructure are limited. The country's poor rural women and men depend on agriculture for food and income.

Various forms of poverty exist in the rural areas. About 90 per cent of Nigeria's food is produced by small-scale farmers who cultivate small plots of land and depend on rainfall rather than irrigation systems. The poorest groups eke out a subsistence living but often go short of food, particularly during the pre-harvest period. The productivity of the rural population is also hindered by ill health, particularly HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis and malaria.

Women play a major role in the production, processing and marketing of food crops. Yet women and households headed solely by women are often the most chronically poor members of rural communities. Men have higher social status and, as a result, more access to schooling and training. In recent decades, the number of men migrating from rural areas in search of employment has increased, and the number of households headed solely by women has grown substantially.

Rural infrastructure in Nigeria has long been neglected. Investments in health, education and water supply have been focused largely on the cities. As a result, the rural population has extremely limited access to services such as schools and health centres, and about half of the population lacks access to safe drinking water.

Neglect of rural infrastructure affects the profitability of agricultural production. The lack of rural roads impedes the marketing of agricultural commodities, prevents farmers from selling their produce at reasonable prices, and leads to spoilage. Limited accessibility cuts small-scale farmers off from sources of inputs, equipment and new technology, and this keeps yields low.

As the population swells and puts pressure on diminishing resources, escalating environmental problems further threaten food production. Land degradation as a result of extensive agriculture, deforestation and overgrazing are already severe in many parts of the country. Drought has become common in the north, and erosion caused by heavy rains, floods and oil pollution is a major problem in the South-South and south-east. The rural farmers especially in the southern parts of the country are continuously exposed to the reckless and criminal activities of the Fulani Cattle herders who destroy their farms and often times, rape, maim and kill the farmers especially women and children.

Civil unrest also aggravates poverty. Religious and ethnic tensions continue to brew in different parts of Nigeria, erupting into outbreaks of violence and leading, in turn, to escalating poverty and malnutrition.

STATISTICS/INDICATORS

Social Indicators

Population, total (2014)	178,516,904.0
Population growth (annual %) (2014)	2.8
Population density (people per sq. km of land area) (2014)	196.0
Rural population (2014)	94,717,499.0
Rural population density (rural population per sq. km of arable land)	0.0
Rural population (% of total population) (2014)	53.1
Birth rate, crude (per 1,000 people) (2013)	41.2
Death rate, crude (per 1,000 people) (2013)	13.2
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births) (2013)	74.3
Mortality rate, under-5 (per 1,000 live births) (2013)	117.4
Life expectancy at birth, total (years) (2013)	52.5
Labor force, total (2013)	54,196,350.0
Labor force, female (% of total labor force) (2013)	42.4

Poverty indicators

Number of rural poor (million, approximate) (2014)	50,010,839.5
Rural poverty headcount ratio at national poverty lines (% of rural population) (2010)	52.8
Poverty headcount ratio at national poverty lines (% of population) (2010)	46.0
Income share held by lowest 20% (2010)	5.4

Education

School enrollment, primary (% gross) (2010)	84.8
Literacy rate, adult total (% of people ages 15 and above) (2008)	51.1

Health

Health expenditure, total (% of GDP) (2013)	3.9
---	------------

Physicians (per 1,000 people) (2010)	0.4
Improved water source, rural (% of rural population with access) (2012)	49.1
Improved sanitation facilities, rural (% of rural population with access) (2012)	24.7
Prevalence of HIV, total (% of population ages 15-49) (2013)	3.2

Source: World Bank Indicators,

<http://www.ruralpovertyportal.org/country/statistics/tags/nigeria>

The above indicators show how severe rural poverty is with a population of 94,717,499 million which represents 53.1% of total population of 178,516,904. It also shows that 52.8% of the population is at the national poverty line. The ratio of poverty for all less developed countries (LDCs) fell from 27.9% to 21.1%, but the ratio for Africa actually increased from 44.6% to 46.4%

Table 1. Average Growth Profile of Poverty and other variables

Year	Poverty	Agriculture	Manufacturing
1987-1991	44.0	4.4	6.9
1992-1996	54.3	2.8	-2.8
1997-2001	67.4	4.1	1.5
2002-2006	57.4	16.6	9.3
2007-2011	60.0	6.2	8.3

Source: NBS (2010); CBN Annual Report and Statement of Account (Various Issues)

The table above revealed that between 1987-1991, agricultural contribution to real GDP was 4.4 percent, manufacturing 6.9 percent and poverty rate averaged 44.4 percent. During the 1991-96, the real sector contributions declined to 2.8 percent for agriculture, -2.8 percent for manufacturing while poverty rate averaged 54.3 percent. In 1997-2001, the contribution of the agricultural sector to real GDP was 4.1 percent, manufacturing 1.5 percent and 67.4 percent for the poverty section. An increase for the real sector contributions between 2002-06 recorded 16.6 percent for agriculture, 9.3 percent for manufacturing and 57.4 percent for poverty rate. In the final period, there was a decline in contributions to real GDP from agriculture and manufacturing while poverty rate also recorded an increase. Thus, agricultural sector contribution was 6.2 percent, 8.3 percent

for manufacturing. There obviously seems to be a relationship between poverty and the capacity of farmers and manufacturers 'contribution to GDP.

Persistent poverty and oppression have led to hopelessness and despair in Nigeria. And "when governments fail to meet the most basic needs of their people, these failed states become havens for terror... in many states around the world, and poverty prevents governments from effectively controlling their borders, policing their territory, and enforcing their laws" as in Nigeria. NEPAD (2005: 19)¹⁶. What happens to the poorest citizen in the poorest country can indirectly affect the richest citizen in the richest country. If a free society cannot help the many who are poor, as the U.S. president John F. Kennedy once said, it cannot save the few who are rich.

Presently, in Nigeria, the rich people particularly the political **bourgeoisie class** build and own all the beautiful and luxurious apartments in their villages but cannot sleep in those apartments whenever they visit their hometowns, some preferring to visit their flats in the mornings, take their baths, exchange pleasantries with a few village folks and retire to nearby hotels in the night to avert the unsolicited visits or 'courtesy calls" by the 'small boys' at home.

The need for poverty alleviation (whether in the rural or urban areas) is perhaps one of those issues for which there is consensus amongst most Africans and Nigerians in particular. This broad consensus is understandable when one considers the indices of poverty in Nigeria. A sample taken from Vision 2010 committees' Report (September 1997) shows that average life expectancy in Nigeria is about 51 years whereas the average for developing countries is 62 years. Infant mortality rate in Nigeria is 84 per 1000 live births as against the developing countries average of 70 per 1000; mortality rate is 800 per 100,000 live births as against the developing countries average of 384.

Something new is truly happening. A few years ago it was common place for Nigeria and some African countries to be run as dictatorships; today such governments are a minority in the sub-region. Democracy has new life. In the past few years, Nigeria and more than two-thirds of the countries in sub-Saharan Africa have had multi-party elections- some freer and fairer than others- with a number of examples of peaceful democratic changes of government. War has given way to peace in many places.

Where change has occurred a new generation of political leaders is emerging, many of whom voice a new commitment to fighting poverty and to the common good of the people. There is reform of institutions across the country and continent. The old organization of African Unity (OAU), with its policy of "non-interference" in the internal affairs of other African States, has been transformed into the much stronger African Union (AU) which has a policy of "non-indifference" to the sufferings of the citizens in neighbouring countries who do not respect democracy, human rights and the need for peace. They have set up, as an arm of the AU, a programme entitled the New Partnership for Africa's Development (NEPAD), which sees better government as an essential prerequisite to Africa's development. The policy thrust of these developments is

¹⁶ New Partnership for Africa's Development (NEPAD), 2005 Economic Report on Africa, page 19

one aimed at mobilizing the rural poor and frees them from the bondage of poverty through good governance, wealth creation, employment generation and value re-orientation. In spite of these laudable initiatives, everything has remained poor in Nigeria. There is still the challenge of poor leadership, poor and inconsistent policies, poor and inadequate data for research and planning purpose, poor management of the economy and high corruption levels, etc. Nigeria currently faces the challenge of not meeting the millennium development goals (MDGs), especially the eradication of extreme poverty and hunger. Available statistics from recent survey in the country indicates that poverty is deep and pervasive with an estimated 70% of the population living in poverty ((Kalu and Nenbee, 2013)¹⁷.

THE NATURE OF POVERTY AND ITS PROFILE IN NIGERIA

As stated earlier, poverty has many faces. It is much more than low income. It also reflects poor health, education, deprivation in knowledge and communication, inability to exercise human and political rights and absence of dignity, confidence and self-respect (UNDP Human development Report, 2010)¹⁸. Another deprivation, economic provision relates to a decent living standard- this is represented by a composite of three variables namely the percentage of people without access to safe water, the percentage of people without access to health services, and the percentage of malnourished children under five.

The multidimensionality of poverty has been stressed and succinctly expressed in the Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development in the following manner:

“Poverty has various manifestations, including

- lack of income and productive resources sufficient to ensure sustainable livelihoods;
- hunger and malnutrition;
- ill health;
- limited or lack of access to education and other basic services;
- increased morbidity and mortality from illness
- homelessness and inadequate housing;
- unsafe environments; and social discrimination and exclusion
- lack of participation and exclusion.
- lack of participation in decision-making and in civil, social and cultural life”.

[World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 1995]

¹⁷ Kalu, E and Nenbee, S (2013), Micro-savings and poverty reduction in Nigeria: some field observations from Gokana Local Government Area of Rivers State, Nigeria, published in the *European Journal of Business and Management*, 5(17): 84-91.

¹⁸ A United Nations’ Development Programme (UNDP), 2010, Human Development Report on Nigeria 2008-2009: Achieving Growth with Equity.

Apparently, the multidimensional nature of poverty is what has given rise to the plurality of definitions and for now, the conceptualization of definition of poverty is still in progress.

The inadequate number of small and micro enterprises in the rural areas is traceable to general poverty. This further derives from inadequate microfinance to the rural communities. The dimensions of rural poverty differ in part from poverty in the urban areas, and these take several forms as can be seen in the following perspectives:

(a) Poverty in terms of income due to very low returns from agriculture (a consequence of high man/land ratios) when compared with many other occupations;

(b) Poverty in terms of good medicare which in some cases, have led to high infant mortality;

(c) Poverty in terms of quantity and quality of food consumed;

(d) Poverty in terms of what to wear and the quality of materials worn and in keeping what is worn neat, and increasing poverty in terms of what to wear at certain seasons;

(e) Poverty in terms of savings (high proportions of low income spent on food leading to very low savings);

(f) Poverty in terms of housing (in many cases, houses are roofed with thatches which have replacement propensities over short periods of time); sometimes, these thatches harbour snakes and other forms of reptiles and rodents in the living homes of people;

(g) Poverty in terms of drinking water, with respect to quantity and quality of water taken (in many places, there is complete absence of pipe-borne water and the people sometimes drink contaminated water from the rivers, streams and ponds containing frog and snake eggs, and in some others, where the facilities are available, they function infrequently).

At Okpai in Ndokwa-East LGA of Delta State, Nigeria, where the Italian oil giant, AGIP, has existed for over 45 years, the people still drink water from the ponds and streams which have suffered from serial oil spillages and gas pollution, they have no road and only saw electricity for the first time in 2015. Even the personnel engaged by the company to man the Independent Power Plant (IPP) all buy sachet and bottled water sold outside the premises of the power plant. The above is an expression of severe conditions of the rural poor.

When the IPP was commissioned in 2004 by the former President, Olusegun Obasanjo, he was flown to the site in a helicopter by a certain James Ibori who was then Governor of the state. The President did not ask questions about the access road to the plant.

(h) Poverty in terms of keeping the environment neat, a situation which is gradually becoming a national disease and has to be checked in both the rural and urban areas of many developing countries. The environmental condition of most places in cities such as Oshodi, Mushin, Ajegunle, Orile, Ijora, Ojo in Lagos and Onitsha, Nnewi in Anambra State and Aba in Abia State leaves little to be desired.

- (i) Poverty in terms of such modern communication devices as telephone (where they exist, they are often at huge costs to the people);
- (j) Poverty in terms of wage employment due to inadequate number of employment generating concerns outside agriculture which is made unattractive as a result of lack of basic amenities in the rural areas;
- (k) Poverty in terms of output per head owing to the use of crude implements for farming;
- (l) Poverty in terms of good motorable roads; the rural poor are worst hit;
- (m) Poverty in terms of educational opportunities (in many cases, incomes are so low as to support the number of children in school where the opportunities exist);
- (n) Poverty in terms of quality of tools and implements used in operations and scales of such operations;
- (o) Poverty that manifests itself in terms of prostitution, exposure to risks, corruption, street life as is common with 'area boys' of Lagos, Onitsha and Aba, garage touts in our commercial centres, living in squalor, shanties, shackles, acute malnutrition, living in overcrowded and often poorly ventilated homes, etc;
- (p) Poverty in terms of exposure and information, the most visible gap between the poor and the rich.

There are, in fact, other dimensions of rural poverty. The overall level is high though varying from one community to another, and in some cases, very severe poor conditions prevail. The statistics shows no changes for the better, as the rich ones get richer, while the poor ones get poorer. Thus, it seems there is no poverty alleviation in Nigeria.

The World Bank (2003) report on Africa identifies other causes of poverty in the sub-region viz: inadequate access to employment opportunities, insecurity, low wage, inflation, exchange rate instability, misdirected huge government spending, and the vexed issue of poor state of infrastructure such as electricity, transportation, water and telecommunications.

The country's poor rural women and men depend on agriculture mainly for food and income. About 90 per cent of Nigeria's food is produced by small-scale farmers who cultivate small plots of land and depend on rainfall rather than irrigation systems.

The poorest groups eke out a subsistence living but often go short of food, particularly during the pre-harvest period. The productivity of the rural population is also hindered by ill health, particularly HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis and malaria.

Women play a major role in the production, processing and marketing of food crops. Yet women and households headed solely by women are often the most chronically poor members of rural communities. Men have higher social status and, as a result, more access to schooling and training. In recent decades, the number of men migrating from rural areas in search of employment has increased, and the number of households headed solely by women has grown substantially.

Rural infrastructure in Nigeria which ought to support agricultural production has long been neglected. For instance, infrastural development to support agriculture in Otukpo area of Benue state by the Lower Benue/Plateau Basin Development authority and at Illah and Ewulu, both in Delta State of Nigeria by the Benin-Owena River Basin Development Authority (BORBDA) are a complete sham as budget provisions for construction of feeder roads mainly at the Illah farm site of the BORBDA were neither carried out according to project specification nor completed and the agency officials who were charged with such responsibilities under the last administration of Goodluck Jonathan are still walking about as though nothing wrong had happened, Investments in health, education and water supply have been focused largely on the cities. As a result, the rural population has extremely limited access to services such as schools and health centres, and about half of the population lacks access to safe drinking water.

Neglect of rural infrastructure affects the profitability of agricultural production. The lack of rural roads impedes the marketing of agricultural commodities, prevents farmers from selling their produce at reasonable prices, and leads to spoilage. Limited accessibility cuts small-scale farmers off from sources of inputs, equipment and new technology, and this keeps yields low.

Ibru (2000: 29)¹⁹ asserted that the shift in government policy from agriculture, the main employer of labour, to oil contributed to aggravating poverty. The drift adversely affected agricultural production resulting in a corresponding impoverishment of both rural and urban areas. Odozi (1996: 2)²⁰ agreed with Ibru (2000:29)²¹ when he described the above state of affairs occasioned by government singular policy as a “Dutch Disease”, which literally occurs when a rise in output and revenue of a mono-product such as oil leads to adverse effects on the other sectors of the economy. Reflecting on the reliance of successive governments in Nigeria on oil as a mono source of revenue for the funding of the Nigerian economy and its devastating effects on the people particularly the Niger Delta areas of the country, it makes good sense to echo the views expressed by Odozi (1996:2) and Ibru (2000:29) respectively above and call for diversification of the economy in order to reduce poverty whether in the rural or urban areas.

As the population swells and puts pressure on diminishing resources, escalating environmental problems further threaten food production. Land degradation as a result of extensive agriculture, deforestation and overgrazing are already severe in many parts of the country. Drought has become common in the north, and erosion caused by heavy rains, floods and oil pollution is a major problem in the south and south-east.

¹⁹ Ibru, C.A., (2000), *op.cit.*, page 29,

²⁰ Odozi, V., (1996), “Poverty in Nigeria”, Monthly Business & Economic Digest of United Bank for Africa Plc, Lagos, Vol. 19, No. 2 March/April.

²¹ Ibru, C.A., (2000), cited works., page 29

Civil unrest also aggravates poverty. Religious and ethnic tensions continue to brew in different parts of Nigeria, erupting into outbreaks of violence and leading, in turn, to escalating poverty and malnutrition (IFAD, 2014).²²

Available statistics reveals that the poverty incidence in Nigeria has been on the increase since the 1980s. As reported by the UNDP (2010), between 1980 and 1996, the percentage of the core poor rose from 6.2 percent to 29.3 percent, and declined to 22.0 percent in 2004. Aiyedogbon and Ohwofasa (2012)²³, citing the works of Omotola (2008) and Aigbokhan (2000), observed that about 70 percent of the population lives in abject poverty. There is the geographical dimension of poverty in Nigeria while poverty is higher in the rural areas than in urban areas. In 2004, the urban population with access to water was 67 percent, while it was 31 percent in the rural areas. In terms of sanitation services, 53 percent of the urban population had access to sanitation services and 36 percent in the rural areas. This is worse than the situation in Cameroon, South Africa, Zambia, and Zimbabwe (World Bank, 2009). Given the figures above, the rural dwellers in Nigeria grapple with difficult living conditions compared to the urban dwellers. This explains why there is prevalence of diseases among the rural poor in the country (Segun, 2010)²⁴. As observed by Garba (2006)²⁵, the world's per capita income as of 2003 was \$7,140. Comparing this to Nigeria's per capita income of \$290 makes the country one of the poorest in the world. This relegated Nigeria to the ranks of Togo (\$270), Rwanda (\$220), and Mali (\$210). Other indicators of development, such as life expectancy, for which Nigeria is ranked 155th out of the world's 177 countries, and infant mortality, for which Nigeria is ranked 148th among 173 countries, were consistent with Nigeria's low rank in income per capita (CIA, 2009)²⁶. Based on these facts, Nigeria has been classified as a poor nation; a situation which can be described as a bewildering paradox given the vast resource base of the country. According to Earth Trends (2003), in Aiyedogbon and Ohwofasa (2012)²⁷, 70.2 percent of the Nigerian population lives on less than \$1 a day, while 90.8 percent lives on less than \$2 a day. The total income earned by the richest 20 percent of the population is 55.7 percent, while the total income earned by the poorest 20 percent is 4.4 percent.

THE CONCEPT OF MICROFINANCE IN NIGERIA

The practice of microfinance in Nigeria is culturally rooted and dates back several centuries. The traditional microfinance institutions provide access to credit for the rural and urban, low-income earners. They are mainly of the informal Self-Help Groups (SHGs) or Rotating Savings and Credit Associations

²² IFAD, (2014), report of the International Food and Agricultural Development, in <http://www.ruralpovertyportal.org/country/home/tags/nigeria>

²³ Aiyedogbon, J and Ohwofasa, B (2012), *Op cit*

²⁴ Segun, O., (2010), "Gallopig Poverty in Nigeria: An Appraisal of the Government Interventionist Policies", *Journal of Sustainable Development in Africa*, Volume 12, No. 6, ISSN 1520-5509.

²⁵ GARBA, A., (2006), "Alleviating Poverty in Northern Nigeria", being a paper presented at the Annual Convention of Zumunta Association, Minneapolis, MN, USA, July 28-29.

²⁶ Being the 2009 World FactBook report of the CIA in Washinton, D.C

²⁷ Aiyedogbon, J. and Ohwofasa, B., (2012), *cited works*.

(ROSCAs) types. Other providers of microfinance include savings collectors and co-operative societies. The informal financial institutions generally have limited outreach due primarily to paucity of loanable funds.

In order to enhance the flow of financial services to Nigerian rural areas and consequently mobilize the rural poor, Government has, in the past initiated a series of publicly-financed micro/rural credit programmes and policies targeted at the poor. These commitment or efforts to alleviate rural poverty in Nigeria were reflected in programmes such as rural banking scheme, sectoral allocation of credits, a concessionary interest rate in respect of financing and development of Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs), the rural agricultural credit guarantee scheme (ACGS). Other institutional schemes were the establishment of the Nigerian Agricultural and Co-operative Bank (NACB), the National Directorate of Employment (NDE), the Nigerian Agricultural Insurance Corporation (NAIC), the Peoples Bank of Nigeria (PBN), Community Banks (CBs), Family Economic Advancement Programme (FEAP), Mass Mobilisation for Social Justice and Economic Recovery (MAMSER), Directorate of Foods, Roads and Rural Infrastructure (DFRRI), Better Life programme for rural women (BLRW), Family Support Programme (FSP). In 2000, the government merged the NACB, PBN and FEAP to form the Nigerian Agricultural Co-operative and Rural Development Bank Limited (NACRDB) to enhance the provision of finance to the agricultural sector, the sector believed to be housing majority of the country's poor. It also created the National Poverty eradication programme (NAPEP) with the mandate of providing financial services to alleviating rural poverty and also the National Economic Empowerment and Development Strategies (NEEDS), Nigeria's home-grown poverty alleviation model, which is anchored on the private sector and SMEs as the sector's growth driver.

Microfinance is about providing financial services to the poor who are traditionally not served by the conventional financial institutions. Three features distinguished microfinance from other formal financial products. These are: (i) the smallness of loans advanced and or savings collected, (ii) the absence of asset-based collateral, and (iii) simplicity of operations.

In Nigeria, the formal financial system provides services to about 35% of the economically active population while the remaining 65% are excluded from access to financial services. This 65 % are often served by the informal financial sector, through Non-Governmental Organization (NGO)- microfinance institutions, moneylenders, friends, relatives, and credit unions. Thus, microfinance directed at its clients- the poor person (one who has a meager means of sustenance or livelihood) and micro-enterprises (a business that require micro credit/loans to operate) play a critical role in poverty alleviation through youth employment generation, economic empowerment of the poor, wealth creation and redistribution of income. This ultimately has capacity for the recreation of the middle class which has long been propelled into extinction.

IMPROVING THE LATENT CAPACITY OF THE POOR THROUGH MICROFINANCE

Nigeria needs help. She needs help to take control of its resources to build the much needed capacity of the rural active poor to increase food production for self-sufficiency and exports. Nigeria, unlike East African countries, has many regions which benefit from a tropical climate with lush vegetation and a diverse range of crops that grow all year round. This highlights just how important agriculture is to reducing poverty.

Recently, fresh tomatoes which form part of our daily nutrition were smuggled (or imported?) into the markets from Ghana and Togo, pepper from Cameroon. Following an April 2014 statistical "re-basing" exercise, Nigeria has emerged as Africa's largest economy, with 2013 GDP estimated at US\$ 502 billion. Oil has been a dominant source of government revenues since the 1970s. Regulatory constraints and security risks have limited new investment in oil and natural gas, and Nigeria's oil production contracted in 2012 and 2013. Economic diversification and strong growth have not translated into a significant decline in poverty levels - over 62% of Nigeria's 170 million people live in extreme poverty. . Nevertheless, the Nigerian economy has continued to grow at a rapid 6-8% per annum (pre-rebasing), driven by growth in agriculture, telecommunications, and services. Even today as the services sector is taking off, agriculture remains an important aspect in the economy.

Several studies confirmed what was obvious to everyone: people with larger farm land, those with access to loans such as micro-credit or production assets, as well as people closer to local markets all showed much lower poverty rates than the rest. Since our statistics showed that the country's worst poor who form a higher proportion of the total population are engaged primarily in agriculture in the rural areas, integrating thousands of these households into local markets and teaching them more advance agricultural techniques and providing them with easy access to micro-credit will be a very essential or vital aspects to solving some of the problems of rural poverty already identified above. In many ways, this implies more intervention, at least to empower the rural populace by increasing their access to factors of production, especially credit, and to invest in basic infrastructure such as roads and cheap transportation so that people are given opportunity to go to towns and sell their crops.

Rural farmers in Benue, Nassarawa, Plateau and Taraba States in North Central Nigeria, Edo, Delta and Cross River States in South South Nigeria as well as those in South East, South West and other parts of far north, all face similar challenges outside weather conditions. Land preparation is a challenge in Nigeria; it is even more challenging in the South West and South-South with heavy logs in the forest. Aside the problem of land preparation, there is the challenge of access to micro credit. A rural farmer needs capacity to be able to increase the size of his farm. In all regions of the country where individuals engage in farming activities, a rural farmer who wishes to increase the size of his farm away from the subsistence level simply needs a means to get a tractor to prepare his land, buy inputs (improved seedlings and herbicides as well as

fertilizers- some of the forests do not actually need any form of inorganic manure as they have fallowed for more than 20 years).

There are several respects in which microfinance institutions could make interventions. First, they have to stop competing with the big commercial banks in whatever they are doing and focus their lending on rural farmers and micro entrepreneurs in the rural areas. Microfinance institutions could operate tractor hiring services on the side or partner with other operators for provision of this service, improved seedlings, agrochemicals (herbicides) and fertilizers who shall then provide these services directly to the farmers upon consideration for micro credits under the supervision of the microfinance agency, the farm itself serving as a collateral for the loan. This way, the problem of loan diversions would be mitigated.

Microfinance could be very important in the mobilization of the rural poor. This stems from the socio-economic roles they are expected to play in the economy. From the point of view of rural poverty alleviation, these include the following:

(a) Creation of Employment Opportunities: The cost per person employed in the small and micro industries (situated in the rural communities) is much lower than that of the large industries. Thus, rural microfinance provides a means of creating more rural employment opportunities at relatively low cost. This is one of the ways in which the objectives of the poverty alleviation programme of the Government are achieved, given that most rural employment opportunities are highly labour intensive. By providing employment opportunities, it provides a means to an end and thereby contributing to poverty alleviation. Thus, according to Odubanjo (2000: 34)²⁸, small and micro industries help to reduce poverty and inequality in the economy. This, by extension, derives from adequate microfinance. Because the capital required in setting up small-scale industry can be affordable and because the nature of such industries allows the employment of both unskilled and skilled labour force which abounds in the rural areas, it enhances the earning capacity of the rural dweller thereby reducing poverty and inequality gaps. This is an important role in any development process. The finance of rural cottage firms and small and micro industries are an integral part of a systematic human-resource approach to correct the course of African economic development. This strategy is typified by its investment programmes focused on the generation of employment and the utilization of the labour force in clearly productive activities.

(b) Development of Entrepreneur: The rural employment opportunities offered by rural cottage and micro industries through microfinance provide a training avenue for the creation of local entrepreneurs in several areas of economic activity. They also provide opportunities for talented youths and enterprising individuals of limited financial means who are eager to engage in activities that will develop the national economy.

²⁸ Odubanjo, K., (2000), "Relevance of Small Scale Enterprises in the Development of the Nigerian Economy", published in The Nigerian Banker Journal, Lagos, July-December edition, page 34.

(c) They also aid the process of redistribution of the unevenly distributed income and wealth which partly deepens the problem of poverty.

(d) They are capable of removing or reducing regional economic imbalance. This is possible by reducing the rush to the few developed centres of the country where the big industries tend to be located because of the availability of some basic infrastructure such as electricity, roads, telecommunications, etc.

(e) Most small and micro enterprises engaged in manufacturing serve as channels for import substitution and promotion of exports. Some of the micro enterprises situated at the rural areas are known to have attracted settlements into the locality thereby creating additional market opportunities for the people who are mostly subsistence farmers. This has further multiplier effect on the economy of the rural poor.

(f) Microfinance to the rural economy has indirect effect on increased agricultural production for increased food self-sufficiency by attracting youths and able-bodied men and women to farming in the villages.

The focus of microfinance to rural areas provides some levels of attraction to the youths to live and work there. This is because increased rural employment of factors of production will further increase agricultural produce which serve as inputs or raw materials for the agro-allied industries. These small industries, in turn, provide immediate or semi-processed goods for use by large-scale firms, some of which are engaged in the production of export commodities. These roles of small and micro industries clearly justify Government's support for rural microfinance.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The study entitled *Mobilizing the Rural Poor Through Microfinance* employed a descriptive analysis using secondary data and is crucial to the development of the Nigerian economy. It x-rays rural poverty issues and identified how microfinance could be used to solve some of the causes of rural poverty in Nigeria. The present study becomes so relevant when it is considered that poverty is persistent in the midst of plenty in Nigeria. This therefore, gives a different conclusion. Microfinance provides a great hope for dealing with some of the problems of rural poverty by providing financial services-small loans, business training, mentorship and micro-enterprise services to poor and low-income clients to help people living in poverty establish their own businesses, own and increase their farm size. By supporting these clients, microfinance enable them to increase their incomes and consumption levels, improve the standard of living for themselves and their children through better nutrition, health and education.

While the extant policies are well intended, the gap in the delivery of the objectives of microfinance for which the MFBs were born has been linked to undue politicking. For the policy to make the desired critical mass impact, we suggest that government and private organizations involved in this will do well to interface the programme with the intended beneficiaries. There should be an enabling legislation to encourage MFIs to concentrate on financing rural

agriculture to unleash the country's economic potentials. Finally, government should strengthen the regulatory and supervisory guidelines to ensure that MFIs are owned or established by individuals who have money to lend and not borrowers.

REFERENCES

Aiyedogbon, J. and Owhofasa, B., (2012), "Poverty and Youth Employment in Nigeria, 1987-2011". *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, Vol 3. No 20 (Special Issue-October 2012).

CIA, (2009), *The World FactBook*. Washington, DC. Central Bank of Nigeria Annual Report and Statement of Account (various issues)

Garba, A., (2006), *Alleviating Poverty in Northern Nigeria*. A paper presented at the Annual Convention of Zumunta Association, Minneapolis, MN, USA. July 28-29.

Grusky, D. and Kanbur, R., (2006), –Introduction: The conceptual foundations of Poverty and Inequality Measurement, in Grusky, D. and Kanbur, R. (eds.), *Poverty and Inequality*. Stanford, Stanford University Press.

Ibru, C.A.O., (2000), "Poverty Alleviation from the grassroots: Problems, Prospects and Modalities". *Lagos, Nigerian Banker*, July-December, page 28.

IFAD (<http://www.ruralpovertyportal.org/country/home/tags/nigeria>)

Kalu, E. and Nenbee, S., (2013), *Micro-savings and poverty reduction in nigeria: some field observations from Gokana Local Government Area of Rivers State*. *European Journal of Business and Management*. 5(17): 84-91).

Kolodko, G., (1999), "Incomes Policy, Equity Issues, and Poverty Reduction in Transition Economies", *IMF Finance and Development Journal*, September Edition, p. 34

Microfinance Policy, Regulatory and Supervisory Framework for Nigeria

In <http://www.cenbank.org>

New Partnership for Africa Development (NEPAD) (2005). *Our Common Interest*. Report of the Commission for Africa. <http://nepad.org.ng>; <http://www.endpoverty.org>; <http://www.villagebanking.org>

Odozi, V., (1996), "Poverty in Nigeria", *Lagos, Monthly Business & Economic Digest of United Bank of Africa Plc*, Vol. 19, No. 2 March/April, page 2

Odubanjo, K., (2000), "Relevance of Small Scale Enterprises in the Development of the Nigerian Economy", *Lagos, The Nigerian Banker*, July-December, page 34.

Regulatory and Supervisory Framework for Microfinance Banks (MFBs) in Nigeria. <http://www.cenbank.org>

Samuelson, P., (1984), *Economics*. London: McGraw-Hill Book Company, Page 76.

Saheed, A.B., (2010), "Poverty Situation in Nigeria: An Overview of Rural Development Institutions". *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences*, Volume 7, Issue 5, Page 351-366.

Segun, O., (2010), *Galloping Poverty in Nigeria: An Appraisal of the Government's Interventionist Policies*. *Journal of Sustainable Development in*

Africa, Volume 12, No.6, ISSN:1520-5509. Clarion University of Pennsylvania, Clarion, Pennsylvania.

Smith, A., (1986), *The Wealth of Nations*. Harmondsworth: Penguin

The PUNCH, (2006), "Access Bank Boss Highlights Roles of SMEs". The Punch Newspaper, Friday, April 28.

The VANGUARD, (2015), "Over 100m Nigerians living below poverty line". The Vanguard Newspaper, August 20.

Todaro, M and Smith, S., (2011), *Economic Development*. London: Addison Wesley, page 128

UNDP, (2010), *Human Development Report Nigeria 2008-2009. Achieving Growth with Equity*. United Nations Development Programme.

Watt, P., (2000), *Social Investment and Economic Growth: Strategy to Eradicate Poverty*, Oxford: Oxfam G.B, page 15.

Wonnacott, P. and Wonnacott, R., (1983), *Economic*. London: McGraw-Hill Book Company, p. 784

World Bank, (2008), *World Development Report 2009*

World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 1995

ETHIC AND DECISIONAL TRANSPARENCY IN THE ROMANIAN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

Gabriela Pohoată*

gabriela_pohoata@yahoo.com

Abstract: *The following article underlines the importance in identifying and adopting a new ethic and decisional transparency in the current especially corrupt Romanian public administration, updating the ethical law and the formation of civil servants at the European ethical standards. The administrative reform cannot be done without issuing new professional and morality standards. Our research starts from a clear and realistic analysis of the corruption phenomenon in the Romanian administration reality, which has outgrown social rationality. The existence of a system corruption in administration is an extremely serious fact, but not inevitable as long as they constantly act to sanction and diminish the phenomenon. The transparency of the processes in the public administration, especially those of decision making are crucial for keeping the corruption at acceptable limits.*

Keywords: *corruption, transparency, ethical law, code of ethics for public servants.*

All democratic countries have adopted a specific legislation that is meant to make the decisional process in the public administration more transparent.

Corruption is a constant phenomenon present in all countries, regimes or political systems, while being a characteristic for all historical eras. Still it has been observed that the corruption practices are different from country to country and, as a general consensus, in the western countries the corruption is less present. Corruption has multiple and diverse causes, this in turn determines specific strategies and measures to counter and diminish this phenomenon, especially in the public administration.

In one of the simplest definition, Peter Singer states that ethics is something that teaches us how to live. Sometimes, through ethics, we understand a “set of rules, principles or ways of thinking which tries to guide the activity of one group”¹. In other words “it is the systematic and rational attempts of how we must act”.

The morality of a society, a political system or of a public organization is represented by what it is considered positive or negative inside that group. It reflects the values that are important for the members and it is expressed through

* Prof. PhD. Hab., Faculty of Judicial and Administrative Sciences, Christian University, "Dimitrie Cantemir", Bucharest.

**Translator Ionuț Tatu, graduate of the Master's Degree in Public Policies, University of Bucharest.

¹ P. Singer, *Ethics*, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1994, pp.3-4.

laws, rules, policies or procedures, and also by informal norms.² Singer does not embrace this opinion, he believes that by looking at the etymology of both notions (*ethos* gr. for ethics and *mores* lat. for morals) we observe that their meaning is identical or at least sufficiently close to be considered synonyms. However, we can say that in spite of the academic debate, in common language, both words are mostly used as synonyms.

Ethics and the Romanian public administration

The first theories regarding ethics were formulated in antiquity. This field of knowledge has been a pursuit for many philosophers, but the ones who created the first models are the two great Greek thinkers, Plato and especially Aristotle. The latter wrote three treaties on morals that are still under controversy regarding the authorship; however there is a consensus over one of them, *Nicomachean Ethics*.³

According to the American author Rosalind Hursthouse, this view of ethics shows the individual's virtue, more precisely his moral code. Thus, virtue ethics is considered to be an approach which: "1. Is preoccupied rather with the individual quality than the actions that he must do; 2. raises the question: what type of person must I become instead of what actions should I perform?"; 3. Is using concepts of good or virtue rather than just, duty, responsibilities; 4. Rejects the idea that ethics is coded to serve as guide for certain actions.⁴

Returning to Aristotle's view, man is by nature driven to find well-being. Meanwhile, "the well-being is not something concrete as money, honour or pleasure". Aristotle uses a difficult word to translate, *eudaimonia*, which may mean *blessing, happiness or prosperity*, a mood in which you feel good and you do good, while feeling good. Virtues are exactly those qualities that help the individual reach *eudaimonia*.⁵ Mankind does not possess these virtues by nature, only the innate ability to learn them while practicing them: "...none of the ethical virtues are inoculated in us by nature, because nothing that is innate could be changed by experience: for example, the rock, which nature gave a downward movement, could not learn an invert movement, so our virtues are not natural and also not against nature, but we are born with the skill to receive them and perfect them through experience".⁶

Throughout the learning process, what we accumulate from those around us, is affecting the way we are behaving in the future. Classic organizational theories started from the premise of "dehumanizing" the organizations, public or private. Max Weber, in his model of ideal bureaucracy, and Frederick Taylor, in his "Principles of Scientific Management", imagined structures in which the human

² De George, in Denhardt, R.B., *Public Administration. An Action Orientation*, Belmont: Wadsworth, 1999, p.116-117.

³ Some of the Aristotelian works are attributed fully or partially to some of his disciples.

⁴ R. Hursthouse, *On Virtue Ethics*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999, p.17.

⁵ A. MacIntyre., *After Virtue. A Study in Moral Theory*, Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press, 2007, p.147

⁶ Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, Bucharest, The Scientific and Encyclopaedic Publishing House, 1988, p.32.

factor was reduced a simple “cog” in a “gear”. Peoples could be replaced without affecting the functioning of the system. Behaviouristic theories have amended this approach, proving that there is a mutual influence between the organization and those who are part of it. Thus, the working conditions in an organization influence the performance of its members, but in equal measure the results of the organization are affected by the behaviour of those composing it.⁷

Similar approaches have appeared in the field of ethics, just that the succession was reversed. Human nature was considered for a long period of time the only or at least the most important element responsible for unethical behaviour. In other words, corruption or other forms of breaching the moral conduct appear when people prone to wrongdoing are in places of power. In the last 10 years the specialists’ opinion has changed because of the latest findings from studies on corruption, also from the act of fighting corruption.

A serious discussion about ethics in the Romanian public administration has never taken place. Following the Revolution in 1989, ethics has been mentioned only because of the forms corruption has taken in the public sector, and this only limited to the political speech. Of course, we can’t deny the existence of legal stipulations⁸, which can be considered true ethical norms through the prescribed conduct. Starting with the year 2000, the Romanian legislation has improved with stipulations meant to regulate the fight against corruption in the public administration and to stimulate ethical behaviour⁹. However, this is the biggest deficiency with which the majority of the modern administrations are confronting: the lack of regulation in the field of ethics, a theoretical framework to highlight the objectives, definitions and reference point for the research and practice in administrative ethics. Simply issuing legislation is a good start, but not enough to assure an ethical public administration. In Romania, at the moment we don’t have an official text that clarifies the concept of “ethics” and especially when it is applied in the public administration¹⁰.

As mentioned before, the current legislation has improved after the year 2000, one could say that Romania is a state with anti-corruption laws at

⁷ *Ethics in Public Administration*, fspac. L. Radu, ubbcluj.ro/modle/...php/.../Etică%20in%20ap...2013-2014.

⁸ **Law no. 115 of 6 October 1996** for declaration and control of assets of officials, magistrates, some people with management and control of civil servants, **Law no. 188 of 9 December 1999** on the status of civil servants, and **Law no. 215 of 23 April 2001** local government.

⁹ We mention among them: **Law no. 78 of 8 May 2000** for preventing, detecting and sanctioning corruption; **Law no. 544 of 12 October 2001** on free access to public information; **Emergency Ordinance no. 43 dated 4 April 2002** the National Anticorruption Directorate; **Law no. 161 of 19 April 2003** on measures to ensure transparency in the exercise of public dignities, public functions and in business, prevent and punish corruption, as amended by **GEO no. 40/2003**; **Law no. 52 of 21 January 2003** on transparency in public decision; **Law no. 571 of 14 December 2004** on the protection of staff in public authorities, public institutions and other units who report violations; **Law no. 7 out of 8 February 2004** on the Code of Conduct for civil servants; **Law no. 144 of 21 May 2007** on the establishment, organization and functioning of the National Integrity Agency.

¹⁰O. Matei, *Etical Law in the Romanian Public Administration*, Journal of Public Administration and Social, “Vasile Goldiș” University, Arad, , no.4-5, 2010.

European level. Still, even if the legislative framework is competent, the mere regulation is not capable to assure the fact the Romanian administration is ethical. Fortifying rules doesn't guarantee ethical results.

Nevertheless, we need to highlight that today unethical behaviour is mostly considered a consequence of the context, lacking legislation or poor organization from the public institutions. To correctly understand the causes that lead to unethical behaviour leads to identifying the most efficient ways in battling it.

The importance of beating corruption results from analysing the effect that it has inside the public institutions and on the whole community.

First of all unethical behaviour and mostly the deeds that fall under the generic name of corruption have as a result inefficiency, a waste of all resources that are available for the organizations in the public administrations. This leads the organization not fulfilling all of its attributes, not to provide its services to the population and, if so, to provide bad quality service.

Another consequence of breaching ethical norms is the decrease in citizen satisfaction and trust towards public institutions. This mistrust could cause problems in implementing public policies or forms of public disobedience as the refusal to pay taxes or tolls, protest which could turn violently.

Administrative corruption

It is an undeniable fact that corruption in Romania's public administration has increased in the last period at alarming rates to an all high level, and this effect is not exclusive to public administration.

By conceptualizing corruption we consider analysing the report between corruption and law. Thus, moral norms could become official and be represented through applicable laws by the government authority. In this sense corruption is first and foremost a deviation from the law. Legal regulations forbid certain actions that label an individual as corrupt. The mandatory nature of law makes a person's action to be legal or illegal. However, if the regulations are scarce it can permit some individuals to act morally incorrect or unethical, but still legal.

Analysing the administrative corruption claims the approach of the phenomenon from the general to the particular, be it by taking into account the level at which it manifests or just from the perspective of highlighting a great variety of definitions. The simplest and most general definition is the following: corruption is the use of official public power for personal gains. *Transparency International* defines corruption as: "the incorrect use of competency entrusted by the state for personal gains".¹¹ Corruption understood as public power abuse for private gain may be of financial, material or immaterial order, influencing political ambitions or professional. Thus, the notion of corruption encompasses also the influencing the impartial process of decision making executed by any actor of the administrative system.

American authors, William L. Richter, Frances Burke and Jameson W. Doig compile possible approaches and definitions of administrative corruption. A first

¹¹ Definition given by *Transparency International Romania*,
http://www.transparency.org.ro/servicii/consultanta_juridica/index.html.

approach is defined in relation to the public interest: “We talk about corruption every time a person that holds a public office acts in favour on one after receiving from them a reward of financial or of any other nature that is not mentioned by law and thereby harming the public interest”.¹² The second type of definitions has at its core the concept of “public duty” or the “duty of the civil servant”, “a type behaviour that deviates from the official duty with the objective of personal gain”. As long as there are no confusions regarding to what “public duty” means, the acts of corruption can be identified with great precision.

A different category starts from placing the public sector activities in a market context. “Corruption implies the transfer from criteria established by laws and regulation to criteria that based their model on the free market”. Thus, the “price” which is established by laws or other regulation, the conditions a citizen need to fulfil to benefit from a service are abandoned for a request and demand principle, which implies the appearance of corruption. This definition is probably the most useful, since it permits the identification of both causes of unethical behavioural and efficient remedies. A first interpretation of this definition may affirm that the norms that are at the basis of the public institution activity and also of its personal are mostly constrictive and are creating blockages and delays which may be avoided by corrupt practices. Some specialists talk about innocent corruption. To better understand this approach we can think about a park envisioned by an architect with a number of alleys. After a time, other alleys are appearing on the green space, the reason is simple: citizens are finding quicker ways to cross the park. That is way some architects may leave the parks initially without alleys, so that the users choose the paths, which in turn will be made permanent. The same may be said about laws and regulation, wouldn't it be better to wait and see how law may be created naturally and then formalize it. This way of defining corruption permits the identification of another possible cause of it, the lack of goods and services. In other words, if a good or a service is scarce, restricted supply, and the demand is high, the “price” would grow through acts of corruption.

Another cause of breaching public integrity norms, which in turn has economic connotations, is the monopoly some persons or institutions have on supply of goods or services. This position may be used to gain unlawful gains.

The biggest advantage in approaching corruption from an economical point of view is the possibility to identify and eliminate its causes, maintaining a more efficient prevention.

The current extent of the systemic corruption in the Romanian administration reality puts in question the functionality of a democratic state based on the rule of law.

Evaluating the phenomenon of corruption in the current Romanian administration as a reason for the plea for ethics has its basis in researching the European Commission reports on the MCV from 2014, 2015 and 2016. We have selected several relevant elements about diagnosing this phenomenon in Romania by the EC.

¹² Richter, W.L., Burke, F. and Doig, J.W., *Combating Corruption, Encouraging Ethics*, Washington D.C.: ASPA Publications, 1990, pp.62-63.

As it is shown in the country report of the European Commission for 2015, the public administration's inefficiency and corruption are an additional burden for the Romanian companies, also, according to the World Bank, Romania is second to last in the EU at government efficiency¹³. In the EC report it is also shown that based on the World Bank indicators, Romania is second to last in the EU at government transparency and in the last 3 countries regarding legislation quality and corruption control. Also, the World Economic Forum identified corruption and bureaucratic inefficiency as the main obstacles for a competitive Romania. Big or small, corruption is a systemic issue in Romania, says Cecilia Malmström, the European Commissary for Internal Affairs, when presenting the EC report¹⁴. ***“Efforts are being done to fight corruption, as shown by the MCV report for the two countries (Bulgaria and Romania – n.red.), efforts recognized by us. As I said at the beginning, many countries are making efforts to combat this phenomenon, but not enough.”*** According to the document, Romania made anticorruption reforms in the last years, but the results are fragile. A quarter of those surveyed admit that they could be asked to pay a bribe, whether this was expected from them. The European average is only 4% and the Romania is the second largest of the 28 countries surveyed.

The European Commission, in the intermediary report of the Mechanism of Cooperation and Verification (MCV), is criticizing¹⁵ the fact the Romanian Parliament has cumbered the fight against high-level corruption by refusing a third of the DNA (Anti-Corruption National Division) request for removing the immunity of some members of the Parliament in 2015, but also for keeping in function MPs and Ministers after they have been prosecuted or definitively convicted. The European Commission shows, in its recommendations for the judicial system for 2016, that in this year it is important through the appointments to be done and to the best transparency possible. In the recommendations we have also the appointment of a strong leadership at the newly founded Agency for seized assets and also to establish clear objectives and criteria for monitoring the refusal to lift the MPs immunity under investigation. European Commission's harshest critic in the MCV report for 2016 to the Romanian Parliament is about the fact that it cumbered the fight against high-level corruption by arbitrary lifting without transparency the immunity of MPs under investigation from the DNA. Regarding the fight against corruption, one of the report recommendations is to “adopt objective criteria for supporting and taking decision which concerns lifting the MPs immunity and to assure the fact that immunity is not being used to avoid enquiry and prosecution for acts for corruption”.

¹³ www.mediafax.ro.../ce-ineficienta-adm.-si-co, 29 Jan.2016. SATI Statistics

¹⁴ www.digi24/...Raport+CE+Coruptie+România, Feb.2014

¹⁵ www.gandul.info/...raport-mcv-2016, Andrei Luca Pop, The Parliament criticized by the EC for blocking the investigation of criminal politicians, 27 Jan 2016.

Instead of conclusions

Morality and integrity must be long-term objectives for the new public management and the moral quality of the decisional process must represent in itself a condition for its sustainable achievement. Ethical codes and management measures focused on the involvement of administrators in the decisional process represents real levers to impose morality and integrity in the administrative system. *The Ethical code represents a basic component in the educational system, in terms of ethics in public administration it is needed to validate the imperatives: honesty, competency, protect the public interest and to express the ideals of public service so as to control the behaviour of civil servants.* Legislation ethics is able to show civil servants what they mustn't do, however, this is not a true guide for them, only indirectly, not helping them discover which is the right attitude in different situations, but penalizing those behaviours that deviate the rule. The civil servants status offers him safety, keeping him outside of political interference. To do this we don't need only regulations on ethics but also responsible and competent managers to be able to stimulate public administrators to involve in the decisional process so that, by practicing, to know fully well which are the objectives and targets and which are the methods through which these may be reached, to refocus the organizational culture of the public institutions, to push on the creation of internal goods and to keep in the background the creation of external goods¹⁶, to identify adequate ethical principles for creating these goods, which are the virtues associated with them¹⁷and with the support and participation of the citizens. The most important methods in fighting corruption are managerial, implicitly the existence of an authentic decisional transparency in the administration, the respect for ethical conduct codes by each civil servant. Probably the first and foremost efficient tool in removing the elements that could lead to unethical behaviour is the most efficient way in limiting the phenomenon. Thus, removing useless documents, redundant procedures, and unnecessary intermediaries limits the possibilities of those wanting to act unethical. A thorough selection and promotion of personal may assure good staff quality. We can't talk about administrative reform with corrupt people, dignitaries that mistake the purpose with the way in administering a community, respectively a country. *We need a new education based on axiology, mandatory education in the higher learning administrative institutions for a course of ethics and decisional transparency, through which future European civil servants to know and to learn ethical legislation in the public administration, to acquire legality and morality skills at European standards.* From public sector perspective we need to highlight the importance of organizational culture, the medium with which the youth that are acceding in public office come into contact. The institutional construct, as well as managerial decision must have in focus the limitation of elements that could present the risk of negatively influencing the ethical activity of the institutions. As important is also the education of those working in the public sector before and during their

¹⁶ MacIntyre, *cited works*

¹⁷ Richter, Burke, Doing, *cited works*

career. Specialists are insisting on the benefits of recurring courses in ethics for a healthy climate inside of institutions. Also periodical discussions are necessary about associated risks to unethical behaviour, about the institutional aspects that are vulnerable to corruption.

Youth integration in the group must be treated with great attention to avoid their exposure to examples or temptation for corruption. The new vision of public management needs a different understanding of management. This is not just reducible to an organizational process, but requires accountability system performance. It is certain that this can be achieved with European civil servants and professionals capable of morality.

REFERENCES

Aristotle, (1988), *Nicomachean Ethics*, Bucharest, Publishing House.

Denhardt, R.B., (1999), *Public Administration. An Action Orientation*, Belmont: Wadsworth.

The Fundation Partners for Local Development, (2006), *Organizational Health. A practical guide for the treatment and prevention of corruption in the local communities and administration. Concepts and Strategies*, vol. I, Bucharest.

Hursthouse, (1999), R., *On Virtue Ethics*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Johnston, M., (2007), *Corruption and its Manifestations*, Iasi: Polirom.

Klitgaard, R., MacLean-Abaroa, R. și Parris, H.L., (2006), *Corrupt Cities. Practical guide for treatment and prevention*, Bucharest, Humanitas.

MacIntyre, A., (2007), *After Virtue. A Study in Moral Theory*, Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press.

MacIntyre, A., (2006), *Ethics and Politics*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Matei, O., (2010), *Etical Law in the Romanian Public Administration*, Journal of Public Administration and Social, nr.4-5, "Vasile Goldiș" University, Arad.

Richter, W.L., Burke, F. și Doig, J.W., (1990), *Combating Corruption, Encouraging Ethics*, Washington D.C.: ASPA Publications.

Singer, P., (1994), (editor), *Ethics*, Oxford University Press, Oxford.

Singer, P., (1993), (editor), *A Companion to Ethics*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishing

http://www.transparency.org.ro/servicii/consultanta_juridica/index.html

www.mediafax.ro.../ce-ineficienta-adm.-si-co, 29 Jan 2016 SATI Statistics

www.digi24/...Raport+CE+Corupție+România, febr.2014

www.gandul.info/...raport-mcv-2016, Andrei Luca Pop, *The Parliament critized by the EC for blocking the investigation of criminal politicians*, 27 Jan 2016.

Ethics in Public Administration, fspac. L. Radu, ubbcluj.ro/modle/...php/.../Etică%20in%20ap...2013-2014.

PARTICULARITIES OF INDO-EUROPEAN LANGUAGES RESULTED FROM THE ANALYSIS OF THE WORD-PROBE 'FATHER'

Adrian Lesenciuc*

a.lesenciuc@yahoo.fr

Abstract: Starting from a previous study (Lesenciuc & Nagy, 2015: 329-346) which highlighted fundamental differences between Indo-European languages based on isoglosses separating the south of the north of Europe, unlike the east-west separation achieved by criterion centum-satem, we reached the conclusion that, comparing with the waves of Indo-European migration westward, at least two linguistic substrata bring to light. Through the current paper, using a comparative analysis of diachronic linguistics and a peculiar research tool, the word-probe 'father', we highlighted the linguistic substrata previously mentioned and describe their linguistic nature.

Keywords: Indo-European languages, centum-satem, linguistic substrata, Balkan linguistic unity.

1. Introduction. In 2015 we published, as a result of a research of more than ten years, consisting in comparative analysis (within synchronic linguistics, with rare references to dead languages), conducted on a sample of 124 Indo-European languages: 53 Indo-Iranian, 7 Baltic, 13 Slavic, 15 Italic, 7 Celtic, 14 Germanic, 2 Greek, 4 Anatolian, 2 Tocharian, 1 Albanian, 1 Armenian and 3 Thracian-Phrygian, an article through which we differentiated between fundamental features of the Indo-European linguistic typologies, comparing the isoglosses *ap-udaka* (*apă*) and *as-bhu* (*a fi*), and the isophone *bh-*, *b-/f-* within the term 'brother' with the classical *centum-satem* isogloss¹. The surprising result of this research pointed out the fact that the separation of Indo-European languages based on the evolution of dorsal consonants in artificial, i.e. the *centum-satem* isogloss is not relevant in the study of Indo-European languages, namely that drawing this isogloss that separates eastern by western European languages based on so called satemization (fricativization) of eastern I.E. languages has ideological nuances. After analysing the *ap-udaka* și *as-bhu* isoglosses, a new distribution of IE languages in Europe emphasizes a new distinction between the characteristics of northern branches of languages: Slavic, Baltic, Germanic and Celtic, and of southern branches: Italic, Thracian-Phrygian, Greek, plus Albanian dialects. Moreover, languages from the South-East European area, whatever the

* Assoc Prof / Department of Fundamental Sciences / Faculty of Aeronautical Management / 'Henri Coanda' Air Force Academy, Brasov.

¹ Adrian Lesenciuc, Daniela Nagy, 'Language particularities in the Indo-European area. Role of the South-Eastern cultural context', *Redefining Community in Intercultural Context*, vol. IV, no.1/2015, pp.329-346

branch they belong to, have features common to both categories, as languages of Indo-Iranian group. Based on the assumption of South-East European (Balkan) linguistic unity, discussed since the nineteenth century by the Slovenian linguist and philologist Jernej Bartol Kopitar², the Russian phonologist Nicholas Trubetzkoy³ and the Romanian linguist Al. Rosetti⁴, respectively based on anthropologic and linguistic reasons regarding the cultural and religious syncretism in South-Eastern Europe, highlighted by the Lithuanian anthropologist Marija Gimbutas⁵, namely by the French linguist André Martinet⁶, we come to an important conclusion about the existence of the two substrata, the first of these resulting from the settlement of the first Indo-European tribes in Europe, validating the hypothesis of Balkan linguistic unity:

We can affirm that there is a substratum unity of the current Balkan languages (pre-Indo-European and Indo-European/Thracian), over which, either a Latin or a Slavic stratum is superposed. Our supposition is based on the linguistic statistics initiative concerning form particularities of morphological units within the Indo-European languages, but mostly, it is a consequence of our results analysis and of comparison of the study results with other results (historical, anthropological). These superposed substrata led to language particularities that displayed either a different character from the substratum, or, both characters⁷.

In these circumstances, the aim of this paper was to highlight the linguistic substrata, appeared due to successive Indo-European invasions, or Kurgan population invasions, as the phenomenon is known in archaeology and anthropology, since mid-fifth millennium BC and ending with the second millennium BC when Nomadic tribes of Ionians, Dorians and Achaeans settled in Hellas. For this I used a term of Indo-European origin, which, in diachronic research, aims at probing, at boring inside languages to highlight substrata. To be more expressive, we called the research tool ‘word-probe’, i.e. a tool that is useful in probing through linguistic substrata to recognize the nature of them as well as to underline the role of this word within the diachronic analysis.

² J.B. Kopitar, ‘Albanische, walachische und bulgarische Sprache’, *Jahrbücher de Literatur*, Band 46, Wien, 1829, pp.59-106.

³ N.S. Trubetzkoy, ‘Vavilonskaja bašnja i smešenje jazykov’, *Evrazijskij vremennik. Neperiodičeskoe izdanje pod red. P.Savickogo, P.P. Suvčinskogo I kn. Trubeckogo*, Kniga tretja, Berlin, 1923, pp.107-124

⁴ Al. Rosetti, *Istoria limbii române. II. Limbile balcanice [The History of the Romanian Language. II. The Balkan Languages]*, 2nd edition, Royal Foundation for Literature and Art, Bucharest, 1943.

⁵ Marija Gimbutas, *Civilizație și cultură: vestigiile preistorice în sud-estul European [Civilisation and Culture: Prehistoric Vestiges in South-eastern Europe]*, Preface and notes: Radu Florescu, translated by Sorin Paliga, Meridiane Publishing House, Bucharest, 1989.

⁶ André Martinet, *Des steppes aux océans. L’indo-européen et les „Indo-Européens”*, Éditions Payot & Rivages, Paris, 1994.

⁷ Adrian Lesenciuc, Daniela Nagy, quoted work, p.344.

2. The word-probe ‘father’ within Indo-European languages. The Romanian word *tată* (Arom. *tată*, pl. *tătâni*, Meg. *tată*, pl. *tătoni*, Istr. *tote*), which takes the same shape into Albanian, *tatë*, is considered to have Latin origins, being derived from the underused term *tata*. It is almost impossible for the Romanian term to have originated in the Lat. *pater* because of the serious violation of the phonetic criterion in etymology, explained by some Latinists as being an irregular evolution of the term. For the beginning the approach of the diachronic analysis of this term, is to note the existence of the word *tāta* in Sanskrit, a usual appellation, equivalent of the French word *papa*. The Latin term *pater* comes from a common Indo-European root, from which Sanskrit (Skt.) terms *pitarati* and *pitrya* (denoting the paternity relationship) derived, as well as the root *pitṛ-*, meaning father. The Sanskrit term meaning father has the following forms in the nominative: singular *pitā*, plural *pitaras*, and dual *pitarau*. Closer to the Latin word are the singulars in dative *pitre*, instrumental *pitrā*, and locative *pitari*. It is possible, therefore, that the Romanian term *părinte* to have a parallel evolution with the Latin one, or to be later borrowed from Latin, thus modifying the Indo-European term used in this area, but the emergence of “r” before a dental consonant and the metathesis are irrelevant. The phonetic pertinence indicates a possible later change due to the contamination with the Latin word or due to the borrowing through a different term, but of the same semantic area: *parentem*. The mentioned transformations have taken place in Latin, similar forms from *parentem* being meet nowadays in Ital., Port. *parente*, Prov., Cat. *paren*, Fr. *parent*, Sp. *pariente*, and also Alb. *përinthë*, plural of *princ* – prince, ruler, monarch. –*am* ending, specific to the forms of accusative singular, genitive plural and instrumental, dative and ablative dual in Sanskrit may explain the Latin word ending.

The common Indo-European root **ati-* (father) is found also in the diminutive **atiko-*, that is the origin of the Slavic term *otec* [*at’ets*], but of Hit. *ata*, Alb. *at*, and Ir. *athir* too. Those four terms probably had different evolutions: the first three from an Indo-European dialect where the initial consonant disappeared, the last one through a linguistic phenomenon specific to Celtic languages, characterized by the fall of the initial *p*. It is important to notice what the linguist Henriette Walter said, that noted that the absence of letter *p* in Ogham writing (Celtic from British Islands) is a clue for the absence of the same letter, *p*, in the original Indo-European vocabulary⁸. In terms of Matteo G. Bartoli, in areas theory terms⁹, therefore, a Celtic isolated/lateral area (less exposed to linguistic contacts) can be delineate, explaining the possibility of maintaining the language from an earlier phase, i.e. some features of language spoken by the first Indo-European populations that entered the European

⁸ Henriette Walter, *L’aventure des langues en Occident. Leur origine, leur histoire, leur géographie*, Robert Laffont, Paris, 1994, p.73;

⁹ In 1925, Matteo Giulio Bartoli introduced the concept “linguistic areas” and a set of four “areal norms” (*norme delle aree*), that explain the diachronic spread of linguistic innovations within a relatively homogenous space and that are useful in establishing the chronological relationships between linguistic forms with common origin, see Matteo Giulio Bartoli, *Introduzione alla neolinguistica: Principi – scopi – metodi*, Olschki, Geneva, 1925, pp.3-17.

continent. This explanation cannot be separated by the context of successive changes, in waves, well described by the theory of waves (*Wellentheorie*)¹⁰. Thus, Celtic population from Britannia belonged to the first Kurgan waves, being in contact with the old population of Europe. It is surprising, at a first glance, the Etruscan term *ati*, identical with the Indo-European root, as well as the Etruscan that is a pre-Indo-European language. The phonetic phenomenon (loss of the initial consonant) is repeated in the case of word Etr. *ami*, meaning *mother*. In a different pre-Indo-European language the Basque, a term similar with the I.E. root **ati-* (father) can be found: *aita*, meaning father. Even some languages from Altai area were “contaminated” by the Indo-European root **ati-*, for example Turkish *ata* (father), but the phenomenon is isolated in the Turkic group of languages.

3. The two substrata: ‘tata’ and ‘pater’. The presence of the deaf dental occlusive consonant *t* at the beginning of the Romanian word *tată* is not a singular case in the area of Indo-European languages. Even as a deaf consonant, or as a sound consonant, sometimes replaced by a spirant, the occlusive consonant does not fall as the initial or intervocalic labial consonant fell in Celtic languages from British Islands. The occlusive consonant is met, therefore, in Bret. *tat*, *zad*, *dad*, from which it passed, in time, in the English terms *dad*, *daddy*, all these terms having the same meaning, *father*. We should not lose from this listing the Russian term *dedushka* – grandfather, suffixally derived (with the use of the I.E. suffix –*ka*, present in Sanskrit, Romanian, or Albanian for example), or the Lithuanian terms *teta*, *dediene* – aunt, in contrast with Lith. *teva* – father, where the emergence of the labio-dental spirant consonant is due to local linguistic influences. In relationship with *dad*, *daddy*, we can discuss two aspects: 1. the presence of hissing consonants in German, correspondent of the deaf dental occlusive consonant in English, and 2. the evolution of the deaf labio-dental spirant consonant *f* from the deaf dental occlusive consonant *p* within all the Germanic languages. The existence of the actual form of the word, *father*, is due not to the first aspect considered, but to the second one, as an evolution from the old Indo-European dialects, where from also derived Skr. *pitā(r)*, Gr. *πατήρ*, Lat. *pater*. The presence of the initial spirant consonants in Goth. *fadar* Du. *vadar* and Germ. *Vater* is to be noted. The deaf dental occlusive consonant is also present in Vegl. *tuota*, SItal. *tata*, Ital.(dial.) *tato* – father, grandfather, OFr. *taie*, Sp., Port *tata*. Miklosich’s hypothesis¹¹ of loaning the word *tata* from Slav. *tata*, present in SCr., Cz., Pol. *tata*, and in Hung. *tata*, is invalidated by Ciorănescu¹². Like the isolated term *tata* in Latin, Spanish, Portuguese, or Slavic languages cannot have too great influence on other languages, the terms Gr. *τάτα* and N.Gr. *τατάς* cannot be marks

¹⁰Johannes Schmidt, *Die Verwandtschaftsverh ältnisse der indogermanischen Sprachen*, Böhlau, Weimar, 1872

¹¹Franz Ritter von Miklosich, *Lexicon palaeoslovenico-graeco-latinum: emendatum auctum*, G. Baumuellner, Vindobonae, 1862-1865 [scanned, online]. URL: <https://archive.org/details/lexiconpalaeosloovmikluoft>, University of Toronto [accessed on September, 2016].

¹²Alexandru Ciorănescu, *Dicționarul etimologic al limbii române [The Romanian Language Etymological Dictionary]*, Saeculum I.O. Publishing House, Bucharest, [1954-1966], 2002, p.776.

in Indo-European etymology. The consecrated term in Greek πατήρ (πατέρας) is the origin of Lat. *pater*. The etymon of the common words designating “father” in Romance languages is Lat. *pater*: Fr. *père*, Ital. and Sp. *padre*, and Fr. *papa* or Sp. *papá*. The words that come from Lat. *pater* were overlaid over the pre-existent linguistic layer that belonged probably to the first Indo-European (i.e. pre-Latin) waves of migration, coming from *tata*, **ati-*. We drew attention to the words from Veglia, South Italian dialects, Old French, but also from Basque and Etruscan, but for a more detailed analysis is important to focus on the semantic covering and isogloss of word *tata* in Spanish. We found, therefore, the existence of two meanings: the first, a regionalism in Latin America, also the popular form from Spain, both meaning *daddy*, and the second one, meaning *father* on a small area of Latin America. Obviously, the second meaning is derived (by extension) from the first, and the presence of this term outside Spanish territories is not interesting in our study. The derivation from a term that has the same root with the Basque *aita* is then excluded. But the presence of the popular term *tata* refers to the first perceptible Indo-European layer, because there are more derivatives: *tataradeudo* – ancestor; *tatarabuelo* – great-grandfather, respectively *tataranieto* – great-grandson, *tato* – elder brother.

In other words, the two linguistic Indo-European substrates, which we call generically *tata* and *pater*, correspond to two successive waves of Kurgan population invasion. On the territory of Romania, the first layer was preserved, because the ancient Danube civilization was the first that come into direct contact with the Indo-Europeans, while the new Indo-European languages, including Latin, correspond to the second substrate and, obviously, to a subsequent invasion. The term *părinte* in Romanian returns through Latin even if there exist other terms that semantically removed from the meaning of word “father”. It remains to see whether, for the two terms, *tata* and *pater*, there was a common etymon in Indo-European or not.

4. The two meanings of the term ‘father’ and the deposit of meanings from each substratum. The first clue is offered by the French linguist André Martinet who, having the intention of reconstruction the I.E. term **pṛtēr*, based on Lat. *pater*, Gr. πατήρ, Skr. *pitā(r)*, Engl. *father*, Arm. *hayr* or OIr. *athir*, taking into account, therefore, the both substrates, using the sound *ṛ* reconstructed as reduction, in an unstressed syllable, from *-eH* or *-H*, noted that semantically the first meaning is not a genitor, but a head of patriarchal family (which has the role, among other roles, of genitor too)¹³. To note the more important archaeological data: the Indo-Europeans, peoples who invaded Europe, were organized in patriarchal societies of fighters. So, the term meant in Old Indo-European languages the head of a family, a gens or a tribe. The old term was, therefore, a basic word in speaking for the populations that became progressively the super strata over the indigenous populations. The proof of contemporary Sanskrit is important in our analysis. The Skr. words *pati* – lord, master and *patya* – head of state originate in the reconstructed root. The surprise

¹³ André Martinet, quoted work, p.14.

in our analysis come from other Sanskrit words *pitṛ-dāya* – patrimony, and *pitṛya* – patrimonial. In other words, the root *pitṛ-*, father, is found in a term designating all material and spiritual patrimony of a lord (*pati*). The root *pati* remains, however, within Skr. *prajā-pati* – owner. The two meanings intertwine further in Sanskrit, as it can be observed.

Within the European languages, the two meanings, had and genitor, have been preserved. The patrimonial integrity, including the population of a territory, will be named, later, *patrie* – homeland, from Lat. *pater*, through Fr. *Patrie*. The term also exists in Italian, *patria*. A similar process of designation was occurred in German, where *Vaterland* – homeland derived from *Vater* – father, and in Bulgarian, where *отечество* – homeland and *отечествени* – patriotic comes from Russ. *отец* – father. The recent Bulg. *напуомуцен* is a loan. Ernesto Sabato, metaphorically proving the the contact of Danubian matriarchal societies with the proto-homeland of the Indo-Europeans, noted:

After Unamuno, the man is a patriot and the woman a matriot. Matria is the biology: tradition, home region, home, family. Patria (homeland) is the politics: abstraction, power, idea. Like everything is male, patria is centrifugal, tends to increasing and to (correlative) abstraction¹⁴.

On these principles of dialogue, the relationship between the chief and the subordinated tribe in Indo-European societies got in contact with the western matriarchal societies. In this way, the overlaid layer of Kurgan’s population creates precise demarcation in autochthonous languages between the meanings of genitor and lord.

Into Romanian, the meaning of lord/master (equivalent to Skt. *pati*) is found in terms such as *jupan*, *jupân*, *pan* and subsequently *ban*¹⁵. The loan from Mongolians, or probably from Avars, of the term *bajan* – reach, with an improbable phonetic evolution through Hung. *bán*, where from arrived in Slav. *banŭ*, SCr., Cz., Pol., Slk. *pan*, meaning lord, master, is contradicted by the presence of the Dacian word *Diuppaneus* or *Diurpaneus*, associated to last two kings from Sarmisezegetusa. The Romanian term *stăpân*, derived from the phrase *stha+pati*, meaning “the lord of the place”, has the same origin. Similarly, the phrase *dam+pati*, “the lord of the house”, is found in Gr. *δεσποτης*, Alb. *despot*, and Rom. *despot*. Identical phonetic evolution is found in the phrase *dyu+pati*, “the lord of the heaven”, “the lord of the gods”, see Lat. *Jupiterus*, Dac. *Diuppaneus* (*pati* > *pan*, as in the case of word *stăpân*), assigned to last for two Dacian kings, Duras and Decebal (later deified)¹⁶. The transformation of an

¹⁴ Ernesto Sábato, *Eseuri [Essays]* (vol.I), RAO Publishing House, Bucharest, 2004, p.279.

¹⁵ Nicolae Iorga, *Istoria românilor. Strămoșii înainte de romani [The History of the Romanians. The Ancestors before the Romans]*, vol. I, 1st part, Scientific and Encyclopaedic Publishing House, Bucharest, 1988.

¹⁶ To consider the reconstructed Indo-European word **hoṷi – pā(ti)*, shepherd, the master of the sheepfold, from which derived Lat. *pastor* and Rom. *păstor*, and from which evolved Arm. *howiw* - shepherd and Hit. *hawas* – sheep.

unaspirated dental consonant into a nasal dental consonant is, therefore, feasible. Regarding the subsequent evolution of the attribute Diuppaneus, Diurpaneus, Nicolae Iorga offers further clarifications:

Then, how Decebal, Dacian king – imitative king – is called Diurpaneu or Diuppaneu -, which would be understood jupa in his country named jupa -, we can ask if this is the ancient autochthonous form of power over people. The Slavists could not fix the origin of jupa and i, where from the Slavic pan and the Avars' ban, but they recognize that the primitive form of power, after their settlement in Balkans, was this one¹⁷.

The derivative term from that one that designates lord/master in Albanian, *princ*, with the irregular plural *përinthë*, in contrast to the regular one, *princi*, in a form identical to the Romanian one, phonetically resembles with *prind*, *-i*, meaning parent, *-s*. The presence of the adjective *prindëror*, *-e*, parental, and the existence of the phrase similar to the Romanian one, *vatra prindërore*, parental hearth are relevant to the present study. Basically, like in Romanian, the two successive substrata, equivalent to the successive Indo-European waves, are represented by the terms *tatë* and *prind*, respectively *tată* and *părinte*. Within both languages, Romanian and Albanian, the second term is a late loan, with no direct linkage with the substratum.

5. Conclusions. On the one hand, the analysis through word-probe 'father' confirms the assumptions formulated within the previous study regarding the possible classification of Indo-European branches of languages depending on the character *ap-udaka* or *as-bhu*, and it highlights that the deaf initial consonant from the first Indo-European substratum became voiced consonant within the northern Indo-European languages, in a similar distribution as in the case of *bh-*, *b-/f-* isophone within the term 'brother'. On the other hand, the analysis highlights, both at the levels of form and content (meaning) the IE linguistic substrata in Europe. The use of such research tools (i.e. word-probe) brings to light aspects of diachronic linguistics, that became useful and restored not only the genealogy of words till the reconstructed terms within the primary language, but the structure of language strata/substrata. Considering that linguistic facts are backed by archaeological proofs is an additional argument in our approach of linguistic universalia from a diachronic perspective. Combining the comparative-historical approach with the linguistic geography within a comparative analysis done with the use of a research tool that takes into account the context of linguistic evolution, of linguistic mutability, we highlighted, in direct relationship with the word-probe 'father', the existence of the two linguistic substrata within IE languages in Europe, especially of the South-Eastern European (Balkan) substratum.

¹⁷ Nicolae Iorga, quoted work, p. 112.

6. Abbreviations

Alb.	– Albanian	Ital.	– Italian
Arm.	– Armenian	Lat.	– Latin
Arom.	– Aromanian/ Macedo-Romanian	Lith.	– Lithuanian
Bret.	– Breton	Meg.	– Megleno-Romanian
Bulg.	– Bulgarian	Ngr.	– Modern Greek
Cat.	– Catalan	OFr.	– Old French
Cz.	– Czech	OIr.	– Old Irish
Du.	– Dutch	Pol.	– Polish
Engl.	– English	Port.	– Portuguese
Etr.	– Etruscan	Prov.	– Provençal
Fr.	– French	Rom.	– Romanian
Germ.	– German	Russ.	– Russian
Goth.	– Gothic	SCr.	– Serbo-Croatian
Gr.	– Greek	SItal.	– South Italian
Hit.	– Hittite	Slav.	– Slavic
Hung.	– Hungarian	Slk.	– Slovakian
I.E.	– Indo-European	Skt.	– Sanskrit
Ir.	– Irish	Sp.	– Spanish
Istr.	– Istro-Romanian	Vegl.	– Vegliot

REFERENCES

Bartoli, M.G., (1925), *Introduzione alla neolinguistica: principi – scopi – metodi*, Geneva, Olschki.

Ciorănescu, Alexandru, [1954-1966], (2002), *Dicționarul etimologic al limbii române [The romanian language etymologic dictionary]*, BUCHAREST, Saeculum I.O. Publishing House.

Gimbutas, Marija, (1989), *Civilizație și cultură: vestigii preistorice în sud-estul european [Civilisation and culture: prehistoric vestiges in south-eastern europe]*, preface and notes: Radu Florescu, translated by Sorin Paliga, Bucharest, Meridiane Publishing House.

Iorga, Nicolae, (1988), *Istoria românilor. Strămoșii înainte de romani [The history of the romanians. The ancestors before the romans]*, vol. I, IST part, Bucharest, Scientific and Encyclopedic Publishing House.

Kopitar, J.B., (1829), ‘Albanische, walachische und bulgarische sprache’, *jahrbücher de literatur*, Wien, Band 46.

Lesenciuc, Adrian & Nagy, Daniela, (2015), ‘Language particularities in the indo-european area. Role of the south-eastern cultural context’, *redefining community in intercultural context*, vol. IV, no.1, 329-346.

Martinet, André, (1994), *Des steppes aux océans. L'indo-européen et les „indo-europeens”*, Paris, Editions Payot & Rivages.

Miklosich, FR.R. von, 1862-1865, *Lexicon palaeoslovenico-graeco-latinum: emendatum auctum, vindobonae*, G. Baumuellner, [online]. URL: <https://archive.org/details/lexiconpalaeoslooomikluoft>, University of Toronto [accessed on september, 2016]

Rosetti, AL., (1943), *Istoria limbii române. II. Limbile balcanice* [*The history of the romanian language. II. The balkan languages*], 2nd edition, Bucharest, Royal Foundation for Literature and Art.

Sábato, Ernesto, (2004), *Eseuri* [*Essays*] (vol.I), Bucharest, Rao Publishing House.

Schmidt, Johannes, (1872), *Die verwandtschaftsverh ältnisse der indogermanischen sprachen*, Weimar, Böhlau.

N.S. Trubetzkoy, 1923, 'Vavilonskaja bašnja i smešenje jazykov', *Evrasijskij vremennik. Neperiodičeskoe izdanie pod red. P.Savickogo, P.P. Suvčinskogo I kn. Trubeckogo*, Kniga tretja, Berlin.

Walter, Henriette, 1994, *L'aventure des langues en occident. Leur origine, leur histoire, leur géographie*, Paris, Robert Laffont.

CONSTANTIN STERE AND HIS ORIGINAL PERSPECTIVE ON THE MODERNIZATION OF ROMANIA

Grigore Georgiu*

grigore.georgiu@comunicare.ro

Abstract: *In the first two decades of the 20th century, Romania underwent a series of deep changes which came to an end, after the dramatic war-experience, in 1918 with the Grand Union. At the same time, the academic sphere, the media, the political and cultural realms were all engaged in an ample and lively debate of ideas on the reforms which needed to be urgently implemented for the settlement of several acute economic and social issues. However, the intellectual elites of the time took up broader topics as well, embedded in a theoretical horizon, such as the modernization strategies and their adequacy to the Romanian specificity. A prominent figure of the political events and of the ideological debates of the epoch was Constantin Stere, a complex personality, thinker, publicist, politician and ardent fighter for the national union of Romanians. In his published articles, in his parliamentary discourses and in his writings, Stere fervently pleaded for the implementation of some vital reforms for the modernization of the country (land reform - transferring property from large landowners to peasants, universal vote etc.). He initiated and supported an ample cultural and political trend, known as Poporanism and proposed an agrarian economic and social model for Romania. It is worth quoting some of his texts and deciphering their meaning in the current context.*

Keywords: *Poporanism, Marxism, agrarian issue, reforms, "vagabond" capital.*

Modernization issues and approaches at the beginning of the 20th century

Anyone daring to reconstruct the history of the political ideas in the Romanian space during its shift toward Modernity will discover that, in the first decades of the 20th century, the public spirit and the ideological clashes were dominated by *Poporanism*, an ample political and cultural trend difficult to frame into the already established typologies. The founder of this trend, Constantin Stere (1865-1936), was a prominent figure of the political and intellectual life, a leading, albeit controversial personality. He had a very tumultuous and unsettled life, full of achievements and failures. He went through several critical situations and his attitudes often thwarted his political colleagues and partners. Born in a family of small boyars of Bessarabia (Romanian province

* Profesor, PhD., College of Communication and Public Relations, National University of Political Studies and Public Administration, Bucharest.

under the Tsarist Empire occupation in 1812), Stere becomes one of the most motivated and efficient promoters of the land reform whose aim was the abolition of the large landowners. Deported in Siberia in his youth, he ardently reads and assimilates the social and political theories of the Western space. Born near Russia, his life was dominated by a pro-European attitude, adversary of the Tsarist Russia. In the First World War, he was a tenacious opponent of the alliance between Romania and Russia, siding with the group of the so-called “Germanophiles”, a label applied to those who, from various reasons, rejected an alliance to Russia although, sometimes, the main reason that animated them “was not only the attachment to the Central Powers, but rather the fear of Russia; there were more «Russophiles» than «Germanophiles»”.¹ Stere was one of them.

Stere was a creator of political doctrine, a leader of national consciousness, an important and sometimes the main agent of the political events at that time. For an authentic understanding of the current that he introduced in the Romanian public opinion, an important mention must be made. The term “Poporanism” is scarcely related to the current term of Populism. Many exegetes connected Poporanism to the reformist movement called “Narodnicism” from the Russian space. The word is derived from “*popor*”, meaning people, which first had the meaning of ethnic community then of large social community made up of simple individuals, peasants who formed the “base” of the nation, the “bottom of the country”, as opposed to the “boyars” (the large landowners), the “landowners”, the governors, the “ruling classes”. Stere states that he had in mind three meanings of the term people: the *ethnic* one, of “people-nation”, the *historical* one, of “positive categories” which entailed at a certain point the meaning of historical progress, and the *social* one, of people seen as a “huge majority”, the “actual working mass”.² There are no contradictions between the three meanings, according to Stere, since the latter meaning, that of “real working class” is the foundation of the first two meanings. As such, Poporanism is the doctrine whose reference system is the massive component of the nation, namely the “positive categories”, the “productive” ones, the “working classes” which predominantly encompassed, in Romania, the peasantry, plus a limited category of the industrial working class and the middle groups, all forming the “people” as opposed to the “superposed layer”, the wealthy civil servants, the parasite boyars and the bourgeoisie engaged in agency activities (loans, trade, financial speculations).

This was the dramatic cleavage in the Romanian society, given that the middle class was yet to take shape. Between the two components of the Romanian society there is a huge discrepancy (which accounts for the peasants’ riot in 1907) and the peasantry represented 90% of the “people”, politically unrepresented. The adepts of Poporanism occupied this political space, *undertaking to politically represent the interests of the peasantry*.

¹ Lucian Boia, „*Germanophiles*”. *Romanian Intellectual Elite in the Years of the First World War*, Bucharest, Humanitas Publishing House, 2010, p. 7.

² C. Stere, *Social-Democratism or Poporanism?*, Galați, Porto-Franco Publishing House, 1996, pp.237-243.

Judging by these facts, the genesis of this trend is linked to a vital problem of Romania, known as the “agrarian issue” or the “peasant issue”. In the second half of the 19th century, Romania was integrated in the system of interests of the Western countries, gaining its state independence in this context. The political class and the cultural creation were fed from the Western ideas and spiritual movements. At the same time, Romania was facing an acute social issue, as the fast modernization triggered a series of unhackneyed contradictions in which the major social agents had opposing interests and options. Romania was an agricultural country, the land being the fundamental source of capital, the subsistence basis of the country. But the land did not belong to those who worked it, but rather to the large landowners who invoked rights and laws dating back to the feudal times. The existence of the large land ownership has become an inefficient form of exploitation of land and was based on serfdom and compulsory, unfree and unpaid labor of the peasants.

The land reform passed under the reign of Alexandru Ioan Cuza in 1864 had limited effects, being basically amputated by the famous laws of “agricultural negotiations” which perpetuated the direct dependence of the peasant on the arbitrary will of the landowners. In this regard, Stere agreed with his opponent in ideas, the socialist C. Dobrogeanu Gherea who considered that the land reform from 1864 was incomplete and inconsistent, giving birth to a “a hybrid, absurd, monstrous socio-economical organism, that availed neither small property, nor large property rightly, but hindered both”³, since peasantry remained under the economic subordination of the large landowners and overwhelmed by burdens due to the local landlords and the state. At the same time, the peasantry was a class just entering the cycle of cultural modernization and its political and social rights were drastically limited by the economic legislation and the electoral legislation (see the census suffrage). Consequently, Stere’s project provided the complete abolition of the large landowners and the transferring of the property to the peasantry, considering that this option was the single solution for national salvation. In order to defeat the resistance of the conservatory groups, Stere promoted this political project with an unusual ardor, tenaciously and obsessively, for almost two decades, using an ample historical, economic and sociologic argumentation. It was only after the war, after the sacrifice of the peasants on the war fields in Mărășești and elsewhere that Stere’s reform managed to crystallize.

Briefly, this is the social equation of Romania in 1900 and the background in which this trend emerged. As such, the agrarian issue was important due to its economic and social dimension and its settlement was a prerequisite for the resolution of other serious issues of Romania’s modernization process. In order to stand out on the political and ideological scene, the new current, interested in the settlement of the “agrarian issue”, took an explicit stand against the all-mighty conservatory party (who also benefited from the prestigious *Junimea*

³ C. Dobrogeanu Gherera, *Neo-selfdom*, in *Complete Works*, vol. 4, Bucharest, Political Publishing House, 1977, p. 48.

group⁴), progressively siding with the liberals, adapts of the rapid modernization. Willing to promote their social projects, the Poporanists chose to join, in 1899, the liberals. However, they also had to face a new political current, the socialist current, recently impregnating Romania, a current promoted by certain intellectual circles, under the influence of the Western socialist movement and whose theoretical backbone was the Marxist vision. The Poporanist movement also distinguishes itself from another cultural trend in the epoch, commonly known as *Sămănătorism*, traditionalism-oriented current whose program articulated around the revival of traditions and the consolidation of national consciousness. The originality of Poporanism consists in the fact that, as a radical reformist current in politics, it supported the liberal solutions and criticized and radically rejected, as of the end of the 19th century, the economic solutions put forward by the Marxist current for Romania.

Journey of life, journey of ideas

Political ideas are better understood when presented from their genesis and in their progressive unfolding. They are born in a certain social context, as a reaction to a given situation and coagulate into a system, provided that the situation that triggered them persists. Stere's life continuously intertwined with the political and historical events in which he got engaged. For a better understanding of his ideas and attitudes, we deemed fit to go through some of the episodes that shed light on his noble and contradictory personality. For instance, Stere and the group he was part of supported the need to critically absorb the democratic institutions and *political* values from the Western countries (approach appreciated as a "historical fatality"⁵), while proposing for Romania an *economic evolution model completely different from* the model embraced by the Western industrialized countries. This is how Stere managed to conjugate attitudes that, for other theoreticians of the time, were antinomical. Aware of this antagonistic position, Stere stated: "The truth is that those acquainted with certain formulas find it difficult to mark me with a known label".⁶ Stere behaved in the political sphere and in the private one as a complex, surprising and captivating, often turbulent character, as he portrays himself in the novel sequence *În preajma revoluției [On the Eve of the Revolution]*, written at the end of an unsettled life. This political character struck his contemporaries as an "overwhelming in failures and fascinating in accomplishments".⁷

⁴ Junimea was a literary, cultural and political movement established in Iasi in 1863 by young intellectuals, led by Titu Maiorescu, who elaborated the theory of the "forms without substance", whereby he criticized the imitation of the Western laws and institutions devoid of adequate content in the Romanian society. The Junimists formed the moderate wing of the conservatory party.

⁵ G. Ibrăileanu, *Transition Periods*, in "Viața românească" [*Romanian Life*], no. 4/1920, reproduced in vol. G. Ibrăileanu, *Works*, vol. 5, Comments by Ion Rotaru and Al Piru, Bucharest, Minerva Publishing House, 1977, p. 20.

⁶ C. Stere, *Democratism and d. Aurel C. Popovici*, study published in "Viața românească" [*Romanian Life*], no. 6/1908, reproduced in vol. C. Stere, *Writings*, Edition, introductory study and notes by Z. Ornea, Bucharest, Minerva Publishing House, 1979, p. 575.

⁷ Z. Ornea, *Introductory Study*, in vol. C. Stere, *Writings*, cited Publishing House, p. 26.

After completing his studies in Chişinău and Odessa, his life takes a dramatic turn. In 1884, due to his engagement in the Narodniks' revolutionary circles from Bessarabia, he was imprisoned in Odessa and then deported in Siberia where he remains for seven years. He took advantage of this time to deepen his readings from the Western literature and thought, forming a solid philosophical, sociological and economic culture. Set free in 1892, Stere crossed in the same year the border in Romania where he continues his law studies at the University of Iaşi. After graduation and the publication of some brilliant articles, he becomes a tenured professor (in 1903) of constitutional law and subsequently (in 1913) he is elected rector of the University of Iaşi.

Once settled in Iaşi, in 1892, he successfully launches in the publishing field and has a great influence on the young intellectuals from Iaşi, who were then driven to the socialist doctrine, recently introduced in Romania. Stere's biographer, the literary historian Z. Ornea, appreciates that almost all strengths of the Poporanist ideology have been depicted in the essays, articles and chronicles published by Stere in the magazines in Iaşi within the period 1892-1895: „the duty of the artist (and of the intellectual in general) toward the people (to be understood as peasantry), the principle of the national specificity in art”,⁸ the interpretation of art as an embodiment of a social trend, plus, we may add, the need to politically represent the peasant masses that compose, in an overwhelming proportion, the “people”, the realist fashion of writing about the village life, devoid of idyllic scenes and the opening toward the Western political and cultural influences. Although they made the “eulogy of the folklore and of the peasant weltanschauung”, as Z. Ornea puts it, neither Stere nor Ibrăileanu condemned the Western influences from a political and cultural standpoint, as other traditionalist currents of that epoch used to do. On the contrary, they convincingly highlighted the benefic role of the Western influences.

It is now worth mentioning that the doctrine launched by Stere is not a traditionalist and anti-European one, as it has been erroneously presented for a long time in students' handbooks. The new current gave currency to a specific modernization strategy of the Romanian society, enforcing the critical spirit as an instance liable for the selection and adaptation of the Western models to the “local” and national realities. Throughout the 19th century, we have witnessed an assertion of the “Poporanist” current, rooted in the Romanism spirit, defined through the boosted interest in the popular literature, in the study of the folklore and of the historical traditions. This trend was more conspicuous among the writers and intellectuals emerging from the peasant environments. Gradually, this current of option enforced a new directive of the national spirit, directive that “exercises over literature an overpowering infringement and partially triggers a new state of mind”.⁹ This is the state of made which will bear the name of Poporanism and the reference system of this current shall be the “people”, the village, the peasant civilization, in connection to the political and economic aspects of the “peasant issue”, prevailing in the Romanian space. As opposed to

⁸ *Ibidem*, p. 13.

⁹ G. Călinescu, *The History of Romanian Literature from its origins till present day*, Bucharest, Royal Foundation for Literature and Art, 1941, p. 447.

other publications at that time, *Viața românească* [*Romanian Life*] displays a beneficial opening toward the idea of modernization of the rural world, and, as such, G. Călinescu is entitled to acknowledge that Poporanists, perceiving the “backwardness” of the Romanian people compared to the European civilization, take over the Pasoptists’ (the Forty-Eighters) and the Junimists’ message, but impose a new orientation, for which the “core issue was not only getting closer to the people, but rather elevating it, starting from a Romanticism-free vision. This program item epitomizes “Poporanism”.¹⁰

As such, Stere’s group supported the modernizing role of the political forms imported from the West, arguing that, in general, the Western influences have been “salutary” and beneficially contributed to the state reconstruction process. These influences really stimulated the awakening of the national consciousness and the recovery of the authentic national patrimony, managing to break into pieces part of the symbolic customs and practices borrowed by Romanians from the Byzantine-Slave space and then from the Turkish- Phanariot one between the 17th and the 18th centuries. It was Ibrăileanu who, praising the liberal ideal and the Western modern institutions, stated that: “regardless of what the doctrinary conservatives may say, the Western influence and the rise of the national Romanian culture are two concomitant phenomena”.¹¹ This is how Poporanists redefine the topics of modernization and place them into another ideological vector. They do not criticize, but praise the European influences, while supporting the national cultural identity, acted upon through modern forms of expression.

The uncompromising rupture with the conservatory and traditionalist groups is the first step whereby the current initiated by Stere defines its ideological and political identity, followed by the second, more complicated, step whereby Stere positively relates to the liberals and negatively relates to the social-democratic projects. The argument frequently used by Stere is that Romania still lacks industry and a significant proletariat and, as such, a socialist party would be meaningless in a Romanian society, being an “exotic plant”, a “form without substance”, to quote the Junimists. Furthermore, Stere argued that the historical process failed to confirm a central thesis of the Marxist doctrine, namely the dogma related to the disappearance of the small rural property and the transformation of the peasantry into proletariat. Due to some major changes occurred in the mechanism of the capitalist system, the revolutionary projects that the Marxist doctrine relied on became inapplicable in the industrialized Western societies as well. And, as a matter of course, these solutions were all the more inadequate to the peasant societies from Eastern Europe. Consequently, the socialist program must turn into a poporanist one, i.e. in a realist program of democratic and economic reforms in favor of the peasants, program which could only be achieved by the liberal party. Promoting the slogan “we need a program for the people, not a people for a program”, Stere persuades an important group of intellectuals to leave the socialist party (the Romanian Social Democratic

¹⁰ *Ibidem*, p. 585.

¹¹ G. Ibrăileanu, *Critical Spirit in Romanian Culture. Notes and Impressions*, Bucharest, Minerva Publishing House, 1984, p. 14.

Workers' Party founded in 1893) and to join the liberal party, in 1899. This was Stere's first political triumph.

Going back to the point, after being elected deputy on the liberal lists, in 1901, Stere's influence on the liberal front ranker Ionel Brătianu shall increase until, during the war, the paths of the two leaders shall split. In his fulminant parliamentary discourses, Stere enjoys the opportunity of expressing his reform project and his economic model. He stands out as a powerful leader, cheered by his partners and feared by his opponents. In 1906, he founds the magazine *Viața românească* [*Romanian Life*] where he lays down his through system and in March 1907 he is appointed prefect of Iasi for a short while. In the years before the war, Stere was one of the most ardent supporters of the Constitution revision measures, initiative meant to open the path toward the transferring of the property from large landowners to peasants and the adoption of the universal vote. Thanks to his persuading and efficient discourses in all political circles, Stere can be considered a co-author of the land reform.

The most controversial episode of Stere's life unfolds next. In the neutrality period, as well as after our going to war, Stere opposed to the alliance with Russia, considering that this Eastern giant was the bastion of the "universal reaction", and the Romanians' national ideals are jeopardized by such an alliance. Settled in Bucharest under German occupation, he is accused after the war of collaborationism and treason. However, in the midst of war, while the balance was still uncertain, fate lends our character an extraordinary chance. In the spring of 1918, in a changed geopolitical context, marked by turmoil and confusion, Stere goes to Chișinău and takes an energetic, pragmatic and efficient stand, struggling to persuade the political groups and the social media that time has come to reunite with Romania. His action is successful and for his crucial contribution to the union of Bessarabia to Romania he will be decorated by King Ferdinand. "This was his moment of triumph",¹² notes a historian. And he was highly worthy of it.

In the aftermath of the war, Stere passes through a critical period. The equivocal attitude displayed during the war shall be always held against him and turned into an indictment. But Stere is far from lowering his flag, the Romanian politics was yet to hear the last of him. As such, he shall decisively contribute to the founding of the Peasants' Party in 1919 and then to its merger with the Romanian National Party later, in 1926. The backbone of the new political formation, the National Peasants' Party, shall be Stere's program, theses and projects, adapted and articulated, in collaboration with the economist Virgil Madgearu, in the doctrine of the "peasant state". Due to the clashes with Iuliu Maniu and other leaders of the National Peasants' Party, he quits the political scene after 1932, publishing, until his death in 1936, a novel sequence *În preajma revoluției* [*On the Eve of the Revolution*], which is a fresco of the epoch, a reconstruction of the social and political arenas and an illustration of his dramatic experiences. At his death, Mihai Rilea wrote that "one of the most remarkable personalities that the Romanian land ever gave birth to", "a unique

¹² Lucian Boia, "Germanophiles". *The Romanian Intellectual Elite in the Years of the First World War*, Bucharest, Humanitas Publishing House, 2010, p. 316.

sociologist in understanding the specific Romanian phenomena” has just gone into eternity”¹³.

The diversity of the evolution and modernization courses

Stere exposed his conception in numerous articles of the epoch’s written media but a more systematic portrayal of his vision is to be found in the studies published in the magazine *Viața românească [Romanian Life]* between 1907-1908 under the title *Social-Democratism or Poporanism?* Stere is an original intuitive thinker, overflowing with ideas and surprising formulations, as we shall further try to show. He explicitly formulates the idea that societies follow *different courses of evolution*, depending on their actual conditions. Here is a synthetic statement of his underlying principle: “The path to social process, to social evolution cannot be identical for all countries and for all peoples on earth. This is a fact”.¹⁴ This idea – and particularly its straightforwardness – shows us that Stere had a strong standpoint on this topic. His thesis, striking us with its theoretical audacity, emerged as a result of the confrontations between the Western political and social theories and the Romanian landscape. Stere’s core idea was that there is a *morphological difference* between the Western and the Eastern societies – as a result of some regional histories, with specific social events and evolutions – not only a chronological differences of the phases covered throughout the modernization process.

As opposed to the Western societies, industrialized, alphabetized, urbanized, with a powerful middle class and a modern institutional system, in a nutshell, developed capitalist societies, some nation-states, others colonial empires, the Eastern societies – Romania being a typical example in many respects – were struggling in these very substantive aspects. They are mostly agricultural, peasant societies, registering delays in the construction of modernity and major economic, technological, institutional etc. frailties. For such societies, “another course” of evolution and modernization opens, different from the ones available to the industrialized societies.

According to Sorin Alexandrescu, in 1990, the Romanian theoreticians and political forces were facing a dilemma: “rapid industrialization and proletarianization of the peasants” *versus* “limited industrialization and reinforcement of the small property”.¹⁵ This bifurcation of solutions is indicative for our topic. The industrialization option was embraced by the liberals as well as by the socialists with Orthodox orientation. The option for the second alternative of evolution belonged to the Poporanists (Stere, Ibrăileanu), as well as to some moderate liberals and conservatories. The Poporanists (that Alexandrescu calls populists) argue in favor of the consolidation of the small agricultural property as an alternative to the large-scale industrialization. The Poporanists fight “at the same time against the oligarchy and the revolutionary Marxism” and support “the

¹³ Mihai Ralea, *C. Stere*, in *Writings*, vol. 5, Bucharest, Minerva Publishing House, 1988, p. 321.

¹⁴ C. Stere, *Social-Democratism or Poporanism?*, ed. cit, p. 76.

¹⁵ Sorin Alexandrescu, *Looking Backwards, Modernity*, Bucharest, Univers Publishing House, 1999, pp. 119-120.

middle rural and urban classes, the local notables in bureaucracy and liberal professions” so as to ensure social stability, internal market and national union.¹⁶

In the light of the above, Stere detects the “coexistence” of some different societies in terms of political organization and development level, acknowledging the structural diversity of societies and of the historical process, phenomenon impossible to grasp and account for in a single theory, through an “abstract formula”. This is the background of Stere’s confrontation with the Marxist theory, oriented towards finding some universal laws of social life and the enforcement of a standard development model. We can see that the stakes of this confrontation are more intricate, engaging the sublayer theoretical plan, i.e. the paradigm of monilinear evolution, prevailing in the 19th century. Stere’s detachment from this paradigm is even more visible when he argues that the actual analysis of societies, in an epoch dominated by the “rapidity and frequency of communications”, when no people is able to isolate itself from external influences, “reveals the absurdity of the belief that a people that felt behind must go through all the development phases of its forerunners”.¹⁷ The “abstract” and allegedly universalist formulas such as the liberalist or Marxist ones, are unable to provide models for the evolution of all societies. Stere’s warnings are still highly vibrant. We may say that Stere falls into “another line” of thinking, one that accepts and legitimates the diversity of the evolution courses of societies. It is worth mentioning that a Romanian thinker in 1900 releases himself from the authority of the well-known principles of classical evolutionism and participates to the creation of a new paradigm of social thinking: “the multi-linear neo-evolutionism”.¹⁸

Stere’s ideas remind us of Gianni Vattimo’s theory on “weak thinking”, proper to post-modernity, which softens the “tough” oppositions of the traditional metaphysics and legitimates the plurality of the forms of thinking and of the “forms of life” and, implicitly, the plurality of the historical evolution courses of societies. Mentioning Vattimo is not a fortuitous act, since the Italian philosopher considers that the postmodern world is characterized, apart from the overrunning of the polar structure of philosophical thinking, by the rejection of the idea that history would have a “unique course”. Postmodernity would be synonymous to the “end of unitary vision” of history, the acceptance of multiple interpretation and of the plurality of evolution lines and coexistent forms of life.¹⁹ Finally, Stere’s ideas may be set in resonance with the distinction recently made by Samuel Huntington between Westernization and modernization. Until recently, the two processes and strategies were almost completely overlapping. Nowadays, as Huntington argues, “modernization is distinct from Westernization and is producing neither a universal civilization in any meaningful sense nor the Westernization of non-Western societies”.²⁰

¹⁶ *Ibidem*, p. 120.

¹⁷ *Ibidem*, p. 76.

¹⁸ Bădescu, Ilie, Baltasiu, Radu, Dungaciu, Dan, *The History of Sociology*, Bucharest, Eminescu Publishing House, 1996, p.11.

¹⁹ Gianni Vattimo, *The End of Modernity*, Constanța, Pontica Publishing House, 1993, p. 185-186.

²⁰ Samuel P. Huntington, *The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order*, Bucharest, Antet Publishing House, 1998, pp 130-137.

The “vagabond” capital and the relation between center and periphery

In a discourse held in the Chamber on December 2nd 1901, Stere analyses the situation of Romanian industry and draws the conclusion that the “great industry” cannot develop *without an internal and an external market*, which can only be conquered through economic superiority (technology, efficiency, quality), desideratum unachievable by then. On this occasion, Stere explains the way in which foreign capital operates in backward countries. It is depicted as a gigantic force, emerged from the metropole, attempting to conquer the peripheral economies, distorting the social development in the backward countries. Stere inserts in his analysis a very suggestive concept, i.e. that of “vagabond” capital, designating a new way of using financial capital, perceived as a huge transnational investment network. Stere identifies here the new expansion mechanism of the Western capitalism, which is to dominate the entire century; but one of the side effects of this new mechanism is the abolition of the objective and subjective conditions that the Orthodox Marxists counted on when forecasting the beginning of the Communist revolution starting with the developed industrialized countries.

Through the idea of vagabond capital, Stere elaborates an articulated theory on the different effects triggered by the “generalization” (or, as we would put it today, “globalization”) of capitalism. The effects on the developed countries and in the weakly-developed ones vary. In addition, according to Stere, two fundamental types of capitalism are created. A first different effect resides in the fact that in the developed countries the number of capitalists grows and the living standard of the proletariat significantly increases (in spite of the drop in social polarization), whereas in the backward countries, dominated by the capital from the developed countries, the impoverishment of the masses extends and the social polarity escalates. According to Stere, we are witnessing a global-scale polarization between countries and the gap is huge:

„In the civilized countries of the West, an immense commercial and finance capital was formed, which I labeled “vagabond capital,” because this capital ransacks the world for a profitable investment, and because its field of operations lies mostly in the economically backward countries...In the countries in which it operates, this capital produces all the gloomy effects of capitalism, without compensating for them by the benefits which it has introduced in the West, because its effect in backward countries resides only in capitalizing incomes, but by no means in capitalizing the mode of production (which it is incapable of organizing there). Due to this fact, all the phenomena of “primitive accumulation” that Marx so forcefully described emerge there, but without a national wealth — which represented the historical justification of this phase in the West — emerging as well; the “vagabond capital” serves as a huge pump siphoning off abroad the wealth thereby accumulated”.²¹

²¹ Stere, *Social-Democratism or Poporanism?*, Galați, Porto-Franco Publishing House, 1996, p 116-117.

It goes without saying that this remarkable text is not a “romantic criticism of capitalism”,²² but rather a lucid analysis of the new realities of capitalism undergoing a globalization process, phenomenon deeply appraised by Stere. There are, accordingly, countries in which “this capital produces all the gloomy effects of capitalism, without compensating for them by the benefits”, benefits that only existed in the Western countries. In the backward countries, the vagabond capital only leads to the “capitalization of incomes” (that it siphons off abroad “as a huge pump”) and “by no means to the capitalization of the mode of production” which remained backward, agrarian, semi-feudal, uncompetitive. Is this not how things have gone in Romania?

In current terms, we may translate Stere’s idea into the assertion that the globalization of capitalism mitigated the social antagonism in the metropole countries but deepened the social polarization in the periphery countries, leading to an extension of the antagonism between periphery and metropole. Stere emphasized the shift in the evolution strategy and direction of capitalism. In order to operate outside the national space, the industrial capital turns into “commercial and finance capital operating abroad”, that is in the backward countries. As such, the capital coming from the developed countries, invested abroad, amplifies in the developed countries the profit of the capital holders and enhances their social surface, fact which positively recoils on the proletariat. The vagabond capital, operating in economically backward countries, “highly increases the wealth and the social power of the capitalist bourgeoisie in its home country”, while increasing the living standard of the proletariat and transforming important segments thereof into a “working, pleased aristocracy”; as a result these “proletariat” categories are no longer interested in a revolutionary effort of reversing capitalism. In the periphery, the vagabond capital produces neither retrofitting, nor the increase of the labor efficiency level. His effects in the periphery are, consequently, ravaging, blocking the evolution of such societies toward a productive, competitive, organic and civilizing capitalism. In the backward countries, the vagabond capital has only destructive effects. The profit extracted from the economic activities is taken by the agents of the foreign capital, which leads to the increase of social polarity and to the growingly enhanced dependency of these countries on the metropolitan capital.

REFERENCES

- Alexandrescu, Sorin, (1999), *Looking Backwards, Modernity*, Bucharest, Univers Publishing House.
- Bădescu, Ilie, Baltasiu, Radu, Dungaciu, Dan, (1996), *The History of Sociology*, Bucharest, Eminescu Publishing House.
- Boia, Lucian, (2010), *Germanophiles. The Romanian Intellectual Elite in the Years of the First World War*, Bucharest, Humanitas Publishing House.
- Călinescu, G., (1941), *The History of Romanian Literature from its origins till present day*, Bucharest, Royal Foundation for Literature and Art.

²² Z. Ornea, *cited works*, p. 212-253.

Gherea, C. Dobrogeanu, (1977), *Neo-Serfdom*, in *Complete Works*, vol. 4, Bucharest, Political Publishing House.

Huntington, P. Samuel, (1998), *The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order*, Bucharest, Antet Publishing House.

Ibrăileanu, G., (1984), *Critical Spirit in Romanian Culture. Notes and Impressions*, Bucharest, Minerva Publishing House.

Ornea, Z., (1972), *Poporanism*, Bucharest, Minerva Publishing House.

Ralea, Mihai, (1988), *Writings*, vol. 5, Bucharest, Minerva Publishing House.

Stere, C., (1979), *Writings*, Edition, introductory study and notes by Z. Ornea, Bucharest, Minerva Publishing House.

Stere, C., (1996), *Social-Democratism or Poporanism?*, Galați, Porto-Franco Publishing House.

Vattimo, Gianni, (1993), *The End of Modernity*, Constanța, Pontica Publishing House.

x.x.x. (1980), *The History of Romanian Philosophy*, vol. II, part I, Bucharest, Academiei RSR Publishing Houses.